



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_36958
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of gibberellic acid (GA3) and rootstock on the evolution of the mandarin tree induction "Nadorcott" in the Atlantic coastal zone, Northern Morocco
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Comments: The research is very good, it is well written, variables are adequate and support in experimental design. However, there are little errors inside manuscript.	
	Title: Write Costal Zone (capital letters)	Line 2. Costal Zone
	Abstract:	
	Is ok, only line 6 write and not et	Line 6. C35 citrange and
	Introduction:	
	Write the importance of citrus production in Morocco (annual production, hectares, and production value.	Line 23-30. In Morocco, the citrus fruit sector plays an important socio-economic role and it covers in 2016 a surface area of 124.5 kha, of which 109.8 kha is in production. It produces 2.36 MT on average and exports 0.5 MT the equivalent of almost 3 billion DH / year in foreign currency [Maroc Citrus, 2016]. However, the citrus sector generates nearly 21 million working days per year (60% in orchards and 40% in agribusiness) [MAPM, 2016]. The main varieties of Moroccan citrus fruits are Clementine (39%), Maroc Late (29%), Navel (22%), Half season oranges (5%) and other varieties [MAPM, 2016]. The Nadorcott variety gained in importance, with an area of 6.6 kha, of which 4.6 kha in production, with a production of 0.18 MT mainly destined for export [Maroc Citrus, 2016].
	Line 30. El Otmani et al., or El Otmani and Tejjine	Both, but i add a and b: Line 39. El Otmani and Tejjini, 1990a; El Otmani and al., 1990b Line 437. El-Otmani, M., Tejjini, H. 1990a. Line. 439. El-Otmani, M., M'Barek, A. A., & Coggins, C. W. 1990b.
	Line 31. El Otmani et al.,2000 (write a or b) because there are two in the reference list.	Line 39. El Otmani and al., 2000a Line 336. El-Otmani and al., 2000b Line 441. El-Otmani, M., Coggins, C.W., Jr., Agusti, M., and Lovatt, C.J. 2000a Line 443. El-Otmani, M., Taibi, F.-Z., Ait-Oubahou, A., 2000b.
	Line 32. Iwahori et or and	Line 40-41/43-44. Iwahori and Oohata, 1981
	Line 38. Write Garcia-Luis et al., 1995	Line 47-48. Garcia-Luis and al., 1986; Southwick and al., 1986; Garcia and al., 1995; Valiente and al., 2004; Gravina and al., 2012; Takeno, 2012
	Line 38. Valiente et al., or Valiente and Albrigo	
	Line 49. Pérez-Perez et al., 2007 or 2008. Are ok 2009 and 2014.	Line 58. 2008
	Methodology or Materials and methods:	Line 68. I changed Methodology by Materials and methods
	Is ok, it's very complete, only add latitude, longitude and altitude of the experimental station.	Line 70. (Maroc-Merchich-Lambert Nord: X=414 559m; Y=464 524m; Z=49 m)
	Results.	
	Is ok, are complete also the table and figure. Only line 266 write August 4 and 5, 2012 and December 29 and 30, 2012.	Line 284-285. (DI: August 4 and 5, 2012). Otherwise, at the final date (DF: December 29 and 30, 2012)
	Discussion	
	Is ok.	
	Line 310. Write Talon and Zeevaart	Line 328. Talon and Zeevaart, 1992
	Line 315. Write only Maldankar et al., delete P.M.	Line 333-334. Haldankar and al., 2014
	Line 317. Write García-Luis et al., 1995	Line 335. Garcia and al., 1995
	Line 317. Write García-Luis et al., 1986	Line 335. Garcia and al., 1986



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Line 318. El Otmani et al., 2000 (a or b)	Line 336. El-Otmani and al., 2000b
	Line 342. Xi Li et al., 2016 or Li Xi et al., 2017.	Line 360. Xi Li and al., 2016
	References:	
	Next references are lacking in the reference list	
	Agusti, 1981	Line 30. Agusti and al., 1981a and b Line 402-403. Agusti, M., Almela, V., and Guardiola, J.L. 1981a. Floración en el genero Citrus. Inducción floral o inhibición? N. Reun. Nat. Soc. Esp. Fisiol. Vegetal : 264-265. Line 404-405. Agusti, M., Almela, V., Guardiola, J.L. 1981b. The regualtion of fruit cropping in mandarins through the use of growth regulators. Proc. Int. Soc. Citriculture : 216-220.
