



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Journal of Engineering Research and Reports
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JERR_43941
Title of the Manuscript:	Excel Approach for Infiltration Capacity for Different Lands
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
I see that the author worked hard to improve the manuscript, but it still needs a little additional work. I understand this is the "final" revision, but I think the author need a final (small) push to make it publishable 1. Thank you for addressing the reviewer's comments. The reviewer has one question about Fig. 15. And associated descriptions. The rule of thumb is, no model can achieve a R2 of 1 in validation. The claim of 100% accuracy indicates something might have gone wrong. The reviewer wonders about how you utilized the calibration and validation data groups. The textbook approach is 1) derive equations using the calibration group only, 2) use the derived equations to predict values for the validation group, 3) compare the observed and predicted values for the validation group. Did the author use this approach? You cannot use the equations derived based on all data in validation. 2. Thank you for adding a discussion about the influence of land use and soil texture. Can you comment (in manuscript) on the influence of land use and soil texture on the parameters of equations?	Done 1- Validation of Polynomial infiltration model is done carefully. Equations are derived using the calibration group only, and the derived equations are employed to predict the infiltration values for the validation group. The observed and predicted infiltration values are represented in Fig. 15, Line 311. 2- A new sub-section (3.5) is added to section 3, <u>as follows</u>: 3.5 Effect of soil texture and land cover on the Polynomial infiltration model of Excel approach, Lines 425:453 ** Lines 491:497 are added to the conclusions. ** Lines 25:29 are added to the abstract. ** A new keyword is added, Line 32.