

**A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CORPORATE SOCIAL
RESPONSIBILITY PRACTICES IN THE BANKING INDUSTRY.
THE CASE OF GHANA AND CHINA**

Abstract

Corporate Social Responsibility has become the norm and among the well accepted practices of organizations in the 21st Century. Even though it **is** not mandatory in most countries, the society has made it morally unacceptable for institutions to overlook these aspects of their operation. However, despite the acceptance in developed economies, organizations in developing economies are yet to come into terms Corporate Social Responsibility, what really it entails and the best practices. The issue of contention has been if they (the organizations) are mandated to contribute their quota to the growth of the economy by job creation, payment of taxes and other levies to the government (which is meant for this purpose), why should they further unburden their organizations with other practices such as CSR. This study juxtaposes the practices of CSR in some selected banks in two developing economies **namely Ghana and China**, to determine the Corporate Social Responsibility practiced. The selected banks are considered very key as **their activities** cover the area of agriculture and other sensitive parts of their economy. Two banks were examined from each country to ascertain the similarities and differences of their practices of CSR. Secondary data from the banks website and Social Responsibility Report **were** examined and compared. **The analysis supports that corporate social responsibility has a positive effect on the society and ensures sustainability of the banks in the long run.** It enlightens the stakeholders on the

practices of these banks and also provides best direction for the Ghanaian Banks on the current trend of CSR.

Keywords: Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), Corporate Sustainability (Corporate Growth), Social, Economic, Environment, China, Africa, Ghana.

Introduction

Research works in recent times has placed much significance on corporate sustainability. Corporate Social Responsibility is an alternative to the traditional growth and profit maximization model. Sustainable banking industry and maximizing shareholder's wealth cannot be attained in today's ever growing and dynamic world solely through short-term profit but rather through a responsible behavior. Although the primary objective of corporations is to make profits (Friedman,1970), current businesses are expected to show much concern to its stakeholders by getting involved with social issues. Advocates suggest that a way to increase the long-term profit and growth of banks is by being good corporate citizens. The World Business Council for Sustainable Development, in 1999 accepted that CSR can be described as a corporation's ethical behavior towards society. In further extension, The Conference Board of Canada (1999) introduced elements of CSR which are employee relations, creation and maintenance of employment, financial performance, human rights, environmental responsibility and investment in community outreach. One study through a survey concluded after interacting with the top performing companies with CSR programs that there is a positive correlation between CSR and Economic Development.

However, in this current era, the trend of CSR has changed and financials cannot be the only determinant of a company's sustainability.

CSR IN THE BANKING INDUSTRY

Current studies have considered CSR as a public relations issue still under discussion. According to Frankental (2001), CSR is an invention of public relations and it can only have real substance if it considers all with stakeholders' participation and reinforce this in its company objectives. Studies suggest that, there is a positive relationship between corporate social performance and financial performance the banking industry (Simpson and Kohers, 2002). The costs of being socially responsible are outweighed by improvement in productivity or other associated financial performance indicators, however the resources geared towards social responsible practices are not so high to make the bank unprofitable.

Yeung (2011), suggested that in order to become a socially responsible bank, there is a need to have a mindset which places much emphasis on “risk management, business ethics and corporate social responsibility through internal management of people and process; understanding complex financial products and external management of economic situation for the benefit of stakeholders; protect the rights of customers with setting up channels for customers to address complaints.”

In The 3C's for Responsible Banking in Asia and the Pacific: Corporate Governance, Corporate Social Responsibility and Corporate Sustainability, United Nations “Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific” (ESCAP), highlighted two areas of potential CSR focus for banks and financial institutions: small and medium-size enterprises (SME) access to financing and green business financing. According to this report, banks have begun to pay more attention on CSR, adhere to international codes of conduct and offer financial products that take account of sustainability issues; but there is still significant room for improvement.

CSR IN AFRICA AND ASIA

In recent times, various research and literature on the meaning of CSR in Asian and African organizations has resolved that (Khan & Atkinson,1987; Khan,2005; Visser,2008) in order to develop suitable CSR principles and modules organizations must consider the various aspects of CSR. Some studies suggested that most of the CSR initiatives in this parts of the world are purely philanthropic (Mohan,2001; Visser,2008) while internationally, CSR activities go beyond this (Arora & Puranik,2004; Belal,2010; Welford, 2004). The focus of the world shifted to the banking sector in the rise up to the 2008 economic crisis when countries of the world used large public funds to manage the crises. After the crises, many were concerned about how to restore the confidence in the financial institution. The issue of CSR was raised as part of Corporate Governance which emphasized on the financial institutions being good corporate citizens. A research by Visser (2008) revealed that, Economic responsibility still rank higher in terms of emphasis in Africa. While philanthropy ranks the second, legal and ethical responsibility follows in sequence. He also identified that regarding economic responsibilities, corporate social responsibilities were to generate investment and income, produce safe product and service, create jobs, invest in the human capital, support technology transfer and blend physical and institutional infrastructure.

