



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_27052
Title of the Manuscript:	AN ASSESSMENT OF TARO YIELD AND STABILITY USING AMMI AND GGE BILOT MODELS
Type of the Article	Original research paper

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments		
Minor REVISION comments	The references used in the study are not now publishing, generally they are old more than 5 years, Please They must be changed or some new references must be add to study. Kendal E and Sener O (2015). Examination of genotype × environment interactions by GGE biplot analysis in spring durum wheat, Indian Journal of Genetics and Plant Breeding, 75(3): 341-348 (2015), DOI: 10.5958/0975-6906.2015.00054.1 Kendal, E. (2015). Determination of relationship between chlorophyll and other features in durum Wheat (<i>Triticum turgidum</i> L. var. durum) using SPAD and biplot analyses. Journal of Agricultural and Technology, Vol. 17(supplementary Issue)-1873-1886. Kendal E (2015). GGE Biplot analysis of Multi-environment Yield Trials in Barley (<i>Hordeum vulgare</i> L) Cultivars. Ekin Journal of Crop Breeding and Genetics, (2016) 2-3:90-99 Kendal E and Dogan Y. (2015). Stability of a Candidate and Cultivars (<i>Hordeum vulgare</i> L) by GGE Biplot analysis of Multi-environment Yield Trials in Spring Barley. Agriculture & Forestry, Vol. 61, Issue 4: 307-318, 2015, Podgorica, DOI: 10.17707/AgricultForest.61.4.37 Mirosavlievic M N, Przulj N, Bocanski, Stanisavlievic D, Mitrovic B 2014. The application of AMMI model for barley cultivars evaluation in multi-year trials. Genetika, Vol: 46, No. 2, 445-454 Kilic H 2014. Additive main effect and multiplicative interactions (AMMI) Analysis of	New refernces based on the materials the Reviewer suggested have been added and the some "old" ones dropped. Annicchiarico P. (1997) is in the text (highlighted in yellow) as against the reviewer's position. Okpul (2005) has been dropped. We have looked at the plagiarism issue raised and checked it with the appropriate software. We have re-written the area quoted from other works, otherwise all we have in this MS is purely our own contribution to Taro improvement.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	grain yield in barley genotypes across environments. J. Agr. Sc. 20,337-344. Hagos GH, Abay F 2013. AMMI and GGE Biplot analysis of bread wheat genotypes in the northern part of Ethiopia. Journal Plant Breeding and Genetic. 01:12.18. Mohammadi M, Karimizadeh R, Noorinia AA, Ghogh H, Hosseinpour T, Khalilzadeh GR, Mehraban A, Roustaii M, Hasanpor Hosni M 2013. Analysis of yield stability in multi-environment trials of barley (<i>Hordeum vulgare</i> L.) genotypes using AMMI model. Current Opinion in Agr. Curr. Opin. Agric. 2(1), 20-24. Rad Nouri MR, Abdulkadir M, Rafii MY, Hawa ZEJ, Naghavi MR, Ahmadi F 2013. Genotype x environment interaction by AMMI and GGE biplot analysis in three consecutive generations of wheat (<i>Triticum aestivum</i>) under normal and drought stress conditions. Australian J. of Crop Science. 7(7):956-961. Rezene Y 2014. GGE and AMMI biplot analysis for field pea yield stability in SNNPR state Ethiopia. International J. of Sustainable Agr. Res.. 1(1):28-38. SOME REFERANCES ARE NOT LOCATED IN THE TEXT Annicchiarico P. (1997): Additive main effects and multiplicative interaction (AMMI) of genotype-location interaction in variety trials repeated over years. Theoretical and Applied Genetics 94, 1072-1077. Okpul T. (2005): Effect of variety × site on corm yield, leaf blight resistance 315 and culinary quality of seven taro, <i>Colocasia esculenta</i> (L.) Schott, varieties in Papua New Guinea. Master of Science Thesis, University of Technology, Lae, Papua New Guinea. Clarify the plagiarism issue: SIMILARITY INDEX OF THIS MS IS 44%, THIS VALUE TOO HIGH AND IS OVER THE ACCEPTABLE VALUES, SO THE MS must check by proofreading http://www.agricultforest.ac.me/data/20151213-	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	37%20Kendal%20and%20Dogan%20REV.pdf http://www.ekinjournal.com/images/bisab/third/EJ_3rd_Issue_Web_All_Pages_90-99.pdf http://www.google.com.tr/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=16&ved=0ahUKEwiZwMDXgYrNAhWH7xQKHS0wDXo4ChAWCDwwBQ&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.indianjournals.com%2Fijor.aspx%3Ftarget%3Dijor%3Aijgpb%26volume%3D75%26issue%3D3%26article%3D010&usg=AFQjCNHszamz1-DlUrJYoS0HH-MZszNZfA&bvm=bv.123325700,d.d24 http://www.google.com.tr/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=16&ved=0ahUKEwiZwMDXgYrNAhWH7xQKHS0wDXo4ChAWCDwwBQ&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.indianjournals.com%2Fijor.aspx%3Ftarget%3Dijor%3Aijgpb%26volume%3D75%26issue%3D3%26article%3D010&usg=AFQjCNHszamz1-DlUrJYoS0HH-MZszNZfA&bvm=bv.123325700,d.d24 http://dergiler.ankara.edu.tr/dergiler/15/2090/21611.pdf http://www.doiserbia.nb.rs/img/doi/0534-0012/2014/0534-00121402445M.pdf http://escijournals.net/JPBG/article/view/50 http://www.arccjournals.com/uploads/articles/ArticleFile-D-4352-2%20(9-16)%20D-4352.pdf http://www.cropj.com/rad_7_7_2013_956_961.pdf http://textlab.io/doc/763055/pdf-download---pak-publishing-group	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Optional/General</u> comments	It was not given enough information about circles in the material and methods section as a table like genotypes information. For genotypes the cods (G1,G2,G3..) can be used both in the table and in the text.Also envrionments too(E1,E2,E3....) The image of the figures is not organized well, They must change with new.(You can look the referances, Kendal, 2015). The explane of the figures which used in under graps should be removed, it must be give in the table..	The different genotypes and what makes up the environments (in a table) have been represented in the materials and methods section of the MS. We have replaced where the environthe were mentioned in the text with the codes (E1, E2...). The issues raised about the figures have been addressed.
--	--	--