



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                           |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>                                                                                         |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_JEAI_36958                                                                                                                                             |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effect of gibberellic acid (GA3) and rootstock on the evolution of the mandarin tree induction "Nadorcott" in the Atlantic coastal zone, Northern Morocco |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                                                                                           |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                         | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | 1. Suggest Title is 'Effect of gibberellic acid (GA3) on rootstock of mandarin "Nadorcott" in the Atlantic coastal zone, Northern Morocco' | Good choice, I accept<br>Line 1. Effect of gibberellic acid (GA3) <b>on</b> rootstock on the evolution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|                                     | 2. Paper is too lengthy, can be summarised. Long sentence must be shortened.                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                                     | 3. Not logically presented, needs to be more coherent.                                                                                     | Line 23-30.<br><b>In Morocco, the citrus fruit sector plays an important socio-economic role and it covers in 2016 a surface area of 124.5 kha, of which 109.8 kha is in production. It produces 2.36 MT on average and exports 0.5 MT the equivalent of almost 3 billion DH / year in foreign currency [Maroc Citrus, 2016]. However, the citrus sector generates nearly 21 million working days per year (60% in orchards and 40% in agribusiness) [MAPM, 2016].</b><br><b>The main varieties of Moroccan citrus fruits are Clementine (39%), Maroc Late (29%), Navel (22%), Half season oranges (5%) and other varieties [MAPM, 2016]. The Nadorcott variety gained in importance, with an area of 6.6 kha, of which 4.6 kha in production, with a production of 0.18 MT mainly destined for export [Maroc Citrus, 2016].</b>                                                                                                              |
|                                     | 4. Include and cited too many references                                                                                                   | I add :<br>Line 493. <b>MAPM, 2016. Statistiques de la production végétale Campagne 2014-2015. MAPM.</b><br>Line 494. <b>Maroc Citrus, 2016. Statistiques de la Campagne 2015-2016.</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|                                     | 5. Omit words such as 'We count.....'                                                                                                      | Line 417. <b>we count to favor the C35 citrange rootstock as an appropriate</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                                     | 6. <b>Statistical analysis is not described</b>                                                                                            | Line 116-117. <b>this is a Randomized Complete Block Design</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                                     | 7. Conclusion is not included                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                                     | 8. All publications cited in the text should be presented in the list of references in alphabetical order.<br>Eg. Agusti, 1981 etc...      | I added in the référence list:<br>Line 402-403. <b>Agusti, M., Almela, V., and Guardiola, J.L. 1981a. Floración en el genero Citrus. Inducción floral o inhibición? N. Reun. Nat. Soc. Esp. Fisiol. Vegetal : 264-265.</b><br>Line 404-405. <b>Agusti, M., Almela, V., Guardiola, J.L. 1981b. The regulation of fruit cropping in mandarins through the use of growth regulators. Proc. Int. Soc. Citriculture : 216-220.</b><br>Line 440-441. <b>García-Luis, A., Agustí, M., Almela, V., Romero, V. and Guardiola, J. L. 1985. Effect of gibberellic acid on ripening and peel puffing in 'Satsum' mandarin. Scientia Hort., 27 : 75-86.</b><br>Line 453-454. <b>Gonzalez-Altozano, P. and Castel J.R. 2000. Regulated deficit irrigation in 'Clementina de Nules' citrus trees. II. Vegetative growth. J. Hortic. Sci. Biotechnol., 75. pp: 388-392.</b><br>Line 492-493. <b>Navarro, J. M., Pérez-Pérez, J. G., Romero, P., Botía, P.</b> |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|                                  |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                  |                                                                                                                                               | 2010. Analysis of the changes in quality in mandarin fruit, produced by deficit irrigation treatments. Food Chem. 119, 1591–1596.<br>Line 415-416. Byers, R. E., J. A. Barden, R. F. Polomski, R. W. Young and D. H. Carbaugh. 1990. Apple thinning by photosynthetic inhibition. J. Amer. Soc. Hort. Sci. 115: 14–19. |
|                                  | 9. All cited references are not listed in the reference list and all listed references are not cited.<br>Eg. García-Luis et al 1995, etc..... | I deleted: Powell and Krezdorn, 1977 / Sanchez-Capuchino and Casanova 1973                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments   | Revisions have to be done as above comments                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments | Some statements are confusing in most of the places.<br>Use the scientific writing skills for elaborations                                    | Please see document                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |