



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_38652
Title of the Manuscript:	Soil Fertility as a Predictor of the Geospatial Distribution of Forest Species in Natural Regeneration in Brazil
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>The paper is important to determine indicators that explain the spatial distribution of species in Pernambuco forests</p> <p>The objectives of the research are clear and precise. The plots for soil sampling should coincide with the plots for the evaluation of species, in size they do not coincide and it is not clear if they are the same spatially. The PCA analysis that is cited between the chemical attributes and the species is not shown in the results. The presentation of the results and their analysis is very clear.</p>	<p>We clarified in the material and methods how the soil sampling was performed. The samples were concentrated where the natural regeneration phytosociology was carried out.</p> <p>PCA was only performed to discard variables with lower vector loads. So we only consider soil attributes SB, (H + Al), Mg²⁺, K⁺, CEC_{potential}, V (%) and m (%), and the species <i>B. rubescens</i>, <i>T. mangle</i>, <i>A. dolichocarpa</i>, <i>P. arachouchini</i>, <i>C. densifolia</i>, <i>T. retusa</i>, <i>I. capitata</i>, and <i>P. heptaphyllum</i></p>
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments	<p>It would be important to clarify the materials and methods on everything related to the collection of soil samples and plots for the evaluation of species, as well as to incorporate all the analyzes carried out (PCA).</p>	Answered above.