



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name: | Physical Science International Journal |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_PSIJ_44683 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Plasmas Computed with ATMED CR of the 4 th Non-LTE Code Comparison Workshop Database |
| New title: | Plasmas Computed with ATMED CR of the 4th Non Local Thermodynamic Equilibrium Code Comparison Workshop Database |
| Type of Article: | Original research article |

PART 2:

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any) | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments |
|---|---|
| <p>I am pleased to see the revisions following the suggested edits. However, as I re-read the final version, there are three further, required sets of edits:</p> <p>(1) Please proofread the manuscript, specifically regarding the use of English, sentence construction, punctuation, etc. In some cases, this may be accomplished by the editor or at the editorial stage of the paper.</p> <p>(2) Below equation (1), several errors are noticed: $m_e c^2 = mc$ does not make sense, the speed of light is 8 orders of magnitude larger than indicated, the Rydberg constant is known as the "ionization" energy (not 'fundamental state') – these kind of errors cast doubt on the paper.</p> <p>(3) There is a report on the 10th workshop from 2017. I would think that some comments are needed indicating the current state of code comparisons. Furthermore, the acronym ATMED CR (while obvious to the author) needs definition in the article and is best avoided in the title.</p> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Name: | <i>Anonymous Reviewer</i> |
| Department, University & Country | <i>The University of Tennessee Space Institute, USA</i> |