According to Forstater et. al., (2010), the UN Global Compact is one of the most widely adopted CSR initiative in Africa with the established of 11 networks in the African continent. The Executive Council of the African Union (AU) in promoting Africa's regional and continental integration agenda announced its decision to facilitate the critical role private sector plays in the socio-economic development.

OVERVIEW OF CSR INCHINA

CSR in Chinese business has been linked to the case of Confucian classical philosophy which says before you satisfy yourself in business, make sure others

are satisfied. Studies in China has emphasized that, CSR in businesses can benefit in tremendous ways if the society they operate in is comfortable, this intend creates a long term benefits for the organizations.

According to Bingjun Li et al, (2014), CSR has been part of the Chinese society as far back as 2500years ago in the era of the Spring and Autumn. The studies revealed that, CSR in the Chinese context, had much to do with the Confucian virtue of *Yi*, which means righteousness: using the principles or norms of obtaining and distributing benefits. *Li*, which happens to be the opposite of *Yi* means the benefits and profits of one's elves. According to the Confucian philosophy, the relationship between *Yi* and *Li* which says that a person of noble character understands *Yi*, while a lower person only knows *Li*. Businesses with *Li* character just pursues short-term profit and self-interest, while a *Yi* business regards longer-term and broader gains. Base on the scenario, the Chinese ancient philosophy of CSR (*Yi* rather than *Li*) can be interpreted as being ethical, rather than simply profit-oriented. CSR in China has been the “*ideological and political work*” of the administrative departments. The Chinese government has frequently used awareness campaigns to promote corporate social responsibility, for example, by holding meetings and conferences, and displaying slogans such as “*serve the people*” and “*socialist spiritual civilization*”.

The rise of the Chinese state banks in adopting best practices of CRS has given no room for private banks to avoid following in that suite. It has to be noted that with the high population in China, the government cannot be the only source of national development for its citizenry therefore the need for the private sector to join. The role of the private sector in national development is seen in terms of core business of investment, training and technology development and also partnership and support to build the institutions, policies and local capacities needed for a

sustainable economy (A survey of Chinese business and executive by fortune Magazine China,2010).

The growth of CSR in China has in many aspects taken the trail of international best practices making it comparable. Initially, multinational and Chinese companies took the approach of sponsorship of local education, sporting activities, tree planting and other small-scale environmental and community efforts.

In 2008, the State owned Asset Supervision and Administration Commission of State(SASAC) published the guidelines on CSR. It is seen as the way for enterprise to contribute to China's national development goals. Perhaps more than anywhere in the world, CSR is focused on ensuring compliance on social and environmental issues. However, the trends are moving rapidly into strategic stage where business can gain a competitive advantage by aligning their strategy to address societal concerns and further towards the civil stage where broad industry actions is aligned to national sustainable development priorities.

OVERVIEW OF CSR IN GHANA

The practice of CSR in Ghana is predominantly high in large multinational enterprise. Ghana is a growing economy with a high domination of the foreign banks, which makes it most common to have them publishing and practicing the best CSR. The banking industry in Ghana has a special award dedicated to CSR which seeks to praise the banks that engage in the growth of the country. The concept has been that businesses are part of the Ghanaian society, and this gives the firms the responsibility to contribute to community and national development. Initial stages of banks in Ghana may not view organizational stability as a main concern. They will strive for growth to create a dynamic rapid evolving organizations that become a recognized force in the industry. Stability sounds like

151 a company that is standing still. Nevertheless, this long-term goals of income
152 growth and increased profits can be served by maintaining stability with certain
153 aspect of the bank.

154 **Measuring CSR**

155 Since 1970, researchers have adopted various ways to measure corporate social
156 responsibility, however the result from most of these attempts has normally come
157 with mixed feelings. Partly as a result of difficulty in deciding what should be
158 measured for measurement purposes. Boone,1984 categorized CSR as;

159 **Community Projects:** These covered developmental activities that company's
160 played a significant role or provided substantial support. These include civil and
161 cultural programs, youth activities, student and social activities and local earth
162 programs.

163 **Contributions:** This covers activities such as educational programs, federate
164 drives, Health awareness and other activities that can have serious consequence on
165 the society if not prevented.

166 **Equal employment opportunities:** This was in regards to eliminate
167 discrimination which gives preference to the abled, men and majority group. It
168 determined company's willingness to give equal employment opportunities to
169 women, the disabled and minority groups.

170 **Environmental concerns and energy conservation:** Environmental and Energy
171 conservation has been a major threat to the ecosystem, this seeks to see policies
172 procedures organizations have in place to conserve them.

Voluntarism: This measure according to the number of hour contributed by persons loaned to or a given lease time for public service work, this is to encourage individual involvement.

Social Investment: These include those that would not otherwise have been made under the company's customary lending standards or those in which social consideration played in the investment decision, organizations that are focused on corporate social responsibility growth will proactively promote the public interest in encouraging community growth and development. By having a positive impact on the society, the organization are also making a difference to themselves. It is not only when it comes to profit but also how the employee thinks and the economy.

