



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_31780
Title of the Manuscript:	Determination of effect of stratification temperature and Duration on germination of Spruce (Picea smithiana Wall. Boiss) under laboratory conditions
Type of the Article	Original Research Paper

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	The manuscript has several scientific defects including experimental setting, germination parameter measurement, and statistical analysis and presenting the data. As the material used in the experiment, there no any indication of seed maturity stage and year effect. In addition there are no any climate or soil type or location information of trees seeds collected from. Bulking all seeds without any parameter strongly effect germination parameters measured. Also there is no any germination parameter, except germination percentage. However, there is no any method indicating how they measured germination. <i>Stratification temperatures</i> Control conditions are defined. During January 2011 and 2012 a large quantity of spruce seeds were placed for stratification. Whether or not seeds of both years were bulked in the experiment. It is not clear. How and why they used chosen temperatures and duration times are not given. Statistical methods or data transformation for percentage data are not given? Lack of methodologies.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Iskender Tiryaki</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Department of Agricultural Biotechnology, Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Turkey</i>