



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_44059
Title of the Manuscript:	Postharvest quality of banana 'Prata Anã' treated with microalgae coating
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	General comments It is very badly written in English in such a manner that it is difficult to understand what the authors want to say. I tried to highlight the points of the 1st page needing improvement, but the whole ms needs overhauling in English. There is no statistical analysis in any figure to show any significant differences between means at each time period or between time periods. So all results wording are not backed by the presentation of the data. I believe that the regression lines do not help in the data presentation at all. And there are ups and downs in acidity and soluble sugars unexplainable. The conclusions are not backed from the results, thus are, at least, questionable. Specific comments In Table 1: the green fruit turning yellow over the time of ripening is best followed by the parameter a* and not by C* or hue angle. This is shown in L125-126, where nothing changed of C* and hue angle! So the bananas did not become yellow during ripening? L165-169 the 5% mass loss is considered already externally obvious, thus fruit quality loss is macroscopically evident. At day 8 the two treatments had already >10% mass loss, thus were unsalable. Only Chlorella coated bananas had a bit lower than 8%, which is also high. Why did you mention that coatings improved shelf life to 8 days? In none of the figures there is statistical analysis so someone can see the differences between the means at each time interval. It is unacceptable. Also, the use of regression lines makes little sense in these data as the values could just be connected with lines and something (LSD, SE) could be used per time period or per mean value, respectively. Fig. 4 The ups and downs in acidity mean minor changes or huge variability in the replicates (which is not shown by some means, as I mentioned above). It may not be required in the manuscript and some wording could do the work. Most probably you have some mistake in acidity values or calculations. I believe acidity values cannot increase during ripening (and to such an extent!) of climacteric fruit, but the pH values also increased. It is the weirdest thing I have seen during fruit ripening! Fig 5B is wrong, you have no increase; you actually have ups and downs due to unstable acidity. L237-238 this is weird also. You have soluble solids above 20% and soluble sugars at the end at up to 9% and you had lost 20% of the mass. How did you find that 85-90% of soluble solids are sugars? Here they are always less than 45%.	
Minor REVISION comments	L103-104 they must not be micro liters, most probably you are talking about mL! Table 1 and L90: you say you measured firmness of the peel and then you say you measured the firmness of the pulp. What is correct? Fig 1 graphs A and B have only one line. What is it? The rest could have narrower Y axis, so differences can be seen, if any. L178 you keep talking about pulp firmness. What did you actually measure? L234-235 you mean soluble sugars in Fig. 5C, or change to 5A.	
Optional/General comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	George Nanos
Department, University & Country	School of Agricultural Sciences, University of Thessaly, Greece