With the increasing importance and demand for CSR, it is worthwhile to determine CSR impact on corporate sustainability in the banking sector. This study aims at investigating:

- The nature of CSR practiced by banks in Ghana and China.
- The similarities and differences in the practices of CSR among the selected banks.
- To what extent does CSR affect Corporate sustainability of the banks
- To what extent does their policies impact the society?

Methodology

This study examined secondary data collected from websites, corporate social responsibility reports and annual reports of the banks. A two (2) years report was examined, reviewed and compared. This study adopts the purposive method to make the selection both the Ghanaian and the Chinese banks. The Ghanaian banks

196 were selected based on their highest winning bank of the Ghana Bankers CSR
 197 awards.

198

199 **BANK OF CHINA (BOC)**

200 BOC's mission of "promoting social welfare and contributing to a prosperous
 201 nation" were adhered to and it vigorously carried out its development strategy of
 202 serving the society, delivering excellence and adoration of the people first
 203 approach. The Bank's core values of "pursuing excellence" and the corporate
 204 cultural spirit of "integrity, performance, responsibility, innovation and harmony"
 205 has been the anchor of being customer-centric, market-oriented and technology-
 206 led, worked with its various stakeholders to make contributions to the development
 207 of their economy, society and environment.

208 Stakeholders: The bank believes that social responsibility is important for creating
 209 and maintaining long-term core competitiveness, forging closer relationship with
 210 stakeholders and enhancing brand value. With this mind set, the bank has
 211 developed a module it believes showing the involvement of its stakeholders.

212 **Table 1.** Involvement of Stakeholders

Stakeholders	Expectation	Response
Country	Implement national macroeconomic policies. Promote transformation of economic growth mode.	Promote RMB internationalization, One Belt and One Road and other strategies and support industrial structure upgrading and development of medium, small and

		micro enterprises.
Supervisory Authority	Stick to legal compliance and maintain financial stability	Strictly abide by laws and regulations, improve the comprehensive risk management system, propel legal compliance of G-SIFI's, and strengthen internal control and fraud case prevention mechanism, to prevent all kinds of financial crimes.
Shareholders	Keep creating value for shareholders. Exercise the right to know and decide.	Advocate prudential operation, improve corporate governance, strengthen investor relations management and disclose information in a compliant manner.
Customer	Protect consumers' rights. Improve inclusive of financial services. Enhance service quality.	Safe guard the safety of customer information and assets, organize educational activities on consumer financial knowledge, strengthen internet finance innovation of banks and diversify service channels and product.
Employees	Protect the legal interests and right of employees. Promote career development.	Enhance democratic management of employees, optimize the training system and improve the remuneration incentive plan.

Community	Give back to communities. Fulfill global corporate citizenship responsibilities.	Support the development of educational undertakings and jointly build communities.
Environment	Protect environment and promote sustainable development.	Specify and implement the green credit policy and persist in green office and green purchase.

213

* Bank of China CRS 2014

214 **Corporate Governance:** CSR plays a significant role in BOC's business
215 operations and **it** is incorporated into her strategy. In the area of corporate
216 governance, BOC strictly abides by the regulations and laws of the PR China and
217 observes the rules and guidelines issued by various regulatory bodies, such as
218 Shanghai Stock Exchange, Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission, and
219 the Stock Exchange of Hong Kong. Moreover, various Board Committees are set
220 up: Audit, Nomination and Remuneration, Risk, Strategy and Budget, and
221 Management Committee, to take care of relevant matters.

222 **Contributing to Charity and Public Interest:** The bank assumed its
223 responsibility as a global citizen and tapped into various platforms and its own
224 strength to support poverty alleviation and cultural undertakings. It helps fight
225 against natural disasters and devote itself into community and public interest. With
226 much emphasis on poverty alleviation over the past 13 years continuously, the
227 bank has supported local infrastructure construction and developed related
228 industries to create conditions for increasing income in poverty-stricken areas. In
229 September 2014, the bank launched the "visiting people, benefiting livelihood and
230 warming hearts" serial activities in Xinjiang.

Supporting Cultural and education undertakings: The Bank has greatly supported the development of education and cultural...art undertakings. Since 2008, BOC has been the contracted strategic corporation partner of National Centre for the Performing Arts in China for seven conservative years, promoting cultural and arts exchanges between China and the world. The bank is also the executive sponsor of students' loans for higher education institutions under the ministries and commissions of the central government, from 2004 till the end of 2015.

AGRICULTURAL BANK OF CHINA (ABC)

In recent times, enterprises are built to place much emphasis on people's livelihood. Engaging in more social responsibility has now become the consensus of global governments, enterprises and the public in general. It is believed that, enterprises that show care for employees, serve customers, protect environment, repay the society and create value can win social respect and consolidate the foundation for sustainable development **says** Liu Shiyu (ABC Chairman,2014).

