



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_43023
Title of the Manuscript:	Growth, production and essential oil content of basil genotypes in hydroponic conditions under salt stress
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The re-written Ms HAVE 8 VALUE IN SCALE OF 10 i MADE SOME OBSERVATION, STILL NEED A MAJOR REVISION, IS STILL CONFUSE TO READ Delete DFT in abstract. Delete", except in control treatment" and add in (control, without salt). In abstract results write the meaning of SDM, in order to understand at once, when somebody read the Ms. The phrase "The essential oil content increased by 20.3 and 9,7% per unit increase in salinity (dS m⁻¹) for 'Grecco a Palla' and 'Toscano Folha de Alface". Change by "The essential oil content for the basil genotypes of Grecco a Palla (indicate the value in mL?) and Toscano Folha de Alface (indicate the value in mL?) growth in salt stress? enhanced by 20.3 and 9,7% per unit increase in salinity in dS m⁻¹." In order to understand the Ms, when somebody read it, I suggest to delete the abbreviation in days after transplanting (DAT), plant height (PH), stem diameter (SD) shoot fresh matter (SFM), shoot dry matter (SDM), etc. in the Ms and only use it at the Table and Figs. Indicate the unit of abbreviations inside the Table and Figs. For example PH, in cm?, SFM in g, RGR, in g g⁻¹ day⁻¹, etc. In the phrase, "The variables PH, SD, SDM, AGR and OC were significantly affected by the interaction between the genotypes and ECsol. On the other hand, both factors, genotypes tested and ECsol (Table 1) individually affected SFM, RGR, OY and OP. Means of isolated effects of genotypes on SFM, RGR, OY and OP also are shown Table 1." Change to the end of Table 1 description. In addition, change the phrase by "The growth variables were .. affected, describe how was affected, write an example with numbers and unit used". If the plant respond differently to the water used in the hydroponic media and the salt concentration used, what's the meaning for instance GEN, represent THE THREE BASIL GENOTYPES, how is represented each genotype? In the phrase "According to the follow-up test, the genotypes 'Toscano Folha de Alface indicate the amount and unit' and 'Alfavaca Basilicão indicate the amount and unit' had lower reductions in PH (3.34 and 3.72%) than in SD (5.03 and 4.53%) with per unit increase in ECsol (Fig. 1A and B). However, for the genotype 'Grecco a Palla indicate the amount and unit', PH decreased by 4.41% and SD decreased by 3.50% per unit increase in ECsol. When the genotypes were compared at each ECsol level (Table 2), highest values of PH were always found in the genotype 'Alfavaca Basilicão', followed by 'Toscano Folha de Alface' and then by 'Grecco a Palla'. The genotypes 'Alfavaca Basilicão' and 'Toscano Folha de Alface' showed the highest values of SD, except under ECsol of 4.32 dS m⁻¹, at which the genotype 'Toscano Folha de Alface' was superior to the others (Table 2) In all written in the Ms indicate the amount and unit, how is calculated the %." Do this correction to all the Ms. However, in the higher salinity treatment (12.27 dS m⁻¹), the oil content of the 'Alfavaca Basilicão' genotype was 1.53, UNIT? 44.36 and 17.45%, respectively,DELETE IN RED lower VALUE than in Grecco a P?alla (2.75 UNIT?) and Toscano Folha de Alface (2.27 UNIT?) genotypes TESTED (Table 2). In the phrase ""In the 'Grecco a Palla' and 'Toscano Folha de Alface' genotypes, the essential oil contents increased by 20.3 and 9,7% per unit increase in salinity (dS m⁻¹), presenting in the treatment with highest ECsol estimated values of 2.62 and 2.09 mL 100g⁻¹, respectively (Fig. 2A)." marked in red values need to be revised, include original values and Unit.	The authors thank the anonymous reviewer for the comments and suggestions. All the suggestions made were accepted and incorporated in the text. The alterations made are highlighted in yellow in the manuscript.