

## Original Research Article

# ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS AND HEAVY METALS IN SARDINE FISH FROM KIVUKONI, KUNDUCHI AND BAGAMOYO FISH MARKETS IN TANZANIA

### ABSTRACT

This study has assessed the concentrations of the essential elements Ca, Cu, Fe, Se and Zn as well as the toxic heavy metals Al, As, Cd, Cr, Ni and Pb in samples of sardine fish collected from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets. The collected fish samples were oven dried, grinded to fine powder and compressed to pellets. The pellets obtained were analyzed for both essential elements and toxic heavy metals using Energy Dispersive X- rays Fluorescence Spectroscopy (EDXRF). The mean concentrations of the analyzed elements were compared to the maximum tolerable levels (MTLs) set by international organizations (NAME THEM). The mean concentrations of Ca, Se, Zn, As, Cr, and Cd were MTLs while, the mean concentrations of Cu and Ni were lower than their from all fish markets. The mean concentrations of Al and Fe were higher samples from Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets . The mean below the detection limit (0.50)  $\mu\text{g/g}$  for the spectrometer used in Ca, Fe, Cu, Se, Zn, Al, Cr, Ni, As, and Cd were 130,000 ; 200 ; 30 ; 2.00 ; 0.50 ; 0.50 ; and 2.00  $\mu\text{g/g}$  respectively, according to FAO/WHO COMA 1998 , CFS 2009 , WHO 1985 , COT 2003 and CODEX 2005

Keywords: Aquatic Environments, Energy Dispersive X-rays Fluorescence (EDXR), Sardine Fish, Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Seafood's could be a good source of the essential elements for many African communities especially the coast communities. Contamination of the seafood's and the general aquatic environments by heavy metals is the problem of major concern worldwide [1]. All metallic elements with an atomic number greater than that calcium (40.04) are referred as heavy metals [2]. These include arsenic (As), Cadmium (Cd), Lead (Pb) and Mercury (Hg) which are also of major concern because; they are extremely toxic even at low concentrations [3]. The above elements are brought into the aquatic environments as a result of the natural



activities such as seafloor and bedrock dredging, volcanic eruptions, soil erosion and weathering as well as anthropogenic activities such as agriculture, municipal wastewater discharges, mining, incinerations, domestic discharges and industrial discharges [4]. It is reported that, more than 80% of the world's waste water and more than 95% of the least developed countries wastewater are released into the aquatic environments untreated. The wastewaters ultimately end up in the oceans and seas, thereby, introducing different contaminants into the aquatic environments [5,6]. (SOURCE OF REFERENCE PLEASE

Heavy metals which enter the aquatic environments are taken up by fish (THROUGH WHICH PROCESS) and undergo bioaccumulation in the liver, gills, kidney, intestine and other organs [7, 8]. Since fish are consumed by human beings, heavy metals are eventually consumed by human beings and other organisms at the top of the food chain [1]. heavy metals therefore pose a potential threat to the health of humans and other organisms at the top of the food chain [7]. Heavy metals pollutions can trigger a wide array of health problems such as infertility, miscarriages, cancer, damages to the vital organs such as kidney, brain, central and peripheral nervous system leading to an ultimate death [2,3].(SOURCE)

Various studies indicate that, the accumulations of heavy metals in fish and other marine foods have been increasing steadily in the recent years[9,10,11,12]. In Egypt, concentrations of copper (Cu), Zinc (Zn), Lead (Pb) and cadmium (Cd) in fish samples collected from El – Fayoun province were found to be higher than their maximum tolerable levels (MTLs) set by WHO,2004 [13]. In Kenya, the study was conducted a study to investigate the levels of Lead (Pb), Nickel (Ni), Manganese (Mn), Zinc (Zn), Cadmium (Cd) and Chromium (Cr) in the gills of the tilapia fish and water in the Athi –River by using Atomic Absorption Spectrometry[8]. The study concluded that, the levels of the mentioned heavy metals in both fish and water, were above their respective maximum tolerable levels set by WHO,2004 [8]. In Tanzania, the assessment of the concentrations of heavy metals in the fish samples collected from the downstream and upstream of the north Mara gold mining using Energy Dispersive X- rays Fluorescence (EDXRF) spectrometry[14]. The samples of catfish and lungfish from both sites had higher mean concentrations of sodium (Na), potassium (K), copper (Cu), chromium (Cr) and nickel (Ni) compared to their maximum tolerable levels (MTLs) set by FAO, 1983 and WHO, 1985 [14,15]. Furthermore, a study conducted by Koleleni and Haji [15] to determine the concentrations of heavy metals in the sea port of Zanzibar, reported that, the concentrations of chromium (Cr), Lead (Pb), Nickel (Ni) and Arsenic (As) in the samples of sardine fish collected from the sea port of Zanzibar were higher than their maximum tolerable level set by WHO, 2004 [16]. In the best of my knowledge, there had been no study that had assessed the concentrations of the essential and toxic elements in sardine fish harvested from the Indian Ocean and sold at Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets. The sardine fish are the most landed fish species globally and they could serve as a good source of micronutrients for the coast communities [12]. The aim of this study therefore, to assess the concentrations of both the essential and toxic elements in sardine fish harvested from the Indian Ocean and sold at Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets. The assessment will facilitate the government and the general public with information to evaluate the quality of the sardine fish to the food value and nutritional security to avoid the risk of heavy metals pollution to the coast communities.



## 2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

### 2.1 Description of the Study Area

This study was conducted at Kinondoni and Bagamoyo districts. The Kinondoni and Bagamoyo coast line are located between latitudes and longitudes  $6^{\circ}34'0''$  S,  $39^{\circ}06'0''$  E to  $6^{\circ}51'0''$  S and  $39^{\circ}19'0''$  E, respectively. The selected fish markets are located alongside the Indian Ocean. Kivukoni and Bagamoyo fish markets are near to Dar es Salaam and Bagamoyo harbors respectively, while, Kunduchi fish market is near to Kunduchi Beach Hotel. This coastline has a total population of 5,463,209 inhabitants. The major economic activities along this coastline include manufacturing industries, trade, agriculture, mining, tourism, and fishing [17]. Figure 1 is a description of the study area.



Source: Cartographic unit-University of Dar es Salaam

Fig. 1 Description of the study area

### 2.2 Sample Collection



The samples of sardine fish were bought from the fishermen at Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets. The purchased fish samples were kept in containers made of non-wet table plastic materials. The containers with the fish samples were kept in a refrigerator till the preparation day. Before the containers were used, they were preconditioned by a mineral acid (ultra-pure  $\text{HNO}_3$ ) and rinsed thoroughly with double distilled water. Figure 2 indicates some of the collected fish samples (SAMPLE TECHNIQUE).