The development and growth of the society has been the main vein of the corporate culture of ABC. Their CSR philosophy of "giving priority to responsibility, benefiting the general public, taking the lead in fulfilling responsibilities, promoting the well-being of the society" has been the marrow of the corporate culture of ABC. Taking root in and serving "Sannong" are the historical heritage of ABC.

Corporate Governance: The bank pays great attention to the requirements of the policies of the government and the regulatory authority. **I** have finally identified the Key Topics of ABC Social Responsibility by collecting the key expectations and appeals of stakeholders, the opinions of departmental heads and experts, and

the hot issues of the banking industry that the public is concerned about on the basis of taking into account its own development strategy. The key expectations include, “Serving Sannong, supporting the real economy, alleviating poverty, improving people’s livelihood, assisting in environmental protections, optimizing services, taking delight in public welfare, helping employee succeed.

Stakeholder Participation: By sorting out the characteristics of its own business and operations, the bank classified its major stakeholders into government, regulatory authority, shareholders and investors; customers, employees, suppliers and partners; and public, communities and environment. It identified stakeholders through scientific methods and steps up the communication and exchanges with them to find out about their appeals in the field of social responsibility and the use of responsibility practices to actively respond to their concerns, promote their participation and join them in creating a beautiful future for themselves and the generation unborn.

Table 2.

Stakeholders	Expectations & Appeals	Responses & Methods
Government	Increase efforts to support real economy. Promote the implementation of national strategies. Serving the countryside financially. Promote mass entrepreneurship and innovation. Achieve the steady growth of taxes. Expand employment.	Orient around “serving Sannong”, expand coverage of country financial services, increase credit issuance, total of “Sannong” related loans have maintained “rate of increase higher than that of the past year “for continuous years. Supporting “the Belt and Road initiative”, the Yangtze River

		Economic Belt project, and “the integration Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Regions. Direct our resources towards mass entrepreneurship and innovation movement though innovations in product and methods, fully supporting development of entrepreneurs.
Supervisory Authority	Operate in good faith and comply with laws and regulations. Maintain financial stability. Strengthen comprehensive risk management system.	Improve the major risk management policy framework, make sure it is layered, scientific and full-coverage.
Shareholders and Investors.	Create sustainable value returns. Improve corporate governance. Strengthen the management of investor relations. Disclose information completely, truthfully and accurately.	Continuous improve corporate governance structure. Increase the values of shareholders. Upgrading investors’ hotline, return every call ASAP, and make sure small and medium investors’ right are fully protected and heard.
Customers	Continuous enhance service quality. Intensify the capabilities of electronic services. Maintain the rights and interests of customers.	The Boeing Project is fully operational, realizing the goal of customer-centered, fast product innovation and fully improve management abilities. Strive to be

		the first-rate information bank that focuses on technological innovation capability, production and operational safety and IT governance system. Strengthen customer rights protection, creating a healthy financial environment, always keep customer rights protection in mind.
--	--	---

271

* ABC CRS REPORT, 2015

272 **Creatively promoting Agricultural Modernization:** ABC responded actively to
273 the decision of pushing forward agricultural modernization development, firmly
274 established in the concept of innovative development, and focus on key links in
275 and industries. The bank stepped up innovative efforts in service object, service
276 products and service models and other aspects, and effectively improved the
277 breadth and depth of services for modern agriculture.

278 **Supporting the Construction of beautiful and Livable Countryside:** ABC has
279 actively implemented the concept of green development, extended green financial
280 services, effectively promoted green development in rural areas, adhered and sped
281 up rural constructions. The bank helps common people to live better, boosting the
282 construction of “beautiful countryside” that is more suitable for living, working
283 and traveling, and truly realizing happiness and well-being for all.

284 Forcefully pushing forward targeted poverty alleviation and poverty eradication:
285 With “Sannong” being at the heart of the bank, financial poverty alleviation work
286 has been both a responsibility and an honor to the bank. According to the spirit of
287 the Poverty Alleviation and Development Conference held by the central

government, the duty of ABC is crucial for poverty. The Central Government issued Guidance Opinions on Financial Services for Precise Poverty alleviation. The bank “grasped the pulse” in poor areas and focused on precise poverty alleviation, not only “transfuse blood”, but also “make blood”. With sincere services, the bank has made great contributions to promoting economical social development in poor areas and in helping poor farmers prosper.

AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT BANK OF GHANA (ADB Bank)

ADB Bank believes that making short-term returns is not the only concern of the company in its day-to-day operations. The bank is of the believe that committing some tokens to worthy causes gives some satisfaction not only to the members of the communities in which it operates but also among their workforce who feel proud knowing that they are contributing to community empowerment and growth. Having won the Ghana Banking Award’s Most Socially Responsible bank twice on the trot, ADB Bank believes that their ability to support many social projects also a plays a significant role in building customer loyalty and has supported the less privileged and other just causes while continuing to adhere to distinctive ethical values.

ADB Bank highlighted 4 areas that are much important to them, this include:
Corporate Governance, Stakeholder engagement.

