



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_29099
Title of the Manuscript:	Characterization of the Water Economy of Sugarcane Transgenic Genotypes
Type of the Article	Short Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Clear characteristics of transgenic lines are missing. Which of genes were introduced into transgenic lines and why? Under what promoter? How wild types were selected? Changes in soil moisture during experiments as well as changes in environmental conditions are missing. The characteristics of plant water relations, e.g., relative water content or leaf water potential are missing. Is it not clear how much transpiration rate during water-stress experiment was determined by this water stress or by declined evaporative demand in late autumn. Paper is only descriptive and real discussion is mostly missing.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Abstract is not in precise agreement with main text. In figures it is not clear if values are means of three plants or one plant as example Conclusions are not conclusions but rather discussion.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	These experiments seem to be a part of some large research project and in this case they might be of some value. This must be clearly stated. In other case they are in vain.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Jana Pospisilova</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Institute of Experimental Botany, Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic, Czech Republic</i>