**Fig. 2 Pictures of some of the collected fish samples in a closed package**



### 2.3 XRF Sample Preparation

The collected fish samples were washed thoroughly using clean fresh water and oven dried at the temperature of 45°C to 50°C for 48 hours. The samples were thereafter, ground and sieved to obtain fine powders (<50 µm). For each sample, a mass of 4g was mixed with 0.9g of starch (binder). The mixtures of the samples and the binders were homogenized using Fritsch Pulverisette™ (Industriestrasse, 8-55743I dar Okerstein, German) homogenizer. The homogenizer was set at speed of 120 revolutions per second for 10 minutes. After homogenization, the samples were compressed to pellets using Restsch™ (Restch GmbH Retsch-Allee 1-5, 42781Haan, German) pellet presser. A force of 15N was applied to the pellet presser to produce pellets of 32mm outer diameter. Figure 3 indicates one of the pelletized samples produced.



**Fig.3 A pelletized sample**

The samples so produced were properly labeled and taken to the Spectro Xepos™ (Sepetro Analytical Instruments GmbH, Boschstr. 10, 47533 Kleve, German) spectrometer for heavy metals analysis. Figure 4 indicate the picture of the Spectro Xepos™ spectrometer used in this study.



**Fig. 4 The picture of the Spectro Xepos™ spectrometer**

### 2.4 Sample Elemental Analysis

Each pellet was irradiated by x-rays from the x-rays tube so as to produce the characteristic x-rays. The x-ray tube was operated at a maximum power of 50W and a maximum voltage of



50KV. A semiconductor detector (Silicon Lithium) was used to detect and measure the energy of the characteristic x-rays produced. A computer connected to the spectrometer was used to display the spectra of the intensities of the characteristic x-rays against energies of the elements in the sample. The spectrometer was calibrated weekly and set according to manufactures specifications.

Elemental composition of each pellet was computed by the X- Lab Pro<sup>TM</sup> software with Turbo quant (Tq 9232) algorithm. This software, corrected for matrix effects, interference effects and background effects on the basis of fundamental parameter method. The software converts the intensities of the characteristic x-rays into concentrations of the radiating elements according to the equation 1[18]

;

$$C_i = K_i I_i M_a \quad (1)$$

Where,  $C_i$  is the concentration of the radiating element in the sample,  $M_a$  is the matrix correction factor,  $K_i$  is the constant of proportionality and  $I_i$  is the intensity of the fluorescence radiations from element (i).

### 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### 3.1 Minimum Detection Limits (MDL)

Minimum detection limits refers to the minimum concentration of the analyzed elements that can be detected by the instrument (spectrometer). It is the lowest concentration that can be determined to be statistically significant from the analytical blank [19]. The concentration of the analyzed element in the sample is considered to be statistically significant, if the net peak intensity of its characteristic x-rays is at least thrice the standard deviation of the background noise. The minimum detection limits can be very low when the background counts are not significant and vice –versa is true.

The minimum detection limits for the analyzed elements were determined using the X-Lab Pro<sup>TM</sup> software package according to the equation 2; [19].

$$MDL = \frac{3C_i}{I_i - I_b} \sqrt{\frac{I_b}{T_b}} \quad (2)$$

Where,  $C_i$  is the concentration of the analyzed element,  $I_b$  is the intensity of the background counts,  $I_i$  is the intensity of the characteristic x-rays from the analyzed element and  $T_b$  is the time used to measure the background counts. Table 1 indicates the minimum detection limits of the spectrometer for the analyzed elements.



156

157 **Table 1: The MDL (  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) for the analyzed elements**

ATOMIC NUMBER	CHEMICAL SYMBOL	ELEMENT	MDL ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ )
13	Al	Aluminum	35.2
20	Ca	Calcium	6.0
24	Cr	Chromium	5.2
26	Fe	Iron	2.6
28	Ni	Nickel	1.0
29	Cu	Copper	1.4
30	Zn	Zinc	1.0
33	As	Arsenic	0.3
34	Se	Selenium	1.0
48	Cd	Cadmium	3.8
82	Pb	Lead	0.5

158

159

160

### 161 **3.2 Mean concentrations of the essential elements for the sardine fish from**

### 162 **Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo.**

163 The statistical package for social sciences (SPSS – Version 17) software was used  
 164 to compute the mean concentrations of the essential elements for samples from  
 165 each fish market. Tables 2 and 3 indicate the arithmetic means and geometric  
 166 means of the concentrations of the essential elements for each fish market.

167 **Table 2 Arithmetic means of concentrations  $\pm$  standard error of the mean (SEM) ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ )**  
 168 **for the essential elements**

ELEMENTS	FISH MARKETS		
	KIVUKONI (n = 10)	KUNDUCHI (n = 10)	BAGAMOYO (n = 10)
Calcium (Ca)	37981.9 $\pm$ 5558.2	30388.5 $\pm$ 103.9	38310.9 $\pm$ 103.0
Iron (Fe)	149.9 $\pm$ 0.4	211.9 $\pm$ 1.0	234.8 $\pm$ 0.8



Copper (Cu)	4.0 ± 0.1	2.6 ± 0.1	3.5 ± 0.1
Selenium (Se)	1.7 ± 0.0	2.2 ± 0.1	1.9 ± 0.0
Zinc (Zn)	159.8 ± 1.1	105.1 ± 0.6	130.9 ± 0.5

**Table 3 Geometric means of the concentrations  $\times/\div$  standard deviation (SD) ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) for the essential elements**

ELEMENTS	FISH MARKETS		
	KIVUKONI (n = 10)	KUNDUCHI (n = 10)	BAGAMOYO (n = 10)
Calcium (Ca)	25983.0 $\times/\div$ 17576.6	30405.3 $\times/\div$ 328.6	38282.3 $\times/\div$ 328.4
Iron (Fe)	149.8 $\times/\div$ 1.3	34.1 $\times/\div$ 3.3	34.1 $\times/\div$ 2.4
Copper (Cu)	4.0 $\times/\div$ 0.4	2.6 $\times/\div$ 0.2	3.4 $\times/\div$ 0.2
Selenium (Se)	1.7 $\times/\div$ 0.1	2.2 $\times/\div$ 0.2	2.0 $\times/\div$ 0.1
Zinc (Zn)	159.8 $\times/\div$ 3.5	105.3 $\times/\div$ 1.9	131.3 $\times/\div$ 1.5

From the tables, it can be seen that, Calcium is the highest mean concentrations for samples from all fish markets. Iron (Fe) recorded the 2<sup>nd</sup> higher mean concentrations for samples from Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets while Zinc (Zn) recorded the 2<sup>nd</sup> higher mean concentration for samples from Kivukoni fish market. Copper (Cu) recorded the 3<sup>rd</sup> higher (HIGHEST) mean concentrations followed by Selenium (Se) for samples from all fish markets. It can be noted that, the mean concentrations of the essential elements were in the order; Ca > Zn > Fe > Cu > Se > (for samples from Kivukoni fish market), Ca > Fe > Zn > Cu > Se (for samples from Kunduchi fish market) and Ca > Fe > Zn > Cu > Se (for samples from Bagamoyo fish market).

