



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                              |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>                            |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_JEAI_29773                                                                                |
| Title of the Manuscript: | OPTIMUM LEVELS OF SULPHUR AND ZINC FOR RICE IN LOWLAND AREAS OF KILOMBERO DISTRICT, TANZANIA |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                    |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>Abstract:</b><br/>Over 50% made up of materials and methods. Abstract should talk briefly about methodology and concentrate on major observations/findings.<br/>Line 6. What is farmer-researcher management?</p> <p><b>Materials and methods.</b><br/>Lines 99-100: All other treatments except control received P, K, Mg and Ca. How sure are authors that these nutrients could not be limiting growth and yield under the control?<br/>Line 111: How was N applied?<br/>Lines 119-120: Were fields flooded throughout the growing period as stated?</p> <p><b>Results and discussion.</b><br/>Line 154: [4] reported that nine out of 20 sites had <math>\leq 0.2\%</math> total N. Where was this and how does it related to this study?<br/>Lines 172-173: Statement contradicts those made in lines 176-177<br/>Lines 212-213; Difficult to comprehend the points authors wish to make.<br/>Lines 227-231: GY not significantly affected by ..... contradicts statements in Lines 242-246.<br/>Line 230-231: Statements not true. GY was significantly affected by S application.</p> <p><b>Conclusion;</b><br/>A repetition of results presented. Conclusion should state categorically the a major finding and any recommendation if possible.</p> | <p><b>Note that indicated lines are for the corrected version. Results and Discussion was restructured</b></p> <p>An abstract was reviewed<br/>What is farmer-researcher management?<br/><b>A statment revised</b></p> <p><b>Materials and methods.</b><br/>Line 99-100 :<br/>Soil used in absolute control treatments was not applied with fertilizers in order to test the the influence of absolute nutrients on yields. Aim was to mimic most farmers who do not apply fertilizers.<br/><b>No statement revision</b></p> <p>106 – 108 :Explanation of N application was included<br/>119 -120: The fields were flooded throughout the growing period as stated. An average of 1066.7 mm of rainfall during the growing seasons provided enough water to flood fields during the growing season. <b>No statement revision</b></p> <p><b>Results and discussion.</b><br/>Line 154- 155: A clarification made on total N<br/>Lines 172-173: Statement contradicts those made in lines 177-178. Sentences were clarified; line 173-174 talk about GY differences between T4 and T5 while line 177-179 is about GY changes between T1</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <p>and T5.</p> <p>Lines 212-213: A statement reviewed<br/>Lines 227-231: GY not significantly affected by .....<br/>contradicts statements in Lines 242-246.<br/><b>Contradictions were clarified</b></p> <p>Line 229-233: Statements not true. GY was<br/>significantly affected by S application. <b>A statement<br/>was re-written to show significance of S<br/>application</b></p> |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | <p>Line 151: a punctuation is required between ranges and [10]<br/>Line 153: several punctuations required<br/>Line 189: GY yields should be reconsidered.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                             | <p>Line 151: a punctuation is required between ranges<br/>and [10]. <b>A punctuation made</b><br/>Line 153: several punctuations required .<br/><b>Punctuations made</b><br/>Line 189: GY yields should be reconsidered. <b>Words<br/>made clear</b></p>                                                                                                                                |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | <p>Good manuscript but full of poor language and general<br/>expressions. Need to be improved. Several statements<br/>contradict each other and results as presented in Tables.<br/>Number of tables could be reduced and one or two figures<br/>added that will easily show the significance of S application<br/>particularly for soils of the area.</p> | <p>Contradictions were clarified and most of general<br/>expressions revised. Tables were remained the<br/>same<br/><b>Conclusion;</b><br/>A repetition of results presented.<br/><b>Line287-294: Conclusion was re-structured</b></p>                                                                                                                                                  |