Corporate Governance: The bank has proper structure for...implementing the best corporate practices. The core guiding principles of the bank’s governance practices are; Enhancing shareholder’s value through good corporate governance. The respective roles of shareholders, Board of Directors and management in the governance architecture should be clearly defined, some of which include majority

313 membership of independent directors in the size of the Board of Directors.
314 Independent directors is defined broadly as directors who are not employed by the
315 bank, who are not affiliated with the organization with significant financial
316 dealings with the bank. These principles have been articulated in a number of
317 corporate documents of the bank including the Bank's regulations, rules and
318 procedures for boards, a code of conduct for directors and rules of business ethics
319 of staff.

320 **Stakeholder:** The bank recognizes the importance of engaging with various
321 stakeholders such as customers, employees, shareholders, government, regulators,
322 suppliers and the general public, in achieving its business goals and upholding their
323 CSR commitment. ADB has in place customer-centric banking services to help
324 address customers' needs. It gathers feedback from customers through survey and
325 communication between customers and front-line staff. It also has a Customer
326 Personal Data Protection Policy to guide departments in collecting and protecting
327 customer information properly.

328 For shareholders, channels have been put in place to collect feedback from
329 shareholders. They also have the rights to obtain available information of the bank,
330 make proposals at annual general meetings.

331 For government and regulators, the bank adheres to laws and regulations strictly
332 and observes the rules and guidelines issued by regulatory authorities. Close
333 communication is maintained with regulatory authorities as the central bank
334 observes the banking industry closely. The company also actively participates in
335 various committees of governmental or industrial bodies as it plays a vital part in
336 the government's policies in enhancing the agricultural sector.

In regards to employees, the bank treasures people as the most important asset. It aims at providing a people-oriented culture to employees. For instance, having a fair and transparent recruitment policy which speaks against discrimination on grounds of race, religious, sex, marital status, sexual orientation, disability or age, providing good working conditions and occupational development opportunities for employees, and providing open and transparent communication channel for employees etc. The bank has Staff Code of Conduct which governs workplace practice. The company provides competitive remuneration packages and incentive schemes to reward employees with good performance. To have a work-life balance, the company organizes a range of recreational activities for staff, free and regular body checks are provided. Staffs are encouraged to participate in volunteer services e.g. Blood Donation, Cancer and other health treats. Also, regular visit by senior management to various branches also forms part of collecting feedback from staff and customers in order to enhance its contribution to all stakeholders.

GCB Bank

GCB bank formally known as Ghana Commercial Bank is to a large extent the leading bank in Ghana in terms of market share. With majority of the citizens banking with them, the bank recognizes the interdependence relationship between her and the community and has resulted in a continuous investment in communities and also provides support to make the society a better place for all. The bank has embarked on several numbers of initiatives in the areas of providing educational finance to schools, provided financial aid to disaster victims as well as providing medical assistance to the needy ones. The environmental and sporting initiatives have also been at the heart of the bank. The bank, having won the Best CSR Bank of the year on several occasions than any other bank in Ghana, uses a variety of top-down and bottom-up approaches to effectively engage her stakeholders . These

include customers, staff, shareholders, suppliers, business partners, regulators and the community .The bank has put great efforts in four areas which can be obtained from the banks website: Corporate Governance and Business, Stakeholders, Environment, and Community Investment.

Corporate Governance: The Board of Directors commits to high standards of integrity and ethics. The bank has is committed to strong corporate governance practices that allocate rights and responsibilities among the Bank’s shareholder, the Board and Executive Management to provide for effective oversight and management of the bank in the manner that enhances shareholder value. Matters relating to risk management governance, internal control, policies and practices on compliance with legal and regulatory requirements are considered by the Board. The bank follows the guidelines and requirements set by the Bank of Ghana and the Ghana Stock Exchange Limited. The Board has set up five committees – Audit and Compliance, Human Resource and Remuneration, Risk and Capital, Large Credit Exposure and Nomination to oversee different important aspects. Front line staffs are also operating ethically, honestly and with full accountability to maintain the corporate reputation.

Stakeholders: GCB is seen as a beacon of the public and so has made their stakeholders a very delicate part of its operation. Its major stakeholders include customers, shareholders, suppliers, staff and government. For customers, the bank has a standardized complaint handling procedure to ensure customer feedback is dealt in an efficient manner that conforms with the service pledges. In providing services to customers, the bank provides clear, transparent and balanced information to customers; and the bank ensures the privacy of customers’ personal information. The bank has formulated a set of “Privacy Principles” to guide staff in protecting customer details. GCB also offers a wide range of products specifically

for small and medium-scale enterprises (SME) under the theme Sustaining SME Opportunities in Today's market" which empowers entrepreneur to maximize returns and enhance the bottom-line, create more new employment opportunities.

For suppliers, GCB Bank has strict standards for assessing suppliers, such as requirements on environmental, social and ethical practices. Suppliers have to comply with the banks procurement policies. For instance, suppliers are required to comply with her Ethical and Environmental Code of Conduct for Suppliers of Goods and Services, suppliers have to respect human rights of employees and individuals, and to comply with relevant legislation and regulations. Suppliers also need to complete a questionnaire covering environmental issues during the tender process. The bank has stringent procedures governing staff conduct when handling procurement issues.