It is reported that, calcium is the 5<sup>th</sup> most abundant element in the earth's crust [20]. It exists in the form of lime stones, calcite, marble, ice land spar, dolomite, stalactite, stalagmite, gypsum and phosphate in the phosphoric rocks which are soluble in water (Xing and Liu 2011). Perhaps the higher mean concentrations of calcium obtained at all sampling areas are due to the fact that, calcium compounds are highly soluble in water and therefore are easily absorbed by the aquatic organisms. Iron is the 4<sup>th</sup> most abundant element in the earth's crust. In most cases, it exists as oxides which are highly insoluble in water (SOURCE) [21]. Concentrations of iron in water bodies due to natural activities are quite low due to its low solubility in water; however, expansions of populations, rapid urbanizations and industrialization lead to various ecological problems in the ecosystems of most water bodies.



197 Significant speciation, concentration and bioavailability of iron in water and sediments occur  
198 as a result of the anthropogenic activities [22]. This suggests that, apart from the natural  
199 activities such as precipitation, dust, as well as weathering of rocks and soils, the higher  
200 mean concentrations of iron recorded for samples from all fish markets, **are (DELETE)** may be due to  
201 industrial discharges, domestic discharges and municipal wastewater treatment plants.

202 Zinc exists naturally in rocks, soil and water and in most cases as zinc sulphide (ZnS). Most  
203 of zinc compounds are water soluble, though; the metal itself is not [23]. The high  
204 concentrations of zinc recorded for samples from all fish markets, might be due to the fact  
205 that, most of zinc compounds are water soluble and hence are easily absorbed by aquatic  
206 organisms. Also natural activities such as weathering and abrasion of rocks as well as  
207 anthropogenic activities such as corrosion of zinc galvanized ships and boats, domestic and  
208 industrial discharges are the factors which might have caused elevated levels of zinc for  
209 samples from all fish markets.

210 The mean concentrations of copper and selenium were lower compared to those of the other  
211 essential elements analyzed in this study. Selenium occurs naturally in rocks; soil and water  
212 although; it's also associated with mining of coal, phosphates, as well as refinery and  
213 combustion of fossil fuels [24]. Also agricultural drain water, sewage slugs, fly of ash from  
214 coal-fired power plants are sources of selenium into the aquatic environments [25]. Industrial  
215 sources of copper into the aquatic environments include; wood production, iron and steel  
216 production, waste incinerations, coal combustion, oil and gasoline combustion. Also  
217 agricultural runoffs and domestic use of fertilizers also contributes to raise the levels of  
218 copper in the aquatic environments [26]. Since there was no evidence of elevated levels of  
219 lead (Pb) which is more associated with fossil fuels, it implies that, the levels of copper and  
220 selenium recorded at all fish markets, are not related to refinery and combustion of fossil  
221 fuels; rather, they might be related to sewage slugs, agricultural drain water, industrial  
222 discharges, domestic discharges and natural activities.

223 Furthermore, the results of this study indicate that, sardine fish from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and  
224 Bagamoyo fish markets are rich in essential elements Ca, Fe, Cu, Se and Zn. This implies  
225 that, they can be used as a good source of the essential elements for the coast communities,  
226 provided that; they are prevented from being polluted by heavy metals. Calcium is essential  
227 in muscle contraction, acolyte activation, building of strong bones and teeth, blood clotting,  
228 nerve impulse transmission, heart beat regulation and fluid balance within cells [20]. Iron is  
229 essential for almost all living organisms as it takes part in a wide range of metabolic  
230 processes such as oxygen transport, deoxyribonucleic acid (DNA) synthesis and electron  
231 transport. Iron can however form free radicals, thus; its concentration in blood must be in  
232 proper levels because, excessive amounts of iron can damage the tissues [21].

233 Zinc is an essential mineral for normal fetal growth and development as well as milk  
234 production during lactation [27]. Zinc deficiency triggers an array of health problems in  
235 children, many of which become chronic, such as weight loss, stunted growth, weakened  
236 resistance to infections and early deaths. In fact, zinc deficiency is linked to about 116,000  
237 child deaths every year(SOURCE) [11]. Selenium is a major component of many enzymes and it plays  
238 important roles in anti oxidation, reproduction, muscle function and tumors prevention [28].



The analysis of the variances of the means (Turkey HSD) indicate that, samples from Kivukoni fish market had significantly higher ( $p < 0.05$ ) mean concentrations of Ca, Cu, and Zn when compared to samples from Kunduchi fish market while samples from Bagamoyo fish market had significantly higher ( $p < 0.05$ ) mean concentrations of Ca and Cu when compared to samples from Kunduchi fish market. On the hand, samples from Kunduchi fish market had significantly higher ( $p < 0.05$ ) mean concentration of Se when compared to samples from Kivukoni and Bagamoyo fish markets. Since, there are many human activities around Kivukoni and Bagamoyo fish markets compared to Kunduchi fish market, these variations suggest that, apart from natural activities, human activities plays a significant role to rise the levels of Ca, Cu and Zn among the sampling markets. Furthermore, variations of the mean concentrations of the essential elements might indicate that, sardine fish sold at the three fish markets have different feeding areas and hence different diets.

### 3.3 Mean Concentrations of the Toxic Heavy Metals for the Three Fish Markets

The statistical package for social sciences (SPSS - Version 17) software was used to compute the mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals for samples from each fish market. Tables 4 and 5 indicate the arithmetic means and geometric means of the concentrations of the toxic heavy metals for samples from each fish market.

