



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_35486
Title of the Manuscript:	Organic fertilizers, minerals and base saturations in the cultivar of arugula in Oxisol
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. Title: Organic fertilizers, minerals and base saturations in the cultivar of arugula in Oxisol ☐☐☐ The Title is unclear and not reflecting the content of MS ☐ The title should enlight the whole content of article (Short, sharp and enlight the content). Suggestion : ☐ Effect of Wood Ash and Inorganic Fertilizers on the Growth of Arugula (<i>Eruca Sativa</i> Miller) at Different Base Saturation on Oxisols or ☐ Application of Wood Ash and Inorganic Fertilizers to increase the Growth of Arugula (<i>Eruca Sativa</i> Miller) at Different Base Saturation on Oxisols Noted : Wood ash has very low of organic carbon and it belong to the residue of organic combustion and its residue mostly are mineral nutrients. It is totally different with the residue of decomposition or mineralisation and resulting humic substances Consequently the term Organomineral should not be used. Wood ash may categorizd`as ameliorant 2, Abstract ☐ Abstract : should be rearranged and rewritten concisely and sharply: Suggested change to: ABSTRACT Experiment to evaluate the production of arugula fertilized with wood ash, inorganic fertilizer at different the base saturation (BS) levels on Oxisol has been conducted from ... to in greenhouse. The experiment was set up as completely randomized block design, consisted of eight treatments (T1= Wood Ash at 50% of BS, T2 = Wood ash at 80% of BS, T3 = Wood ash + mineral fertilizers at 50% of BS, T4 = Wood ash + mineral fertilizers at 80% of BS, T5 = Mineral fertilizer at 50% of BS, T6 = Mineral Fertilizers at 80% of BS, T7= control (Limed for 50% of BS), , T8= control (Limed for BS=80%). Dolomite was applied about ...ton ha⁻¹ to elevate the BS to 50% and ton ha⁻¹ and incubated for 30 days . The arugula was planted in pots	The authors are grateful for the attention and contributions to improving the quality of the article. We try to incorporate all the suggestions as best we can. The title was changed, such as the abstract. Although the wood ash presents low organic carbon in their constitution, when wood ash is mixed with the mineral fertilizer the mixture can be considered a organomineral fertilizer. According to legislation, organomineral fertilizer present a minimum of the 8 % of organic carbon, that is the case of wood ash, as results at burn of woods. The abstract was rearranged, as the all the text. The other notes are highlighted in yellow in the attached document. We are available for any questions you may have about the article. Sincerely,



SDI Review Form 1.6

	containing of 2 kg of media and responds were observed and measured at 30 days. The highest values of pH of the soil were observed in the treatments at 80% of BS. Generally, the higher of fresh and dry matter shoot were obtained by application of mineral and wood ash combined with mineral fertilizers. The higher of dry matter of root was obtained by minerally fertilized plots at 80 % of BS. Compared to wood ash fertilized` plots only, the minerally fertilized plots followed by the wood ash and mineral treated plot provided the highest of chlorophyll index, fresh and dry matter of shoot and dry matter root of the arugula plants. The minerally fertilized of arugula could be grown at 80% of BS and at 50% if fertilized with wood ash and mineral fertilizers. INTRODUCTION ☐ Should be re arranged and written systematically. Use the a short sentence and follow the scientific common grammer. ☐ Present and dscribe clearly the significant and the role of wood ash (including the availability of wood ash) ☐ Wood ash may categorized as ameliorant (not as organic fertilizers) ☐ Describe the important of this resaearch and formulated the problems to be solved or evaluated MATERIAL AND METHODS Should be rewritten concisely and rearranged systematically ☐ The treatment should be clear. Symplified the treatments T1= Wood Ash at 50% of BS T2 = Wood ash at 80% of BS T3 = Wood ash + mineral fertilizers at 50% of BS T4 = Wood ash + minertal fertilizers at 80% of BS T5 = Mineral fertilizer at 50% of BS T6 = Mineral Fertilizers at 80% of BS T7= control (Limed for 50% of BS)¹ T8= control (Limed for BS=80%) Describe dosage of applied dolomite to elevate BS to 50% and 80%. The unit rate of fertilizers, wood ash and dolomite use kg ha⁻¹ or	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	tonne ha⁻¹. Describe the procedure of research in detail. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION Should be rewritten concisely and rearranged systematically. Please follow the guidance for the author, how to present and discuss the results It is strongly advice to use the help or the assist of proof reader ☐ Simplified the title of Table ☐ Mean value followed by the same letter within the column are not different significanty (Scott-Knott test p=0.05). ☐ Noted: Scott knott test is used if the treatments above tens, Less than 6 treatments uses LSD, 6-10 uses DMRT CONCLUSION Re written and focusing on the effect of treatmens on the main obserbed responds. Application of inorganic feritizers or combination of wood ash with inorganic fertilkizers gava the significant effect on. The minerally or inorganic fertilized of arugula could be grown at 80% of BS and at 50% if fertilized with wood ash and mineral fertilizers.	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments	It is advice to present more the improved physico-chemical properties and the growth/yield of arugula.	