----Original Message----
From: XXX YYY<xxx@yyy.zzz>
Sent: Tue, Nov 25, 2014 at 5:36 AM
To: Managing Editor
Subject: RE: Request for Editorial decision for manuscript number 2014_PSIJ_14982

I have reviewed the paper entitled **A first order phase transition and self-organizing states in single-domain ferromagnet (2014_PSIJ_14982)** as requested. I have reviewed the comments and suggestions supplied by your reviewers, and have the following comments and suggestions:

- Ref: Self-Organizing Systems – reliance on Prigogine et al and earlier work provided by others relative to dissipative structures is informative but incomplete. The dilemma left unresolved by Prigogine was this – how is it that in any open, complex, self-organizing system we find both catastrophic annihilation and self-organizing criticality occurring simultaneously? The answer to this problem was provided by Per Bak et al. The definition of what constitutes a 'self-organizing system' as provided by this paper is not self-evident nor is the author's description complete. I would like to see a more concise definition of what constitutes a Self-Organizing System added to the early portions of the paper before the author addresses the specific systemic issues. I would recommend the addition of Bak et al to the reference section so readers and researchers can have access to a comprehensive description of Self-Organizing Systems and the dynamics that accompany their behaviors.
- Ref: Linguistic Issues – I am satisfied that the author has leveled the linguistic topology in this paper so that while it may yet contain minor grammatical and punctuation errors, it is nevertheless clearly understandable. The improvement from the 1st version is commendable and much appreciated.
- Ref: Methodology – I am satisfied that the manipulation of equations and formulas provided in the paper are both rational and supportable. What I do not find, however, is any conversation regarding the transverse nature of the scalar wave properties exhibited by the introduction of offsetting anisotropic frequency variations. The primary shortcoming of this paper is that its analysis is restricted exclusively to the local-linear aspects of magnet flux fields. I find no meaningful analysis devoted to (a) the effects of variable angularity (other than 180 degree 'anti-parallel' field effects) on the reflective effects exhibited within the system, or (b) a discussion of the points of angular variability along which self-organizing criticality breaches the over-arching noise threshold, creates a logarithmic relationship which alters the lot of the power curve to a straight line with a slope, displays any aspects of fractal geometry, or displays attributes of punctuated equilibrium within the system, all of which are features of SOS which operate in magnetic domains.
- Ref: Summary & Conclusions – I am disappointed to see that the author has provided merely a numerical summary of the specific points addressed in the paper. One of the genuine values of this kind of work is the insight the author can provide to others regarding what the research results mean in a practical, applicable sense to other users familiar with the fundamentals of this field of research. Surely the author has demonstrated sufficient skill in the manipulation of mathematical expressions related to the behaviors and attributes of Self-Organizing Systems to understand how the field effects he has positively identified could be used in specific applications. After all, what is the use of such research if what we learn about the inner workings of natural processes cannot inform what can be done with them?

I like this paper and appreciate the author's hard work. He has obviously attempted to satisfy the recommendations of the other reviewers and appears to me to have done a workmanlike job of it. I recommend publication of this paper and would appreciate receiving copies of any follow-on work the author submits for your further consideration.

Editor's Details:
David G. Yurth, The Nova Institute of Technology, USA

Note: Modification was done in this document ONLY to hide the email id.