**Table 4 Arithmetic means of concentrations  $\pm$  standard error of the mean (SEM) ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) for the toxic heavy metals**

ELEMENTS	FISH MARKETS		
	KIVUKONI (n = 10)	KUNDUCHI (n = 10)	BAGAMOYO (n = 10)
Aluminum (Al)	52.8 $\pm$ 3.6	105.4 $\pm$ 4.5	129.3 $\pm$ 6.7
Chromium (Cr)	2.0 $\pm$ 0.2	21.7 $\pm$ 0.4	27.2 $\pm$ 1.0
Nickel (Ni)	0.9 $\pm$ 0.1	0.3 $\pm$ 0.0	0.8 $\pm$ 0.1
Arsenic (As)	3.8 $\pm$ 0.1	7.2 $\pm$ 0.0	5.39 $\pm$ 0.1
Cadmium (Cd)	0.6 $\pm$ 0.1	2.6 $\pm$ 0.1	0.7 $\pm$ 0.7
Lead (Pb)	BDL	BDL	BDL

BDL for Pb = 0.50  $\mu\text{g/g}$



**Table 5 Geometric means of the concentrations  $\times/\div$  standard deviation (SD) ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) for the toxic heavy metals**

ELEMENTS	FISH MARKETS		
	KIVUKONI (n = 10)	KUNDUCHI (n = 10)	BAGAMOYO (n = 10)
Aluminum (Al)	51.2 $\times/\div$ 11.4	102.7 $\times/\div$ 14.3	130.0 $\times/\div$ 21.3
Chromium (Cr)	2.1 $\times/\div$ 0.4	22.0 $\times/\div$ 1.4	27.3 $\times/\div$ 3.1
Nickel (Ni)	0.9 $\times/\div$ 0.2	0.3 $\times/\div$ 0.7	0.7 $\times/\div$ 0.3
Arsenic (As)	3.8 $\times/\div$ 0.6	7.2 $\times/\div$ 0.1	5.3 $\times/\div$ 0.2
Cadmium (Cd)	0.6 $\times/\div$ 1.0	2.6 $\times/\div$ 0.1	0.7 $\times/\div$ 0.2
Lead (Pb)	BDL	BDL	BDL

BDL for Pb = 0.50  $\mu\text{g/g}$

From the table 5, it can be seen that, aluminum recorded the highest mean concentration followed by arsenic for samples from all sampling areas. The mean concentrations of aluminum were ( $52.8 \pm 33.6$ ;  $105.4 \pm 4.5$  and  $129.3 \pm 6.7$ )  $\mu\text{g/g}$  for samples from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets respectively. Aluminium is the third most abundant element in the earth's crust and it occurs naturally in rocks, soil and water. It is not essential for life; however, aluminium compounds are widely used in various industrial applications or consumer products such as antacids, food additives and antiperspirants [29]. Apart from natural activities in rocks and soils, the high levels of aluminium for samples from all fish markets, might be related to coagulants used in water treatment process and drugs (medicines) such as antacids or antiperspirants which are brought to the ocean by rain water, municipal wastewater treatment plants as well as industrial and domestic discharges.

The mean concentrations of arsenic were ( $3.8 \pm 0.1$ ;  $7.2 \pm 0.0$  and  $5.3 \pm 0.1$ )  $\mu\text{g/g}$  for samples from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets respectively. It is reported that, arsenic concentrations are normally higher in marine fish compared to fresh water fish [30]. Arsenic in fish muscles is mainly found in organic form, which is less toxic compared to inorganic arsenic [31]. Chromium recorded the 3<sup>rd</sup> higher concentrations after aluminium and arsenic. The mean concentrations of chromium were ( $2.0 \pm 0.2$ ;  $21.8 \pm 0.4$  and  $27.2 \pm 1.0$ )  $\mu\text{g/g}$  for samples from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets respectively. Rarely chromium occurs naturally in the earth's crust as an element (metal), but, in most cases it occurs in compound forms or ions in water [32]. Many chromium compounds are used in painting pigments. Almost all chemical laboratories (academic, research, industry) discharge considerable amounts of chromium into the environment every day (SOURCE) [33]. This suggests that, natural activities and industrial discharges are the main sources of chromium for samples from all fish markets.

Cadmium recorded lower means concentrations for samples from all fish markets, compared to aluminium, arsenic and chromium. The mean concentrations of cadmium were ( $0.6 \pm 0.0$ ;  $2.6 \pm 0.1$  and  $0.7 \pm 0.7$ )  $\mu\text{g/g}$  for Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo respectively. Cadmium occurs naturally in the earth's crust. It is vastly used in batteries, coating, plating and various industrial applications [34]. Cadmium from various industrial applications enters into air and binds with small particles which combine with water and soil, thereby, causing contamination of fish, animals and plants. Spills from hazardous waste sites and improper wastes disposal can cause cadmium leakages into the aquatic environments [35]. On the other hand, the



mean concentrations of lead were below the detection limits of the spectrometer used in this study for samples from all fish markets. The minimum detection limit of the spectrometer was 0.50µg/g for lead. The mean concentrations of mercury were not included in this analysis due to the fact that, EDXRF is not suitable for determination of concentrations of mercury.

Analysis of the variances of the means (Turkey HSD) for the toxic heavy metals indicate that, samples from Bagamoyo fish market had significantly higher ( $p < 0.05$ ) mean concentrations of Al, As, Cd and Ni when compared to samples from Kivukoni. The samples from Kunduchi fish market had significantly higher ( $p < 0.05$ ) mean concentration of Al, As and Cd when compared to samples from Kivukoni fish market. On the other hand, samples from Kivukoni fish market had significantly higher ( $p < 0.05$ ) mean concentration of Ni when compared to samples from the other fish markets. Since Bagamoyo and Kunduchi fish markets are more close to human settlements compared to Kivukoni fish market, this suggests that, large percentages of the toxic heavy metals Al, As and Cd originates from domestic discharges and agricultural drain waters.

### 3.4 Correlations Analysis for the Toxic Heavy Metals

Spearman correlation tests were carried out to determine the nature, magnitude and directions of correlations among the toxic heavy metals. At Kivukoni fish market, a strong and a statistically significant correlation was recorded between arsenic and nickel ( $r = 0.63$ ;  $p = 0.05$ ). This correlation suggests that, arsenic and nickel originates from similar sources, probably municipal wastewater treatment plants, domestic and industrial discharges. Also, at this fish market, a moderately positive but not a statistically significant correlation was recorded between arsenic and chromium ( $r = 0.37$ ;  $p = 0.30$ ). This correlation suggests that, arsenic and chromium for samples from this fish market, originates from sources with weak similarities. Probably, large or less amounts of arsenic could originate from agricultural and domestic discharges while large or less amounts of chromium could originate from industrial discharges. Also some of these heavy metals might be brought to the ocean by inorganic and, or organic matters brought to the ocean by rain water and surface road run offs.