For staff, employees are the relationship builders and public face of the business. GCB provides wide range of staff training and development programs to its employees. Various training is being offered to employees' depending on the position, which include financial knowledge, banking products and operations, compliance, risk management, leadership and management skills and sales and relationship management.

Environmental: The bank aims to serve as a catalyst for positive environmental change among manufacturing companies, e-Banking services has been the way forward with paperless office gradually gaining its grounds in the bank.

Community Investment: GCB Bank has initiated and currently participates in a wide range of activities to promote social development, personal empowerment and long-term economic growth for the communities and the bank. Very prominent initiative by the bank includes providing infrastructural development in schools as

well as provide scholarship to outstanding basic, secondary students. The Bank seeks to support domestic companies with the view of nurturing them to bolster the economy and to become competitors at the international level. In promoting arts and culture and sports among youngsters, the bank has sponsored various youth and players of the creative art industry.

419

420 **DISCUSSION AND ANALYSIS**

421 After a close review of the CSR practices of the 4 leading banks in Ghana and
422 China, below is a summary, listing the areas they specifically mentioned in their
423 websites, Sustainability or CSR reports

424 Table 3. Areas of CSR which BOC, ABC, ADB and GCB Bank mentioned (For
425 those items with * mean that they are heavily involve in)

	BOC	ABC	ADB	GCB Bank
Corporate Governance	*	*	*	*
Stakeholders:				
Shareholders	*	*	*	*
Employee	*	*	*	*
Customer	*	*	*	*
Suppliers	*	*	*	*
Government	*	*	*	*
Regulations	*	*		

Community Investment				
Education	*	*	*	*
Donation	*	*	*	*
Volunteering	*	*	*	*
Environment	*	*		

426

427 **SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES**

428 **SIMILARITIES**

429 From the table above, it can be determined that the banks have similar practices of
430 corporate social responsibility practices even though the banks have different
431 names for its various activities. The researcher categorizes CSR into 4 areas
432 namely; Corporate Governance, Stakeholders, Community Investment and
433 Environmental. Regarding stakeholders, its coverage was quite broad;
434 Shareholders, employees, customers, suppliers, government, Regulators.
435 Community Investment also seeks to identify the bank's commitment in education,
436 donation, volunteering.

437 Both banks in these two countries specifically mentioned and carried out good
438 corporate governance practices. From their various reports, it can be identified that
439 strong adherent practices are in place with well-structured organizational structure.

440 Stakeholders have been identified as key players in order for the bank to survive
441 into the near future. Banks have demonstrated that with attesting to that effect. The
442 banks in China went a step further in compiling a table with various stakeholder

expectation and their response to them which is quite emulating. This helps in achieving business goals and CSR in the best interest.

All the banks mentioned in their report and website their investment in various community in the area of poverty reduction, educational aid, health support, donation in various areas of needs and volunteerism which is quite positive for CSR practices.

DIFFERENCES

Irrespective of the high similarities between the banks, there exist some differences which to a large extent, cannot be taken out of CSR practices.

In the aspect of environmental, BOC and ABC has worked hard to reduce emission and highly conserved energy. They have promoted and supported technologies in the area of energy savings and other environmental protection aspects. The two banks in China thus BOC and ABC have strict laws against the issuance of funds for any company engaged in activities that are not environmental friendly while the two banks in Ghana has done little or nothing in this regard. Much attention should be placed on this area to ensure sustainable development -that is, meeting the needs of the present without compromising the ability of the future generation to meet theirs. (Brundtland, 1987).

With regards to regulations, BOC and ABC has gone ahead in accepting and practicing best CSR reporting by the requirement of Global Reporting Initiative(GRI) and others which outlines best CSR initiatives and proper disclosure of CSR activities. ADB and GCB Bank have done little or nothing in this regard making it difficult for their stakeholders to know and acknowledge their responsible activities to the society.

467 In terms of details disclosure, BOC and ABC have clearer description about its
468 CSR practices in more different areas. With reference to table 1 and table 2, the
469 banks mentioned its various engagement with various stakeholders in a much
470 clearer and greater details.

471 The long term goals of revenue growth and increased profit can be served by
472 maintaining stability with certain aspects of the banks. With CSR, the bank can
473 achieve sustainable growth. CSR helps the banks in this notable aspect as follows;
474 Customer retention and Increase in Market Share: CSR has been proven to be of
475 great help in maintaining customer loyalty which is important for companies
476 because it is costlier and difficult to attract new customers than to retain existing
477 customers (Mandhachitara & Poolthong, 2011). Businesses that have shown their
478 commitment to the community and environment have resulted in higher customer
479 satisfaction. These satisfied customers are more likely to continue to do business
480 with the company, thereby resulting in a stable, loyal customer base which is a
481 valuable asset of this industry.

