



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_43767
Title of the Manuscript:	APPLICATION OF SILICON TO ALLEVIATE IRRIGATION WATER SALINITY IN MELON GROWTH
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Page 1, line 14: "<i>Cucumis melo</i>" instead "Cucumis melo"; italic form Page 1, line 33: "<i>Cucumis melo</i>" instead "Cucumis melo"; italic form Page 2, line 56: "Kg/dm³" instead of "Kg/dm3" Page 2, line 58, 59 "mg.dm³" together, not separately, on two rows Page 3, line 82 to 86; What are the safety statistical parameters of this equation (eg R², RMSEP, or others), because this function makes leaf area prediction based on the final leaf width (LFF). AF=108 * LFF - 518 Recent studies have used besides the size of the leaves (L and W) a correction factor (Rouphael et al., 2010; Litschmann et al., 2013) or constant of leaf area KA (Sala et al., 2015) that ensured increase the accuracy of determining of leaf area in different plant species studied. To improve this interesting study and increase its quality, in order to support the quality of JEAI journal, it is recommended to consult and quote the following bibliographic sources in the field of leaf area determination: Litschmann T, Vávra R, Falta V. Non-destructive leaf area assessment of chosen apple cultivars. Vědecké Práce Ovocnářské. 2013; 23: 205–212. Available: http://www.vsuo.cz/en/publisher/abstracts_spp_23_2013.pdf Rouphael Y, Mouneimne AH, Rivera CM, Cardarelli M, Marucci A, Colla G. Allometric models for nondestructive leaf area estimation in grafted and ungrafted watermelon (<i>Citrullus lanatus</i> Thunb). Journal of Food Agriculture and Environment. 2010; 8(1): 161–165. Sala F, Arsene G-G, Iordanescu O, Boldea M. Leaf area constant model in optimizing foliar area measurement in plants: A case study in apple tree. Scientia Horticulturae. 2015; 193: 218-224. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scienta.2015.07.008 Page 3, line 91: "g plant⁻¹" instead of "g plant1" Page 4, Figure 1: In the regression equations (Figures 1A, B, C, D), but also in coefficients R² values, it is recommended to be a point, not a comma. Requires correction. Page 4, line 116: "<i>Cucumis melo</i> L." instead of "Cucumis melo L."; italic form Page 4, line 123: "<i>Triticum aestivum</i> L." instead of "Triticum aestivum L."; italic form Page 4, line 124: "<i>Physalis peruviana</i> L." instead of " Physalis peruviana L."; italic form Page 4, line 125: "<i>Oriza sativa</i> L." instead of "Oriza saiva L."; "<i>Zea mays</i> L." instead of "Zea mais L."; italic form. Page 5, line 142, 147: Figures 2A, 2B, and 2C are not clear; they are stacked. Requires revision and re-arrangement in the page. Page 5, line 152: reference is made to Figure 2B, but this is not visible. It is recommended to rearrange the figures. Page 5, line 160: Referring to figure 2C, perhaps a polynomial equation would be more accurately described for the behavior of the results against a linear equation, which is after the distribution of the points in the graph. Page 5, Figure 2: A point instead of commas is recommended in the linear regression equation (Figure 2C), but also in coefficients R² values, partially visible in Figure 2B, and perhaps also in Figure 2A. Need attention and correction.	Thanks for the correction suggestions, I hope I have taken care of all the contributions made in the text!



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Page 6, Figure 3: It is recommended to replace commas from point in equations. In Figure 3D, the graph points have a distribution similar to the other figures (3A, C), but a linear equation with a $R^2 = 0.6778$ was used; A polynomial equation would more accurately describe the behaviour of the phenomenon. Page 7, line 197: The title of the figure is recommended to be below the figure. Page 7, Figure 4: In the polynomial equations, but also in coefficients R^2 values, it is recommended to be point, and not comma. Need attention and correction. Page 7, line 200: Most likely, a portion of the previous text is missing; It is recommended to check and correct, as appropriate. Page 7, lines 201 – 202: You appreciated that: "This alleviating effect may be caused by higher stiffness of the cell wall of the leaf due to silicon accumulation." And on the Page 5, lines 154 – 156, you appreciate that: "The fact of increasing the doses of Si applied does not guarantee that plant absorbs the amount applied. There may also occur a low transporter activity between the root and the xylem [6], causing the Si absorbed not to be transported by the plant." These statements need to be harmonized. You know best your research, but here the statements come a little contradictory. Need attention. Page 7, line 208: "<i>Cucumis melo</i> L." instead of "Cucumis melo L.", italic form Page 7, line 212: "<i>C. melo</i> L." instead of "C. melo L.", italic form	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The subject is very interesting. Introductions well documented, with recent bibliographic references. The chapter of the material and method has been presented correctly and in detail and the results were adequately presented in relation to the clearly defined objectives. The results are presented correctly but require attention, and some corrections. To improve this valuable article, some bibliographic sources have been recommended to be consulted and quoted in the paper.	