



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1:**

|                          |                                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                          |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>MS: 2012 AJEA 2823</b>                                                                                             |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>ESTIMATION OF FIELD ENVIRONMENT VARIABILITY FOR GERMINATION AND SEEDLING TRAITS IN <i>MADHUCA INDICA</i> GMEL.</b> |

**General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:**

**(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)**

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



## SDI Review Form 1.6

### **PART 2: Review Comments**

|                                            | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <p>First problem: Why have you done this work? I cannot see the importance (meaning that you have not shown the importance of the plant from the agronomical-economical point of view). Is it important to check the germination? Why? If you are going to use the plants in the future, would it not be more important focusing in other agronomically important characters? Please explain the selection of variables.</p> <p>Second big problem: What you have, if I have fully understood, is just the seeds from 20 trees coming from different parts of the country. Do you think that this is an adequate sampling? If you really want to conserve the genetic variability, you should sample much many more plants. Please explain and compare with other publications (of this century, please update the literature).</p> <p>Third problem: the seeds are coming from different parts of the country. There is probably some maternal inheritance (meaning effects due to the different conditions in which the seeds developed). Considering that you are comparing just the seeds of 20 trees, there is strong need for more evidence about the genetic and the plastic components of variability.</p> <p>Fourth problem: please explain the procedure you have followed to split the variance and to check the heritability... with more updated literature.</p> <p>Fifth concern: 20 genotypes?</p> <p>Sixth problem: if there are not statistically different significance, you should not tell that there are differences</p> | <p>First problem: When used in agroforestry systems( agri-silviculture system).The plant is agro-economically important because of its multipurpose uses briefly described in introduction para 2. Checking of germination per cent is important to get the required number of seedlings grown for planting out. Other agronomically important characters are also under trial to be combinedly put to use in future. Selection of variables germination per cent, germination energy index, mean daily germination, peak value, germination value and germination speed is done to get better genotypes selected on the basis of their genetic makeup.</p> <p>Second problem: This sampling is adequately enough for the particular region or area under consideration and not for the whole country as cleared from passport details in table 1.compared to controlled environment less work has been done for the estimation of field environment variability for germination and seedling</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|--|------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>because you have not proved them.</p> | <p>traits as per literature cited.</p> <p>Third problem: The seeds from 20 plus trees scattered all over the particular area under consideration have been taken keeping in view also the physical barrier separation such as river, large tract of agricultural fields and large roadways. Selection of plus trees have done on the basis of criteria given in materials and methods para 1</p> <p>Fourth problem: Procedure worked out by Johnson et al., (1955) added in the context</p> <p>.</p> <p>Fifth problem: 20 genotypes are 20 plus trees selected on the basis of the criteria given in table 1</p> <p>Sixth problem: I agree that without proving we should not state anything but in which line I have done the mistake couldn't get.</p> |
|--|------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | Pinus, not pinus<br>Large-scale artificial regeneration and tree improvement? | pinus rectified as <i>Pinus</i><br>Added, large scale-artificial regeneration and tree improvement work is required for its hard and fast depleting genetic resources as the local people sweep the canopy floor of the plant for maximum seed collection for multiple uses |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |