



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_43023
Title of the Manuscript:	Growth, production and essential oil content of basil genotypes in hydroponic conditions under salt stress
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
I reviewed the Ms, Please ask to the author to eliminate the abbreviations in the text of the results. It is difficult to read and understand with many abbreviations. Please look for other reviewer. For the AUTHORS I suggest some part of the write-in review as follow: Aims: Salinity is one of the biotic factors that most limit the yield of crops. However, the responses may vary according to the genotypic characteristics of each species. This study aimed to evaluate the growth, production and essential oil content of three basil genotypes subjected to salinity in deep flow technique hydroponic system. Study design: The experimental design was in randomized blocks, in split plots, with three replicates. Methodology: The main plots were used to evaluate six levels of electrical conductivity of the solution (ECsol 2.45; 4.32; 6.38; 8.36; 10.37 and 12.27 dS m⁻¹), obtained by the addition of NaCl in the nutrient solution. In the subplots, three basil genotypes (AlfavacaBasilicão, Grecco a Palla and ToscanoFolha de Alface) were studied. Plant height was less sensitive than stem diameter to salinity. Results: Shoot dry matter decreased by 6.87, 6.84 and 6.47%, respectively, in the genotypes AlfavacaBasilicão, ToscanoFolha de Alface and Grecco a Palla with per unit increase in salinity (dS m⁻¹). The essential oil contents increased by 20.3 and 9.7% per unit increase in salinity (dS m⁻¹) for Grecco a Palla and ToscanoFolha de Alface, respectively. Conclusions: The genotype AlfavacaBasilicão was the most recommended for shoot dry matter production up to salinity level of 10.37 dS m⁻¹. At the highest salinity level tested (12.27 dS m⁻¹), there was no difference in shoot dry matter production and absolute growth rate between the genotypes evaluated. The genotype Grecco a Palla showed higher essential oil content as salinity increased. The phrase "130 The variables plant height, stem diameter, shoot dry matter, absolute growth rate and essential oil content were significantly affected by the interaction 131 between the genotypes tested and ECsol. On the other hand, shoot fresh matter, relative growth rate, oil yield and oil production were 132 affected by both factors, genotypes tested and ECsol (Table 1). I suggest to split in two phrases: CHANGE THE PHRASE AS "The variables plant height, stem diameter, shoot dry matter, absolute growth rate and essential oil content were significantly affected by the genotypes ToscanoFolha 141 de Alface and Alfavaca 142 Basilicão had affected (How is affected) the content is in, the data is in In Fig 1 or/and Table 1. The phrase "According to the follow-up test, the genotypes 'ToscanoFolha 141 de Alface' and 'Alfavaca 142 Basilicão' had lower reductions in PH (3.34 and 3.72%) than in SD (5.03 and 4.53%) with per 143 unit increase in ECsol (Fig. 1A and B). However, for	The authors report that the elimination of abbreviations in the text of the results has already been done in the previous review. Only the abbreviation "ECsol" was maintained because it is indispensable and universally used in this area of research. The abbreviations that have not been eliminated are in the figures and tables. The maintenance of these abbreviations was requested in the previous review. In Methodology the proposed modification "Plant height was less sensitive than stem diameter to salinity", seems to be an error, as it is part of results and has been added along with other suggestions under the heading Results. In this review, all suggestions required (in Aims, Study design, Methodology, Results, and Conclusions) were performed.



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

the genotype 'Grecco a Palla', PH 144 decreased by 4.41% and SD decreased by 3.50% per unit increase in ECsol." CHANGE BY "Figures 1A and 1B showed that the plant height of genotypes ToscanoFolha de Alface and AlfavacaBasilicão had reduction of 3.34 and 3.72%, respectively. In addition, stem diameter of both genotype decreases by 5.03 and 4.53%, respectively, as ECsol per unit increases. SECOND PHRASE On the other hand, shoot fresh matter, relative growth rate, oil yield and oil production were132 affected by both factors, genotypes tested and ECsol (Table 1). DESCRIBE BOTH FACTORS (**WHICH**) VS GENOTYPES (**WHICH**)... WITH THE DATA (**WHICH**) IN TABLE 1 2 OR Fig.1, 2.