### 3.5 Correlations Analysis for the Essential Elements

Spearman correlation tests were carried out to determine the nature, magnitude and directions of correlations among the essential elements. At Kunduchi fish market, strong, positive but not statistically significant correlations were recorded between calcium and zinc ( $r = 0.56$ ;  $p = 0.095$ ) and between copper and zinc ( $r = 0.59$ ;  $p = 0.072$ ). At Kivukoni fish market, moderately positive but not statistically significant correlations were recorded between copper and iron ( $r = 0.33$ ;  $p = 0.33$ ) and between copper and zinc ( $r = 0.44$ ;  $p = 0.19$ ). Furthermore, at Bagamoyo fish market, moderately positive but not statistically significant correlations were recorded between calcium and selenium ( $r = 0.32$ ;  $p = 0.36$ ) and between calcium and zinc ( $r = 0.38$ ;  $p = 0.28$ ). These correlations suggests that, these essential elements do not originate from common sources, rather, they originate from diversified sources, each source contributing more or less to the levels of the essential elements. These sources could include natural activities such as seafloor and bedrock dredging, soil erosions, weathering and rocks disintegrations. Also some essential elements could be related to organic matters brought to the ocean by agricultural drain water; surface road run offs and rain water.



### 3.6 Comparison of the mean Concentrations of the Essential Elements to the Maximum Tolerable Levels (MTLs) Sets by International Organizations

Essential element can have adverse health effects when they exceed the required levels in the body [21,36]. The table 6 indicates the mean concentrations of the essential elements with their respective (MTLs) set by international organizations.

**Table 6 Mean concentrations of the essential elements with their (MTLs) set by international organizations**

FISH MARKETS	CHEMICAL SYMBOL	ATOMIC NUMBER	ELEMENT	MEAN CONC. (µg/g)	MTLs (µg/g)	REFFERENCES
KIVUKONI	Ca	20	Calcium	37,981.88	130,000	[37]
	Fe	26	Iron	149.99	200	[38]
	Cu	29	Copper	4.02	30	[39]
	Zn	30	Zinc	159.84	40	[39]
	Se	34	Selenium	1.73	0.75	[40]
KUNDUCHI	Ca	20	Calcium	303,800.50	130,000	[37]
	Fe	26	Iron	211.91	200	[38]
	Cu	29	Copper	2.57	30	[39]
	Zn	30	Zinc	105.06	40	[39]
	Se	34	Selenium	2.19	0.75	[40]
BAGAMOYO	Ca	20	Calcium	38,310.85	130,000	[37]
	Fe	26	Iron	234.78	200	[38]
	Cu	29	Copper	3.45	30	[39]
	Zn	30	Zinc	130.96	40	[39]
	Se	34	Selenium	1.96	0.75	[40]

From the table above, it can be seen that, the mean concentrations of zinc and selenium are higher than their respective (MTLs) set by various international organizations. The mean concentrations of zinc for samples from all fish markets are at least 3 times higher than the recommended MTL for zinc (40µg/g) according to FAO, [39]. The mean concentration of selenium is 2times higher than its MTL (0.75µg/g) according to COMA, [40]. On the other hand, the mean concentrations of iron for samples from Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets are just above their respective MTL (200µg/g) according to FAO/WHO, [39]. The mean concentrations of iron for samples from Kivukoni fish market are just below its MTL of 200µg/g according to FAO/WHO, [38]. The implication of these findings is that, diets must be properly controlled due to the fact that, excessive amounts of essential elements can have adverse health effects.



### 3.7 Comparison of the mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals to the maximum tolerable levels (MTLs) sets by international organizations

Bearing in mind a wide array of adverse health effects that can arise from heavy metals pollution, this study has compared the mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals to MTLs set by international organizations. Table 7 shows the mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals with their respective MTLs set by international organizations.

**Table 7 Mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals with their (MTLs) set by international organizations**

FISH MARKETS	CHEMICAL SYMBOL	ATOMIC NUMBER	ELEMENT	MEAN CONC. (µg/g)	MTLs (µg/g)	REFFERENCES
KIVUKONI	Al	13	Aluminum	52.75	100	[41]
	Cr	24	Chromium	2.09	0.15	[15]
	Ni	28	Nickel	0.90	2.00	[42]
	As	33	Arsenic	3.79	0.50	[36]
	Cd	48	Cadmium	0.58	0.5	[36]
	Pb	82	Lead	BDL	2.00	[43]
KUNDUCHI	Al	13	Aluminium	105.37	100	[41]
	Cr	24	Chromium	21.71	0.15	[15]
	Ni	28	Nickel	0.27	2.00	[42]
	As	33	Arsenic	7.22	0.50	[36]
	Cd	48	Cadmium	2.64	0.50	[36]
	Pb	82	Lead	BDL	2.00	[43]
BAGAMOYO	Al	13	Aluminium	129.33	100	[41]
	Cr	24	Chromium	27.15	0.15	[15]
	Ni	28	Nickel	0.84	2.00	[42]
	As	33	Arsenic	5.29	0.50	[36]
	Cd	48	Cadmium	0.70	0.50	[36]
	Pb	82	Lead	BDL	2.00	[43]

BDL for Pb = 0.50 µg/g

From the table 7, one can see that, the mean concentrations of arsenic and cadmium are higher than their respective MTL of (0.50µg/g) according to [37] for samples from all fish markets. The mean concentrations of arsenic are more at least 7times greater than their



378 respective MTL for samples from all fish markets. The mean concentrations of cadmium are  
 379 5times greater than their MTL for samples from Kunduchi fish market and are just above  
 380 their MTL for samples from Kivukoni and Bagamoyo fish markets. The mean concentrations  
 381 of aluminium for samples from Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets are just above their  
 382 MTL, while, the mean concentration of aluminium for samples from Kivukoni fish market are  
 383 below their MTL of (100µg/g) according to [41]. Inorganic arsenic is very toxic even in low  
 384 concentrations. At higher concentrations it can cause infertility, heart disruptions, brain  
 385 damage and ultimate death. Actually inorganic arsenic is classified as a human carcinogen  
 386 [3]. Aluminium is a toxic heavy metal with no beneficial effects in the human body. When  
 387 ingested, it stays in the body with a biological half life of 50 years. Furthermore, cadmium is  
 388 classified as a human carcinogen [18,34]. When ingested, cadmium is efficiently retained in  
 389 the kidney and liver with a biological half life of 30 years [18].