482 Positive Image on Employee satisfaction: Banks that have ethical lapses such as
483 ignoring standards for how employees should be treated can suffer damage to their
484 reputation when it comes to employee retention and maintaining of high profile
485 skilled employees. The banking industry is one of the industries that has very
486 sensitive customers and would cry foul when employees are changed so often. It
487 tends to create undue tension for the bank because when it comes to money issues,
488 consistency in relationship managers and other employees are key. A company's
489 image affects all of its stakeholders and making it unstable. Nielsen Group reports
490 that during a recent survey asking employees if CSR was important to them, 67
491 percent of the respondents replied that it was either strong or essential to them
492 when it comes to choosing the right employer.

Competitive Advantage: Companies in recent years' companies has come into terms with the fact that when CSR is practiced well, it can create significant benefits in terms of reputation and returns. Husted and Allen (2001) stated that CSR strategies can create a competitive advantage when used properly, pointing out that there are positive benefits associated with CSR actions. By showing the uniqueness of the community's value to the banks, they create a preference for them over their competitors (Holme, 2010). Zadek (2005), identifies three generations of companies in relation to their responsible competitiveness. First generation companies have short-term, pain alleviation strategy. Second generation companies establish strategic planning risk management policies while third generation companies incorporate the concept of social responsibility into their strategy.

Tailored Made services: Getting closer, engaging in CSR activities gives banks the opportunity to know the other banking needs of their clients, the challenges others are facing in the banking industry and design new products and services to meet this client.

With the growing demand from society for corporations to support the communities they operate, it is becoming clearer the important part companies play in the development of the society. A company cannot progress positively in a retrogressing society (Adeyanju, 2012). Companies have contributed to the development of society in various activities in the area of education, poverty alleviation, environmental protection and very sensitive areas which make the society a better place.

Conclusion and Recommendation

Corporate social responsibility has grown to be inevitable in business practices and customers today, more or less anticipate companies to be socially responsible. To build and sustain a competitive advantage to enhance profitability, corporate bodies/groups should integrate the concept and best practices in their companies. Customers have become very much aware and very complicated of their environment against the perception that corporate organizations make a lot of profits, it becomes imperative for these companies to put back into the society through corporate social responsibility initiatives.

From the analysis above, it is evident that corporate social responsibility has a positive effect on the society which in the long run, provides sustainability for the banks. It has clearly been displayed by the banks and it is quite commendable. Although the selected banks in Ghana has done little on their website for their various stakeholders to know what they do in terms of CSR and to what extent it is transforming lives. The selected Banks from China has gone far ahead with their presentation and well struck out strategic corporate social responsibility practices. Notwithstanding the wide acknowledgment of Corporate social responsibility, it yet still deserves greater responsiveness and more commitment from corporate organizations especially in the developing economies. This offers an opportunity to the corporate world to think out of the box and explore other potentially viable areas to improve on their products and get to the heart of the various stakeholders which will go a long way to ensure the longevity of the organizations.

References

- 1) ABC., 2014 & 2015, Corporate Social Responsibility Report, Agricultural Bank of China Limited.
- 2) Adeyanju, O. D. (2012). An assessment of the impact of corporate social responsibility on Nigerian society: The examples of banking and communications industries. *Universal Journal of*

544 *Marketing and Business Research*, 1, 17-43. Retrieved from
545 <http://www.universalresearchjournals.org/ujmbr>

546 3) Annual Report 2014 & 2015. Agricultural Development Bank Ltd.,
547 4) Annual Report 2014 & 2015. GCB Bank Ltd.,

548 5) Arora, B. and R. Puranik(2004), A review of Corporate Social Responsibility in India:
549 *Development Journal of society of International Development*, Vol 47, No. 3, pp 93-100

550 6) Belal A. R., Roberts R.(2010), Stakeholders' perception of Corporate social Reporting I
551 Bangladesh. *Journal of Business Ethics*. 97(2): 311-240

552 7) BingjunL.,Dongyong Z., Stephen M., Uma K.,(2014), Evolving Corporate Social
553 Responsibility in China. *Open Access, Sustainability*.

554 8)BOC., 2014 & 2015, Corporate Social Responsibility Report, Bank of China Limited.

555 9)Boones, L. E. (1984). Principle of Management.*Random House Business Division*.

556 10) Bowman E. H., Haire M., 1975, "A Strategic Posture Toward Corporate Social
557 Responsibility", *California Management Review* , 18 (2): 49-58.

558 11) Davis, K(1977). The Case for and against business assumption of Social Responsibility, in
559 A. Carroll (ed), *Managing Corporate Social Responsibility*, Little, Brown & Co Boston, MA.p.
560 321

561 12) Forstater, Maya, Simon Zadek, Yang Guang, Kelly Yu, Chen Xiao Hong and Mark
562 George(2010), Corporate Social Responsibility in African Development Insights from an
563 Emerging Dialogue, Corporate Social Responsibility Initiative. Working paper 60, online
564 www.hks.harvard.edu/m-rcbg/csri/publication/workingpaper_60.pdf

565 13) Frankental P. (2001). Corporate social responsibility – a PR invention?.*Corporate*
566 *Communications: An International Journal*, 6(1), 18-23.
567 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/13563280110381170>

568 14) Friedman, M. 1970. 'The Social Responsibility of Business is to Increase Profits.' *New York*
569 *Times Magazine*, September 13, 32–33.

