



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1:**

Journal Name:	<b><u>British Journal of Pharmaceutical Research</u></b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>2013_BJPR_4003</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Comparative hepatoprotective potential of <i>Tinospora cordifolia</i>, <i>Tinospora sinensis</i> and <i>Neem-guduchi</i></b>
Type of the Article	<b>Research paper</b>

**General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:**

**<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>**

- This form has total 7 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 2: Review Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments		
<b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments		
<b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments	<p>The animals were inbred or out bred or procured commercially. This information is important for repetition of the results, if someone would like to do so.</p> <p>How the authors arrived at the dose of 200 and 400 mg/kg of guduchi, no information has been provided?</p> <p>The careful look into the MS shows that it is 200 mg/kg that reduced the enzyme levels. Probably 100 mg/kg or less would have been still better.</p> <p>Tinospora alone groups are missing, which is essential for comparisons.</p> <p>It seems from the description that the authors administered guduchi satvas for four days before administration of paracetamol. What has been the basis for this regimen? Usually in Ayurvedic system they shall be given 5 or 7 days prior to this type of studies. It is not clear from the description when paracetamol was administered in guduchi treated group. Was it on fourth day, if so how many hours after guduchi administration? Were the guduchi satvas given after paracetamol administration or</p>	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>both before and after administration of paracetamol and how long? Why the animals were sacrificed after 48 h of paracetamol administration? Why not until the activities of enzymes and histology was restored to normalcy? Results Figure 1 does not provide any legend and these photomicrographs correspond, which dose of guduchi? Photomicrograph C is not really different than that of B however, authors state that it is near normal. Liver histology will not become normal in 48 h. Table 1 shows % protection. However, no formula has been provided in the Materials and Methods section for its calculation. In the absence of data for guduchi alone groups the results cannot be regarded as authentic. There are several errors of reporting in results section. Line 170 pp 8 what is interesting about the non-significant results? Results of histology have not been represented in this section. Discussion The authors have not discussed their results on the available information of Tinospora. They have used other plants. References Wealth of literature is available on Tinospora, which authors tried to ignore. Out of 39 references</p>	
--	--	--



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p>quoted by the authors only 7 belong to Tinosposra, which is really strange. The manuscript is casually written and seriously flawed on experimental design as will be clear from the above. Therefore, I am unable to recommend this manuscript for publication in the British Journal of Pharmaceutical Research.</p>	
--	---	--

*Note: Anonymous Reviewer*