	García et al., 1985	Line 440-441. García-Luis, A., Agustí, M., Almela, V., Romero, V. and Guardiola, J. L. 1985. Effect of gibberellic acid on ripening and peel puffing in ‘Satsum’ mandarin. Scientia Hort., 27 : 75-86.
	Gonzalez-Altozano and Castel 2000	Line 453-454. Gonzalez-Altozano, P. and Castel J.R. 2000. Regulated deficit irrigation in ‘Clementina de Nules’ citrus trees. II. Vegetative growth. J. Hortic. Sci. Biotechnol., 75. pp: 388–392.
	Navarro et al., 2010	Line 492-493. Navarro, J. M., Pérez-Pérez, J. G., Romero, P., Botfa, P. 2010. Analysis of the changes inquality in mandarin fruit, produced by deficit irrigation treatments. Food Chem.119, 1591 L 1596.
	Byers et al., 1990.	Line 415-416. Byers, R. E., J. A. Barden, R. F. Polomski, R. W. Young and D. H. Carbaugh. 1990. Apple thinning by photosynthetic inhibition. J. Amer. Soc. Hort. Sci. 115: 14–19.
	Next references are lacking inside manuscript	
	Miling, 2008	To be deleted
	Powell and Krezdorn, 1977	
	Sanchez-Capuchino and Casanova 1973	
	Other errors	
	References Agusti, M. 2003 (write only one reference)	Line 38. Agusti and al., 1981a and b Line 417-418. Agusti, M., Almela, V., and Guardiola, J.L. 1981a. Floración en el genero Citrus. Inducción floral o inhibición? N. Reun. Nat. Soc. Esp. Fisiol. Vegetal : 264-265. Line 419-420. Agusti, M., Almela, V., Guardiola, J.L. 1981b. The regualtion of fruit cropping in mandarins through the use of growth regulators. Proc. Int. Soc. Citriculture : 216-220.
	Reference El Otmani et al., 2000 (add a and b in accordance with manuscript	Line 39. El Otmani and al., 2000a Line 336. El-Otmani and al., 2000b Line 441. El-Otmani, M., Coggins, C.W., Jr., Agusti, M., and Lovatt, C.J. 2000a Line 443. El-Otmani, M., Taibi, F.-Z., Ait-Oubahou, A., 2000b.
	Line 410. Is incomplete	Line 431. ...via osmotic adjustment. J. Am. Soc. Hort. Sci. 129(6), 881–889.
	Line 415. Delete et	Line 437. El-Otmani, M., Tejjini, H. 1990a. Utilisation de régulateurs de croissance sur oranges navels pour prolonger la saison de
	Line 443. Nutrition	Line 473. Advances in Citrus nutrition. Ed. Springer. pp 316.
	Line 452. Write 2:45-49	Line 482. Konkan Bahadoli. Journal of Plant Studies; Vol. 3, No. 2: 45-49.
	Line 463. Delate et al	Ok
	Line 476. Write 1:356-359	Line 506. v.1: 356-359.
	Line 498. Add year	Line 528. Salazur-Saenz, R. P. 2001.
	Line 508. Agric. 2:105- ?	Line 536. Sauer, M. R. 1951. Growth of orange shoots. In : Aust. J. agric. Res. 2(2): 105-117.
	Line 509. 81:26-29	Line 538. in Citrus. In : Plant Physiol. Vol. 81: 26-29.
	Line 537. 59:3215-3228	Line 565. 59: 3215-3228.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	PLEASE CHECK OTHERS ERRORS	I changed “et” by “and” in many lines I add : Line 493. MAPM, 2016. Statistiques de la production végétale Campagne 2014-2015. MAPM. Line 494. Maroc Citrus, 2016. Statistiques de la Campagne 2015-2016.
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		