



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                   |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>                                                                                                 |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_JEAI_36325                                                                                                                                                     |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Carcass, organs and economic evaluation of broiler birds fed low-protein diets supplemented with the most limiting essential amino acids in ideal protein concept |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                                         |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

|                              | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Compulsory REVISION comments | <p><b>Comments</b><br/>Title can be changed, not clear<br/>Abstract should be reordered, some informations deleted!!!these informations transfer to material and metods part.</p> <p>Broilers!!!maturity is not true, delete!!!!<br/>Key words rewritten, should be clear and short words<br/>The experimental diets should be clearly identified at material and methods.</p> <p><b>Introduction</b><br/>Line 41:broilers requirements is true<br/>Not enough literature in introduction, added!!!<br/>Line 65:The sentences rewritten!!....aimed to evaluate....(grammer error!!)<br/>Line 67:EAA's, should be clear writing (first using!!!)</p> <p><b>Material and Methods</b><br/>Line 72-77:The sentences is not necessary, delete!!!very complex and messy!!!see journals related subject.<br/>Subtitles reordered!!!!for example;Experimental design and diets,<br/>Housing and birds can be reordered!!!<br/>Site??housing, site preparation???<br/>Line 92-98:not necessary information!!!<br/>DL-Methionine??Why purchased locally from feed mill, but the other EAA's!!!!explained!!<br/>Line 101:technical informations are not necessary!!<br/>Short information is enough at material and methods<br/>EAA's and diets include to experimental diets subtitle<br/>Line 173:.....were made up..... is not suitable using, different verb or word!!<br/>Table 1 is not necessary, but composition of experimental diets should be given in Table, analysed or calculated composition, especially crude protein content, aminoacid composition etc.....<br/>Line 178-180:wrong!!!meaning!!not scientific<br/>Bird genotype, housing (floor or cage)<br/>bird/m2???,feeder??, feeding???ad libitum feeding??<br/>Bird number eacg group??replicates???bird/each replicate. All informations should be added to material and method part.</p> <p>Results and Discussion<br/>Rewritten!!!<br/>Performance parameters???? Should be given</p> |                                                                                                                                                                               |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                  | <p>Carcass yield???</p> <p>Salable product is not true using in view of zootechnical!!</p> <p>Live weight!! And slaughter weight!!</p> <p>Feed removal ???hour before slaughter!!</p> <p>Hot carcass weight???</p> <p>g/100 g BW, organ weights</p> <p>mean±SEM</p> <p>And statistical analysis is absent at material and methods, ANOVA, SPSS???</p> <p>P values???</p> <p>Table 4; cost of feeds ??2017 or 2016 specified as dipnote, and experimental groups should be clear writing at bottom of tables!!</p> |  |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                                                       |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b><i>Hatice B. Malayoğlu</i></b>                                     |
| Department, University & Country | <b><i>Department of Animal Science, Aegean University, Turkey</i></b> |