



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                            |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>                          |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_JEAI_41008                                                                              |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Impact of pesticides application on epidaphic invertebrate community in tomato cultivation |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                  |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>The experimental design: The Native Atlantic Forest cannot be used as a control area since the invertebrate population in the cultivated soil is quite different from the forest or uncultivated areas. Hence comparing this with the tomato production areas when evaluating the effects of pesticides is a big mistake!</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The control plots were supposed to be in the tomato cultivated areas with the same soil type but where synthetic pesticides were not applied.</li> <li>• Remember the composition of soil organisms may change depending on the type of crop that is grown as well as the quality or characteristics of the soil.</li> <li>• Even your discussion is not relating the effect of pesticides to the invertebrate population but rather to the different ecosystems (cultivated and uncultivated land), for example line 189-194. This show deviation from the aim of the study mostly because the control area was not well chosen.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <p>Dear reviewer, thank you for your kind comment. We know that our choose for a Native Atlantic Forest was not good. However, it's impossible, in our crop field conditions, to study a tomato cultivation without pesticide application. This is real because of the tomato not growth due the intense pest attack in this area. This is a big problem, that's why we have no area with a "best" condition to compare these affects you mentioned.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments      | <p><b>Title: Impact of pesticides application on <b>epidaphic</b> invertebrate community in tomato cultivation</b></p> <p>Do you mean apidaphic or edaphic? Please recheck!!!</p> <p>Introduction</p> <p>Line 31: ----- <b>ecosystemic</b> ecosystem functions, <b>sometimes ignored</b>, since they mainly act ----</p> <p>Line 35: <b>epiedaphic</b>???</p> <p>Line 37: considered <b>as</b> natural enemies</p> <p>Line 38: <b>epigeic</b>??? fauna</p> <p>Line 40: <b>epigephic</b>??? and non-target <b>coleoptera</b> fauna</p> <p>Line 49: being <b>As' by the of</b> ??? <b>Not clear</b></p> <p>Line 52-53: ----- in commercial tomato cultivation, as SUPERA (Treatment 1) and TY10 (Treatment 2) varieties,---. Why did you use different varieties? The different varieties may influence the soil organisms differently depending on their metabolites.</p> <p>Line 64: Pest control was carried out daily from the beginning to the end <b>of</b> tomato cultivation cycle. Do you mean the pesticides were being applied every day? Be precise!</p> <p>Line 51: Were all the pesticides applied in all the experimental plots equally? Did you monitored its application or you just asked the farmers to mention the pesticides they used?</p> <p>Line 73: <b>2.2 Epiedaphic</b>??? community sampling</p> <p>Line 74: <b>epigeic</b>??? Fauna</p> <p>Line 79-80: <b>For the maize crop, Badji et al. (2007) identified that Coleoptera families was sensitive to pesticide application.</b> Not needed here</p> <p>Line 106: <b>epigraphic</b>??? Fauna</p> <p>Line 108: Table 2: How can you differentiate the effect of tomato varieties from the effect of pesticides applied to the population of soil fauna?</p> <p>Line 118: <b>epiedaphic</b>??? Fauna</p> <p>Line 117: <b>2017). which may</b> ----. Check the use of punctuation marks and how to begin a sentence!</p> <p>Line 120: ---- addition of chicken litter ----- Did you also check this?</p> <p>Line 126: <b>as well as</b> especially those -----</p> <p>Line 130: ----- due to the intensification of the control practices of the STB. Did you check the application rates in each period? Avoid assumption!</p> <p>Line 155: <b>In the latter study</b>. What do you mean? Is it published? Give reference!</p> <p>Line 159: Give a reference that relates effects of rainfall to invertebrate population in the soil to support your argument.</p> <p>Line 178: contributed the most to the <b>separation of the areas</b>???</p> <p>Line 185-188: Too long sentence, not meaningful! Rephrase!</p> <p>Line 226: helped <b>discriminate treatments</b>??? What do you mean? What is its significance?</p> <p>Line 227: <b>detritivoria</b>??? Check the spelling!!!</p> | <p>Line 31. Done.</p> <p>Line 35. Done.</p> <p>Line 37. Done.</p> <p>Line 40. Done.</p> <p>Line 49. Done.</p> <p>Line52-53: We chose these varieties because they are the most cultivated in the study region.</p> <p>Line 64. Yes, every day.</p> <p>Line 51. Yes, the pesticide was applied equally for every plot. All the pesticides application was monitored by our research group.</p> <p>Line 73. Done.</p> <p>Line 74. Done.</p> <p>Line 79-80. Done.</p> <p>Line 106. Done.</p> <p>Line 108: This is a very good question. To answer this, we need do additional evaluations. We are very grateful to this comment, but this wasn't our initial purpose.</p> <p>Line 118. Done.</p> <p>Line 117. Done.</p> <p>Line 120. Done.</p> <p>Line 126. Done.</p> <p>Line 130. No, we didn't. It was impossible to follow because they apply many pesticides every day with different dose. The tomato pest attack and control is this place is a big environmental problem.</p> <p>Line 155. Done.</p> <p>Line 159. Done.</p> <p>Line 170.</p> <p>Line 178. Done.</p> <p>Line 185-188.</p> <p>Line 188. Done.</p> <p>Line 226. Done.</p> |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                  | <p>Line 229-230: ----- <b>so much</b> so that <b>there was practically no presence of</b> these insects <b>were absent</b> in the areas cultivated with tomatoes</p> <p>Line 231-232: --- which does not occur in the present study, since several insecticides are applied in tomato crops. Do you mean the pesticides need to be mixed together? Clarify on the proper use of these pesticides</p> <p>Line 234: were not significantly <b>different among</b> <del>to discriminate</del> the areas</p> <p>Line 235-236: However, the impact of such pesticides on the identification of species-level beetles is not known. <b>Are you sure?</b></p> <p><b>Please check the use of the words; epidaphic, epiedaphic, epigeic and epigephic, epigraphic!!! These words have been used interchangeably throughout the text, which is not correct!</b></p> <p><b>The word discrimination has been incorrectly used!!! Its use in some of the sentences in the text might mean dominance. Rephrase the statements where this word has been misused</b></p> <p><b>References:</b> Make sure all references are well written as per the requirements of the Journal. All references in the text must be in the reference list and vice versa.</p> | <p>Line 227. Done.</p> <p>Line 229-230. Done.</p> <p>Line 231-232. This sentence was removed.</p> <p>Line 234. Done.</p> <p>Line 235-236: Yes. We re-wrote this sentence.</p> <p>Done.</p> |
| <u>Optional/General</u> comments | <p><b>There is a need to change the aim of the study since you can't assess impacts of pesticides on invertebrates in tomato cultivation while the control is set in the forest or uncultivated area. Remember the tomato cultivated areas and the uncultivated areas characterized as native Atlantic Forest are two different ecosystems with different invertebrate communities.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | <p>Done. Thank you very much for your comments.</p>                                                                                                                                        |

As per the guideline of editorial office we have followed VANCOUVER reference style for our paper.

**Kindly see the following link:**

<http://sciencedomain.org/archives/20>