390 These findings suggest that, a further detailed research is needed to determine the factors  
 391 which caused elevated levels of arsenic; cadmium and aluminium for samples from these  
 392 fish markets and how to prevent pollutions of the sea foods by heavy metals in order avoid  
 393 the adverse health effects to consumers of sea foods.

### 394 3.8 Comparison of the mean concentrations of the analyzed elements from different 395 parts of the world

396 The mean concentrations of the elements analyzed in this study were compared to the mean  
 397 concentrations of the same elements in samples of sardine fish collected from the different  
 398 parts of the world. Table 8 shows the summary of this comparison.

399 **Table 8 Comparisons of the mean concentrations (mg/kg) of the analyzed elements**  
 400 **from different parts of the world**

SAMPLIN G AREA	ANALYZED ELEMENTS											REFFEREN CE
	Al	Ca	Cr	Fe	Ni	Cu	Zn	As	Se	Cd	Pb	
KIVUKON I	52.75	37,981. 88	2.01	149.9 9	0.92	4.02	159.8 4	3.7 9	1.7 3	0.58	BD L	This study
KUNDUC HI	105.3 7	3038.45	21.7 1	211.7 1	0.27	2.57	105.0 6	7.2 0	2.1 9	2.64	BD L	This study
BAGAMO YO	129.3 3	3831.85	27.1 5	234.7 8	0.84	3.45	130.9 6	5.2 9	1.9 6	0.70	BD L	This study
ZANZIBA R PORT	-	-	22.3 0	311.9 0	86.8 0	6.6	-	-	-	BDL	1.7 0	[19]
ABUJA	-	-	-	3.99	-	0.31 1	1.89	-	-	-	BD L	[44]



FUKUSHI MA	-	-	0.60	-	0.1	9.6	130	7.5	6.6	0.01	-	[31]
EGYPT	-	-	0.22	-	-	-	2.37	-	-	0.04 8	-	[45]
TURKEY	-	-	22.1 6	-	-	23.2 7	-	-	0.0 1	-	0.2 0	[46]

401 BDL for Pb = 0.50 µg/g





As for the toxic heavy metals, it can be seen from the above table that, the mean concentrations of cadmium (Cd) for samples from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets are higher than the values reported in the literatures reviewed in this study. Furthermore, samples from Bagamoyo fish market had higher mean concentration of chromium (Cr) compared to the values reported in different literatures reviewed in this study. In general, the comparisons of the mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals were in the order;

Cr: Bagamoyo > Zanzibar port > Kunduchi > Kivukoni > Fukushima > Egypt  
 As: Fukushima > Kunduchi > Bagamoyo > Kivukoni  
 Ni: Zanzibar port > Kivukoni > Bagamoyo > Kunduchi > Fukushima  
 Cd: Kunduchi > Bagamoyo > Kivukoni > (Turkey and Fukushima) > Egypt

The toxic heavy metal (Pb) have not been involved in this comparison because, its concentrations were below the detection limits of the spectrometer used in this study. On the other hand, the mean concentrations of aluminium (Al) were not reported in the literatures reviewed in this study.

As for the essential elements, it can be seen from the table above that, samples from Kivukoni fish market had higher mean concentrations of zinc compared to the values reported in the literatures reviewed in this study. Generally, the mean concentrations of the essential elements were in the order:

Fe: Zanzibar port > Bagamoyo > Kunduchi > Kivukoni > Abuja > Turkey  
 Zn: Kivukoni > Bagamoyo > Fukushima > Kunduchi > Turkey > Egypt > Abuja  
 Se: Fukushima > Kunduchi > Bagamoyo > Kivukoni  
 The essential element (Ca) was not reported in the literatures reviewed in this study and hence was not covered in this comparison.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

This study has assessed the concentrations of the essential elements (Ca, Cu, Fe, Se and Zn) as well as the toxic heavy metals (Al, As, Cd, Cr, Ni and Pb) in samples of sardine fish collected from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets. The mean concentrations of the analyzed elements were compared to their respective maximum tolerable levels (MTLs) set by international organizations. The mean concentrations of the essential elements (Ca and Cu) were found to be lower than their respective MTLs while the mean concentrations of Zn were higher than their MTLs for samples from all fish markets. The mean concentrations of Fe and Se were higher than their respective MTLs for samples from Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets. The respective MTLs for these essential elements were; 130,000 µg/g (for Ca), 200 µg/g (for Fe), 30 µg/g (for Cu), 0.75 µg/g (for Se), and 40 µg/g (for Zn) according to FAO/WHO [38], WHO [15], COMA [40] and FAO/WHO [37]

Zinc (Zn) and Selenium (Se) occurs naturally in rocks, soil and water due to natural activities such as weathering and abrasion of rocks [23,35]. Most zinc compounds are soluble in water, though, the metal itself is not [23]. The elevated levels of zinc recorded for samples from all fish markets may be due to the fact that, most of zinc compounds are soluble in water and hence, are easily ingested by marine organisms. Also elevated levels of zinc may be associated to anthropogenic activities such as corrosions of zinc galvanized ships and boats, painting of ships and boats, improper dumping of zinc containing compounds such as fertilizers and batteries as well as domestic and industrial discharges.



Selenium occurs naturally due to erosion of rocks containing salinities and serenades which are associated with sulphide minerals. Its abundance in the earth's crust is very low, estimated as 0.05µg/kg to 0.1µg/kg [48]. Since, the abundance of selenium in the earth's crust is very low, large percentages of selenium are brought to the ocean by glaciations, floods, agricultural drain waters, industrial discharges and domestic discharges.

The mean concentrations of the toxic heavy metals arsenic and cadmium for samples from all fish markets were found to be higher than their respective MTL of 0.50µg/g[36]. Arsenic in marine fish is normally in higher concentrations than in fresh water fish. Arsenic in fish is mostly found in organic form which is less toxic compared to inorganic arsenic [31]. Combinations of natural activities such as weathering, volcanic eruptions and biological activities are the main sources of arsenic into the aquatic environments [49]. Also arsenic is brought into the aquatic environments by floods, domestic and industrial sewages and from human activities such as mining, agriculture (use of arsenic based pesticides) and improper dumping of arsenic based compounds [49]. Cadmium is widely used in batteries, coating, and plating [33]. Cadmium levels in the aquatic environments are raised mainly due spills from hazardous waste sites and industrial discharges [34].

