



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_38610
Title of the Manuscript:	Germination Optimization of Butia odorata seeds
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Please see all comments in yellow colour in the text : ABSTRACT : 1.Results : Add or precise results of GA3 solution at 50 mg / L. must be mentionned as GA3 100 ! 2.Conclusion: add GA3 3.Line 85 : Please write the formula proposed by Maguire 4.Line 89 : Why 61 days ? 5.Line 110 : favors germination : Why ? can you explain 6.Line 123: If possible to add data of variance to confirm no significant in results obtained	1. In the Abstract, at the results section, it was added the results for GA₃ 50/24h and GA₃ 50/48h, as suggested, and placed in yellow; 2. In the Abstract, at the conclusion section, it was added the conclusion for GA₃ as suggested, and placed in yellow; 3. The formula proposed by Maguire was added to the manuscript, as suggested; 4. The contaminant evaluation was performed during the 61 days from sowing. According to other studies (FIOR, C.S.) the average time of 61 days is enough to determine the plant germination development, after this period they can be transferred to new substrates, which wasn't the focus in this study; 5. It favors the germination, because of the diaspores drying and hydration cycles are related to seedlings surpassing dormancy, which promotes occurrence of physiological changes in B. Odorata seeds. This explanation was added to the manuscript and placed in yellow; 6. The germination % data were added to the related treatments, as suggested and placed in yellow.
Minor REVISION comments	7. Line 133 (Figure 1) : 7.1.Germination behavior: I think this title is very large, if you can use kinetic of germination..... 7.2. The letters a, b, c, bc,.....??? wht significate these letter in order to not confuse with letters in table 1 8. Line 152: "Fior et al: " : According to you what is the cause of this difference in results ?? add explication in discussion 9. Line 159: Add table 1 10. Line 196 : table 1 : - Title must be modified like parameters analysis of - Please mention the abbreviation in the begining of the article or under the table 1 11. Line 203: usually, we use the asterisk to show significant difference with Anova analysis or in the graph but here you use letters (a, b, ...) i think you can supprim * 12. Line 220: I think " precursor " is more better than promoter ? 13. Line 222: Conclusion: conclusion very short and without perspective, please improve it	7. Figure 1 suggestions 7.1 "Kinetic of germination..." was added, as suggested; 7.2 We removed the letters, they were mistakenly put in there; 8. The Fior article, in question, concerns the study of <i>B. capitata</i>, a species that has more advanced studies in seed dormancy breaking in Brazil, the different results found might be related to physiological difference between <i>B. Capitata</i> and <i>B. odorata</i>. In addition, Fior used a technique of total opening the embryo cavity, which hasn't been used in the present study; 9. Its was added "table 1", as suggested; 10. In table 1, the title was modified to "parameters analysis of...", and the abbreviations were inserted under the table, as suggested; 11. In the Table 1, the * was removed from every columm, as was suggested, however was left one * to refer the table index below, where a * refers to the letters interpretation, as well as two * (**) refers to the abbreviations; 12. Change has been made as suggested, and placed in yellow; 13. The conclusion has been changed for a longer and more explanatory phrase, as suggested, its placed in yellow.
Optional/General comments	If it's possible to add photos of seed germination of <i>B. odorata</i> !!	We've lost the pictures. The photos were stored in your database in the agronomic laboratory, due to some technical issues the computer were submitted to a data cleanup, which wiped out this photographs.