



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_23636
Title of the Manuscript:	Initial efficiency of commonly used practices to control soil, runoff and nutrient losses from maize and banana based systems in the Lake Kivu Basin.
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Reject The authors did not introduced my previous suggestions. I think he did not see them You must make a general introduction of the state of the art of the soil erosion at world scale, remember that this is your paper for an international journal. Give some sentences to show which is the situation see here some publications that are of your interest Ligonja, P.J., Shrestha, R.P. Soil erosion assessment in kondoia eroded area in Tanzania using universal soil loss equation, geographic information systems and socioeconomic approach (2015) Land Degradation and Development, 26 (4), pp. 367-379. DOI: 10.1002/ldr.2215 Cerdà, A. 2007. Soil water erosion on road embankments in eastern Spain. Science of the Total Environment, 378 (1-2), 151-155. DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2007.01.041 Seutloali, K.E., Beckedahl, H.R. 2015. Understanding the factors influencing rill erosion on roadcuts in the south eastern region of South Africa. Solid Earth, 6 (2) 633-641. DOI: 10.5194/se-6-633-2015 Nanko, K., Giambelluca, T.W., Sutherland, R.A., Mudd, R.G., Nullet, M.A., Ziegler, A.D.Erosion potential under miconia calvescens stands on the island of hawaii (2015) Land Degradation and Development, 26 (3), pp. 218-226. DOI: 10.1002/ldr.2200 Moreno-Ramón, H., Quizembe, S.J., Ibáñez-Asensio, S. Coffee husk mulch on soil erosion and runoff: Experiences under rainfall simulation experiment(2014) Solid Earth, 5 (2), pp. 851-862. DOI: 10.5194/se-5-851-2014 Dai, Q., Liu, Z., Shao, H., Yang, Z. 2015. Karst bare slope soil erosion and soil quality: A simulation case study(2015) Solid Earth, 6 (3), pp. 985-995.DOI: 10.5194/se-6-985-2015 Erkossa, T., Wudneh, A., Desalegn, B., Taye, G. Linking soil erosion to on-site financial cost: Lessons from watersheds in the Blue Nile basin (2015) Solid Earth, 6 (2), pp. 765-774. DOI: 10.5194/se-6-765-2015 Lieskovský, J., Kenderessy, P. 2014. Modelling the effect of vegetation cover and different tillage practices on soil erosion in vineyards: A case study in vráble (Slovakia) using WATEM/SEDEM Land Degradation and Development, 25 (3), 288-296. DOI: 10.1002/ldr.2162 Stanchi, S., Falsone, G., Bonifacio, E. 2015. Soil aggregation, erodibility, and erosion rates in mountain soils (NW Alps, Italy). Solid Earth, 6 (2), 403-414. DOI: 10.5194/se-6-403-2015 Brevik, E. C., Cerdà, A., Mataix-Solera, J., Pereg, L., Quinton, J. N., Six, J., and Van Oost, K.: The interdisciplinary nature of <i>SOIL</i>, <i>SOIL</i>, 1, 117-129, doi:10.5194/soil-1-117-2015, 2015. Berendse, F., van Ruijven, J., Jongejans, E., Keesstra, S. (2015) Loss of plant species diversity reduces soil erosion resistance Ecosystems, 18 (5), 881-888. DOI: 10.1007/s10021-015-9869-6	We have used and included in the manuscript the publication refer to in the left column.



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

Mekonnen, M., Keesstra, S.D., Baartman, J.E., Ritsema, C.J., Melesse, A.M. 2015. Evaluating sediment storage dams: Structural off-site sediment trapping measures in northwest Ethiopia. Cuadernos de Investigacion Geografica, 41 (1) 7-22. DOI: 10.18172/cig.2643

Novara, A., Gristina, L., Saladino, S.S., Santoro, A., Cerdà, A. Soil erosion assessment on tillage and alternative soil managements in a Sicilian vineyard(2011) Soil and Tillage Research, 117, pp. 140-147. DOI: 10.1016/j.still.2011.09.007

Cerdà, A., Lavee, H., Romero-Díaz, A., Hooke, J., Montanarella, L. 2010. Soil erosion and degradation in mediterranean type ecosystems. Land Degradation and Development, 21 (2), pp. 71-74..DOI: 10.1002/ldr.968

Cerdà, A.Rainfall drop size distribution in the Western Mediterranean basin, Valencia, Spain(1997) Catena, 30 (2-3), pp. 169-182. DOI: 10.1016/S0341-8162(97)00019-2

Giménez-Morera, A., Ruiz Sinoga, J.D., Cerdà, A.The impact of cotton geotextiles on soil and water losses from mediterranean rainfed agricultural land(2010) Land Degradation and Development, 21 (2), pp. 210-217. DOI: 10.1002/ldr.971

Cerdà, A., Jurgensen, M.F.The influence of ants on soil and water losses from an orange orchard in eastern Spain(2008) Journal of Applied Entomology, 132 (4), pp. 306-314. DOI: 10.1111/j.1439-0418.2008.01267.x

Lasanta, T., Cerdà, A. 2005. Long-term erosional responses after fire in the Central Spanish Pyrenees: 2. Solute release. Catena, 60 (1), pp. 81-100. DOI: 10.1016/j.catena.2004.09.005

Moreno-Ramón, H., Quizembe, S.J., Ibáñez-Asensio, S. Coffee husk mulch on soil erosion and runoff: Experiences under rainfall simulation experiment(2014) Solid Earth, 5 (2), pp. 851-862. DOI: 10.5194/se-5-851-2014