570 15) Global Reporting Initiative, 2011, GRI sustainability reporting: how valuable is the journey?

571 16) Helen W. and Raymond W(2015), Corporate Social Responsibility Practices in Banking
572 Industry, *Journal of Management Research*, Vol 7, No. 4 <http://dx.doi.org/10.5296/jmr.v7i4.7894>

573 17) Hilman, A.J. and Keim, G.D.(2001). "Shareholder Value, Stakeholder Management, Social
574 Issues: What's the Bottom Line". *Strategic Management Journal*.

575 18) Holme C. (2010). Corporate social responsibility: a strategic issue or a wasteful
576 distraction?.*Industry and Commercial Training*, 42(4), 179-185.
577 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/00197851011048528>

578 19) Khan, A.F &Atkinson,A(1987), Managerial Attitudes of Social Responsibility. A
579 comparative study of India and Britain. *Journal of Business Ethics* 6, 419-432

- 580 20) Mandhachitara R., &Poolthong Y. (2011). A model of customer loyalty and corporate social
581 responsibility. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 25(2), 122-133.
582 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/08876041111119840>
- 583 21) Mohan, G(2001), Beyond Participation: Strategy for deeper empowerment: B Cooke & U
584 Kothari(eds) Participation: The New Tyrammy? Pp 247-268
- 585 22) Ofori, F. & Hinson, R. E. (2007). Corporate social responsibility (CSR) perspectives of
586 leading firms in Ghana. *Corporate Governance Internal Journal of Business in Society*, 4 (7),
587 178-193.
- 588 23) Preston L. E., O'Bannon D.P., 1997, "The Corporate Social - Financial Performance
589 Relationship: A Typology and Analysis", *Business and Society*, 36 (4), pg. 419.
- 590 24) SASAC (2009) Guidelines to the State-owned Enterprises Directly under the Central
591 Government on Fulfilling Corporate Social Responsibilities, SASAC, PRC.
- 592 25) Simpson W.G., & Kohers T. (2002). The link between corporate social and financial
593 performance: evidence from the banking industry. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 35, 97-109.
594 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1013082525900o>
- 595 26) Stanwick P.A., & Stanwick S.D. (1998). The relationship between corporate social
596 performance and organizational size, financial performance, and environmental performance: an
597 empirical examination. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 17, 195-204.
598 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1005784421547>
- 599 27) The Conference Board of Canada(1999). <http://conferenceboard.ca>
- 600 28) UN Global Compact (2010) The Role of Governments in Promoting Corporate
601 Responsibility and Private Sector Engagement in Development.
602 <http://www.unglobalcompact.org/AboutTheGC/index.html>
- 603 29) Visser, W. (2008), Corporate Social Responsibility in Developing countries. The Oxford
604 Handbook of Corporate Social Responsibility. Crane, McWilliams, Matten, Moon and Siegel.
605 *Oxford University press*.
- 606 30) Visser, W., Ed. (2005). Revisiting Carroll's CSR Pyramid: An African Perspective.
607 Corporate Citizenship in a Development Perspective. *Copenhagen Business School Press*,
608 Copenhagen.
- 609 31) Visser, W., McIntosh, M and Middleton (Eds.) (2006) Corporate Citizenship in Africa:
610 Lessons from the Past; *Paths to the Future*, Greenleaf.
- 611 32) Welford, R. (2004), Corporate Social Responsibility in Europe, North America and Asia.
612 *2004 Survey Result, Corporate Environmental Governance Programme. University of Hong*
613 *Kong*<http://web.hku.hk/~cegp/image/publications/reportsII.pdf>
- 614 33) Welford, R and Hills, P (2009) Peoples Republic of China, in Idowu, S and Filho, W .Eds
615 (2009) *Global Practices of Corporate Social Responsibility*, Springer.
- 616 34) World Business Council for Sustainable Development (1999). Corporate Social
617 Responsibility. Geneva: Author.

- 618 35) World Commission on Economic Development (1987). Brundtland Report: Our Common
619 Future. Oxford: *Oxford University Press*.
- 620 36) Yeung S. (2011). The role of banks in corporate social responsibility. *Journal of Applied*
621 *Economics and Business Research*, 1(2), 103-115.
- 622 37) Zadek, S. (2000). *Doing Good and Doing Well: Making the Business Case for Corporate*
623 *Citizenship. Research Report 1282-00-RR. New York: The Conference Board*.
- 624 38) Zadek, S.(2005). Going to scale: aligning corporate social responsibility to strategies for
625 business and national competitiveness.*Instituto Ethos Reflexoes*, 6(14), 1-28.
- 626