



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_24311
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of Genotype x Environment Interaction and Stability of grain yield and related yield components in (Pennisetum glaucum (L.) R.Br.) genotypes Comment title: 1. The stability of Pearl Millet genotypes (Pennisetum glaucum (L.) R.Br.) in Multi-Environments. 2. Evaluation of grain yield and yield components of genotypes (Pennisetum glaucum (L.) in Different environments
Type of the Article	Research article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if ..
Compulsory REVISION comments	1.The figures of GGE Biplot is not well prepared. The count of genotypes is not read good. The figures must changes by new figures. If the author cant changes by new which have good appearance, then please send me your values of both location I can prepare them. 2.The Discussion section was not well prepared especially the results were not supported by important references as showed below. 3. The references are not enough, please add more and new references. The variason table is not showed in Res. Dis section. 4. On the other hand CV(%) of more traits are upper than >18, so in field observation the values of cv >18 and >20 is not approved by researchers. This mean that some mistakes were happen on observations...Please check the values of and do out, if the values is extreme. <u>Additionally, The MS need to be revised. Suggested new references to Author for support to MS</u> <u>Kilic, H. 2014. Additive Main Effect and Multiplicative Interactions .1 (AMMI) Analysis of Grain Yield in Barley Genotypes Across Environments. J. Agr. Sc. 20,337-344.</u> <u>Kendal, E. (2015). Determination of relationship between chlorophyll .2 and other features in durum Wheat (Triticum turgidum L. var. durum) using SPAD and biplot analyses. Journal of Agr. and Tech., Vol. 17(supplementary Issue)- 1873-1886.</u> <u>Baraki, F., Tsehay Y and Abay, F. 2014. AMMI Analysis of .3 Genotype×Environment Interaction and Stability of Sesame Genotypes in Northern Ethiopia. Asian Journal of Plant Sciences, 13: 178-183.</u> <u>Kendal, E and Sayar M.S. 2016. The stability of Some Spring Triticale .4</u>	Ok

Formatted: Font: 11 pt
Formatted: Justified
Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 11 pt, Font color: Auto, English (United States)
Formatted: Font: 11 pt
Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 11 pt, Font color: Auto, English (United States)
Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 11 pt, Do not check spelling or grammar
Formatted: Line spacing: single, No bullets or numbering, Don't adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Don't adjust space between Asian text and numbers
Formatted: English (United States)
Formatted: Font: Bold, English (United States)
Formatted: English (United States)
Formatted: Not Highlight
Formatted: Font: Bold, Not Highlight
Formatted: Not Highlight
Formatted: Font: Bold, Not Highlight
Formatted: Not Highlight
Formatted: English (United States)
Formatted: Font: Bold, English (United States)
Formatted: English (United States)
Formatted: English (United States), Not Highlight
Formatted: Font: Bold, English (United States), Not Highlight
Formatted



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<u>Genotypes Using Biplot Analysis, The Journal of Animal & Plant Sciences, 26(3): 2016, Page:754-765.</u> <u>Ahmadi, J., Mohammadi, A. and Najafi Mirak T. 2012, Targeting .5</u> <u>Promising Bread Wheat (Triticum aestivum L.) Lines for Cold</u> <u>Climate Growing Environments Using AMMI and SREG GGE</u> <u>Biplot Analyses, J. Agr. Sci. Tech., (2012) Vol. 14: 645-657.</u> <u>Mortazavian S. M. M., Nikkhah H. R., Hassani F. A., Sharif-al- .6</u> <u>Hosseini M., M. Taheri and Mahlooji M.2014, GGE Biplot and</u> <u>AMMI Analysis of Yield Performance of Barley Genotypes</u> <u>Across Different Environments in Iran, J. Agr. Sci. Tech., Vol. 16:</u> <u>609-622.</u> <u>Mukherjee, A.K., Mohapatra, N.K., Bose, L.K., Jambhulkar, N.N., .7</u> <u>Nayak, P. 2013, Additive Main Effects and Multiplicative</u> <u>Interaction (AMMI) Analysis of GxE Interactions in Rice-blast</u> <u>Pathosystem to Identify Stable Resistant Genotypes. African</u> <u>Journal of Agricultural Research, Vol. 8(44), pp. 5492-5507.</u> <u>Sayar, M. S. and Han, Y. 2015, Determination of Seed Yield and Yield .8</u> <u>Components of Grasspea (Lathyrus sativus L.) Lines and</u> <u>Evaluations Using GGE Biplot Analysis Method. Tarım Bilimleri</u> <u>Dergisi-J. Agric. Sci., 21: 78-92.</u> <u>Sayar, M. S. and Han Y. 2016, Forage Yield Performance of Forage .9</u> <u>Pea (Pisum sativum spp. arvense L.) Genotypes and Assessments</u> <u>Using GGE Biplot Analysis, J. Agr. Sci. Tech., (2016) Vol. 18:</u> <u>1621-1634.</u> <u>Kendal E and Tekdal S, 2016, Application of AMMI model for evolution</u> <u>spring barley genotypes in Multi-Environment trials- Bangladesh J. Bot.</u> <u>45(3): 613-620.</u>	
--	---	--

Formatted ... [2]

Formatted ... [3]

Formatted ... [4]

Formatted ... [5]

Formatted ... [6]

Formatted: Font: Bold



SDI Review Form 1.6

Minor REVISION comments	The values of table not wrote good. for example the one is just 8, the second is 8.5 On the other hand the one is 85.88, second is 85.8 So it must be same.....	Ok
Optional/General comments		

Page 2: [1] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [2] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [3] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [3] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [3] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [3] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [3] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States), Not Highlight		
Page 3: [4] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States)		
Page 3: [4] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
English (United States)		
Page 3: [4] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM

English (United States)

Page 3: [4] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States)

Page 3: [4] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States)

Page 3: [4] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:22:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States)

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [5] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

Page 3: [6] Formatted	Enver	21-Feb-17 6:23:00 PM
-----------------------	-------	----------------------

English (United States), Not Highlight

English (United States), Not Highlight

English (United States), Not Highlight