The mean concentration of aluminium for samples from Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets were found to be higher than its respective MTL of 100µg/g according to CFS 2009. Aluminium is the third most abundant element in the earth's crust and it occurs naturally in rocks, soil and water. Apart from natural activities, aluminium is brought into the aquatic environments by surface road run offs, domestic and industrial discharges carrying chemicals such as antacids or antiperspirants and coagulants used in water treatment processes [29]. On the other hand, the concentrations lead was found to be below the detection limits of 0.50µg/g for the spectrometer used in this study.

It can be fairly concluded that, sardine fish from Kivukoni, Kunduchi and Bagamoyo fish markets are rich in essential elements Ca, Cu, Fe, Se and Zn. The sardine fish therefore can contribute significantly to the food and nutritional security of the coast inhabitants provided that, measures are taken to prevent them from being polluted by heavy metals.

476  
477

## 478 REFERENCES

479

480 1. Mbutia JW, Ogendi GM, Moturi WN, Koskey JC and Maina GM 2014 Heavy  
481 Metals Concentrations in Tissues of Commercially Exploited Fish (Oereochromis  
482 Niloticus Baringoensis, Aethiopicus, and Clarias Gariepinus) from lake Baringo Kenya.  
483 *Journal of Enviromental Science Taxicology and Food Technology* **8**: 55 – 63

484 2. Duruibe JO, Ogwuegbu MOC and Egwugw JN 2007 Heavy metals pollution and human  
485 bio toxic effects. *International Journal of physical sciences* **2(5)**:112-118

486 3. Jarup L 2003 Hazards of heavy metals contamination. *British Medical Bulletin* **68**: 167 -  
487 182



- 488 4. Arif Tasleem Jan, Mudsser Azam, Kehkashan Siddiqui, Arif Ali, Inho Choi and Qazi Mohd  
489 Rizwanul Hag 2015 Heavy Metals and Human Health: Mechanistic Insight into Toxicity  
490 and Counter Defense System of Antioxidants. *Molecular Sciences* **16**: 29592 - 29630
  
- 491 5. Martin L 1995 Pesticides and Metals in Lake Jipe, N. Tanzania. *Enviromentalica* **9**: 33 –  
492 38
  
- 493 6. Machiwa JF 2010 Coastal Marine Pollution in Dar es Salaam (Tanzania) relative to  
494 Recommended Environmental Quality Targets for Western Indian Ocean. *WIOMSA* **9**:  
495 17 - 30
  
- 496 7. Al –Weher SM 2008 Levels of heavy Metals Cd, Cu, and Zn in three Fish species  
497 collected from the north Jordan Valley. *Jordan Journal of biological sciences* **1**: 4-46
  
- 498 8. Muiruri JM, Nyambaka HN and Nawiri MP 2013 Heavy metals in water and tilapia fish  
499 from Athi – Galana – Sabaki tributaries, Kenya. *International food research journal* **20 (2)**:  
500 891- 896
  
- 501 9. Falah S. Al- Fartusie, Saja N. Mohssan 2017 Essential Trace Elements and Their Vital  
502 Roles in Human Body, *Indian Journal of Advances in Chemical Sciences* **5(3)**: 127 – 136
  
- 503 10. Haldimann M Alt A, Blank A and Blondeau 2004 Iodine contents of food groups Journal  
504 of food composition and analysis **18**: 461 – 471
  
- 505 11. Frank T. Wieringa, Marjoleine A. Dijkhuizen, Marion Fiorentino, Arnauld Laillou  
506 and Jacques Berger 2015 Determination of zinc status in humans: Which  
507 indicator should we use? *Nutrients* **7**: 3252 - 3263
  
- 508 12. Moeniba Isaacs 2016 The humble sardines (small pelagic): Fish as food or fodder.  
509 Agriculture and food security **5**: 2 - 14
  
- 510 13. Ali M.H.H and Amaal M.A 2005 “Studies of some heavy metals in water, sediments, fish  
511 and fish farms in El- Fayoum Province, Egypt” *Egyptian Journal of Aquatic Research*  
512 **31(2)**: 261 - 273
  
- 513 14. Ntarisa AV 2013 Assessment of the Impact of North Mara Gold Mine Activities on Heavy  
514 Metals Concentrations in River Mara Fish Using EDXRF Spectrometry, Msc thesis,  
515 Physics Department, University of Dar es Salaam
  
- 516 15. WHO (World Health Organization) 1985 “Guidelines for drinking water quality” 3 Geneva,  
517 Switzerland
  
- 518 16. Koleleni Y A and Haji O 2014 Determination of the Concentration of Heavy Metals in  
519 Fish From Sea Port of Zanzibar by Energy Dispersive X-ray Fluorescence (EDXRF).  
520 *Tanzania Journal of Sciences* **(40)**: 80-89



- 521 17. National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) and Regional Commissioners Office 2014 Dar es  
522 Salaam region social – economic profile, Author, Dar es Salaam.
- 523 18. Lugendo I, Mohammed NK, Mussa LM and Spyrou NM 2012 Assessment of the Lake  
524 Gendambi Salt for Trace Elements and Toxic Heavy Metals by Energy Dispersive X-  
525 rays Fluorescence Spectrometry. *Radio analytical and Nuclear Chemistry* **294(3)**: 9 -  
526 12
- 527 19. Koleleni Y I and Haji O 2016 Analysis of Heavy Metals in the Shellfish from the  
528 Neighborhoods of the Sea Port of Zanzibar. *Merit Research Journals* **4(3)**: 016 - 024
- 529 20. Pravina Piste, Didwagh Sayaji and Mokashi Avinash 2015 Calcium and its role in human  
530 body. *International Journal of research in pharmaceutical and biosciences* **4(2)**: 659 -  
531 668
- 532 21. Abbaspour Nazanin, Richard Hurrell and Royal Kelishadi 2014 Review on Iron and its  
533 importance for human health. *Journal of Research in Medical Science* **19(2)**: 164 -  
534 174
- 535 22. Xing Wei and Guihua Liu 2011 Iron Biochemistry and its Environmental Impacts in  
536 Freshwater Lakes, *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **20**: 1339 - 1345
- 537 23. Brita T.A Muyssen, Krel A.C De Schamphalaere, Colin R. Janssen 2006 Mechanism of  
538 chronic waterborne Zn toxicity in *Daphnia magna*. *Aquatic Toxicology* **77**: 393 - 401
- 539 24. Steven J. Hamilton 2004 Review of selenium toxicity in the aquatic food chain. *Science*  
540 *of the Total Environment* **326**: 1 - 31
- 541 25. Chapman PM, Adams WJ, Brook Mh, Delos CG, Luona SN, Maher WA, Ohlendorf HM,  
542 Presser TS, Shaw DP 2009 Ecological assessment of selenium in the aquatic  
543 environment : Summary of a SETAC Pellston Workshop. Pensacola FL (USA) : Society  
544 of Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry (SETAC)
- 545 26. Ben E. Willis and West M. Bishop 2016 Understand Fate and Effects of Copper  
546 Pesticides in Aquatic Systems. *Journal of Geosciences and Environmental Protection* **4**:  
547 37 - 42
- 548 27. Maria J Salgueiro, BS Marcella, B Zubillaga, PhD, Alexis E Lysionek, BS, Ricardo A  
549 caro, PhD, Ricardo Weill Eug and Jose R Boccio, PhD, 2002 The Role of Zinc in the  
550 Growth and Development of Children. *Nutrition* **18**: 510 - 519
- 551 28. Youcef Mehdi, Jean – Luc Hornick, Lous Istasse and Isabelle Dufrasne 2013 Selenium  
552 in the Environment, Metabolism and Involvement in Body Functions. *Molecules* **18**:  
553 3292 - 3311



