



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_40182
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Fertilizers and Irrigation Practices on the Growth and Yield of Boro Rice in Haor Area of Bangladesh
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	MATERIALS AND METHOD 1. Add the geographic coordinates and the elevation of the experimental area. 2. The methodology lacks edaphic and climatic information from the area of experimentation, as well as important factors in the growth and production of rice cultivation. 3. The experimental design presented as a randomized complete block design (RCBD) with five farmers' field replications is not clear taking into account that the experiment has two levels of chemical fertilizer applications (urea) and three levels of irrigation which result in a factorial (bifactorial) design with five replications. 4. It is mentioned that the data were analyzed statistically with the help of computer package program MSAT-C, however, it is not specified the type of analysis, nor upon which variables. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 1. The results on Effects of fertilizers on plant height at 45, 60, 75, 90 DATs and at harvest (Table 2), require more statistical support, for example the standard deviations for the average values of the plant height and total tillers per hill. 2. The results on the corresponding interactions Effect of fertilizers and irrigation practices on number of the plant height and total tillers per hill of boro rice were not interpreted and discussed; same for the coefficients of variation (tables 2 & 3). 3. To avoid the monotony of the text and the tables it is advisable to present the results on yield parameters in graphs (histogram for example) mentioning their corresponding deviation. 4. The Chemical properties of experimental soil were not reported in detail in the methodology applied. They did not disclose the chemical composition of soil (macro and micronutrients) in the initial phase. 5. The aspect on Agro-Economic Analysis of BRRI Dhan29 Grower was not reported in the methodology, which highlights the inconsistencies of points 4 and 5 of the results with the proposed methodology. CONCLUSION: The conclusion is very short and not very informative and does not provide new knowledge.	
Minor REVISION comments	Abstract 1. Add briefly in the abstract the measured variables such as Growth & Yield (specify the variables). 2. Briefly mention the applied statistical analysis. 3. When referring to the significant differences between the application levels, we usually add the probability value, for example: Plant height varied significantly ($P = ???$) due to different irrigation practices.	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	1. INTRODUCTION Due to the importance of rice cultivation worldwide, it is advisable to add information on the production of this crop globally, as well as socio-economic information, supply and demand.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	In general terms, the present manuscript presents certain methodological objections of both experimental design and statistical analysis. The results presented do not fully agree with the methodology proposed.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Rahim Foroughbakhch</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Dep. Of Botany, University of Nuevo Leon, Mexico</i>