- 554 29. Masahiro Kawahara, Keiko Konoha, Tetusya Nagata and Yutaka Sadakane 2007  
555 Aluminum and Human Health: Its intake, bioavailability and neurotoxicity. *Biomedical*  
556 *Research of Trace Elements* **18(3)**: 211 - 220
- 557 30. Schaeffer R, A.K Francesconi, N. Kienzi, C. Soeroes, P.Fodor, L. Varadi, R. Raml, W.  
558 Goessler and D Kuchnelt 2006 Arsenic speciation in fresh water organisms from the  
559 Danube in Hungary. *Talanta* **69**: 856 - 865
- 560 31. Daisuke Hayase, Sewako Horai, Tomohiko Isobe, Todd William Miller, Shin Takahashi,  
561 Koji Omari and Shinsuke Tanabe 2009 Monitoring Trace Elements in Coastal Waters  
562 Using Sardine as Bio indicator. *Interdisciplinary Studies on Environmental Chemistry –*  
563 *Environmental Research in Asia* **2**: 167 - 175
- 564 32. Krejpcio Z 2001 Essentiality of Chromium for Human Nutrition and Health *Polish Journal*  
565 *of Environmental Studies* **10**: 399 - 304
- 566 33. Saha Rumpa, Rumki Nandi and Bidyut Saha 2011 Sources and Toxicity of Hexavalent  
567 Chromium, *Journal of coordination chemistry* **64**: 1782 – 1806
- 568 34. Honey Sharma, Neetu Rawal and Blessy Baby Mathew 2015 The characteristics, toxicity  
569 and effects of cadmium. *Research Gate* **2**:11 - 17
- 570 35. Tomasz Olszowsk, Irene Baranowsk Bosiak, Izabela Gutowska and Dariusz Chlubek  
571 2012 Pro – inflammatory properties of cadmium, *Biochemical Polonica* **59**: 475 - 482
- 572 36. Laura M, Lather R and Hajo H 2010 The Essential Toxin: Impact of Zinc on Human  
573 Health. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* **7**: 1342 -  
574 1365
- 575 37. FAO/WHO 2002 Human Vitamin and Mineral Requirements, *Report of joint FAO/WHO*  
576 *expert consultation, FAO, Rome*.
- 577 38. FAO/WHO 1983 Compilation of legal limits for hazardous substances in fish and fishery  
578 products, FAO Fishery Circular **464**, 5 - 10
- 579 39. FAO/WHO.1984 Contaminants. In Codex Alimentarius, Vol. XVII, Edition , FAO/WHO.  
580 Contaminants.Codex Alimentarius Commission, Rome;.
- 581 40. COMA 1998 Statement from the Committee on Medical Aspects of Food and Nutrition  
582 Policy on Selenium, *Food Safety Information Bulletin no.39 MAFF: DH 1998*
- 583 41. Center for food safety (CFS) 2009 Guidelines on the use of aluminum containing food,  
584 Food and Environmental Hygiene Department, The Government Logistics Department,  
585 Hong Kong



- 586 42. COT secretariat 2003 Nickel leaching from kettle elements into boiled water. Committee  
587 on toxicity of chemicals in food consumer products and environment <http://www.cot>. Food  
588 grades. Gov. UK, Accessed on 19 August 2017
- 589 43. Codex Alimentarius Commission 2006 Codex standard: Standard for food grade salt.  
590 CXSTAN 150 – Amend 3 – 2006. Codex Alimentarius Commission, Joint FAO/WHO Food  
591 standard Program, Rome
- 592 44. Igwemmar N.C, S.A Kolawole, S.O Odunoku 2013 Heavy Metals Concentration in Fish  
593 Species Sold in Gwagwalada Market, Abuja. *International Journal of Sciences and*  
594 *Research* **2(11)**: 7 - 9
- 595 45. Alaa Eldin MA Morshdy, Abd – El Salam E Hafez, Wageh Sobhy Darwish and Ahmed E  
596 Tharwat 2013 Heavy Metal Residuals in Canned Fishes in Egypt. *The Japanese Journal*  
597 *of Veterinary Research* **61**: 4 – 7
- 598 46. Suhendan Mol 2010 Levels of Heavy Metals in Canned Bonito Sardines and Mackerel,  
599 Produced in Turkey. *Biological Trace Elements Research* **143(2)**: 74 - 82
- 600 47. Guilherme Lopes, Fabricio William Avila, Luiz Roberto Guimaraes Guilherme 2017  
601 Selenium behavior in the soil environment and its implication for human health. *Cienciae*  
602 *Agrotecnologia*. **41(6)**: 605 - 615
- 603 48. Mahimairaja S, Bolan NS, Adriano DC and Robinson B 2005 Arsenic contamination and  
604 its risk management in complex environmental settings. *Advances in agronomy* **86**: 1 -  
605 65
- 606 49. Brett R, Brent C, Nanth SB, Santiago M, Marc G, Christopher M, Monica M, Carlo VD  
607 and Georgina M 2004 Arsenic in the New Zealand, *Environment Super Soil*: **1**: 1 – 8

608