



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_26973
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of the Stimulating Paste Conservation Period and Economic Benefit of Ethrel-Palm oil Mixture in Rubber Tree Plantations in South-Eastern Côte d'Ivoire
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. Issues of the experimental design (1) Why ETH/ALM-air-7, but not ETH/ALM-air-Dd, as shown in Table 1, were selected as the control samples, control 1 and control 2, respectively? In addition, ...control 2 (ALM-air-Jj) in Line 105, what is ALM-air-Jj? Whether should be ALM-air-7 ? (2) As mentioned in the manuscript, two stimulant products were prepared and conserved at ambient temperature or cold condition. Please specify explicitly how much temperature for the conservation of the prepared stimulant products in the text especially for the cold condition. (3) The value of pH is a key factor involved in the activeness and efficiency of the stimulant products. Therefore, the pH should be examined before all the stimulant products were applied in the experiments, and listed in Table 1 for the reference of readers. 2. Issues of the plant materials The authors should present a detailed characteristics of the selected pant material, the clone GT 1 rubber trees in the text. It's not clear whether the mature and virgin or regularly tapped rubber trees were selected for this research? If virgin trees were used, please specify how old they are. If they are regularly tapped ones, please specify the tapping ages and whether they were ever stimulated or not with any stimulant products before experiment.	1. Issues of the experimental design (1) ETH-air-7 is the control 1 because a previous study showed that mixture Ethrel and oil palm can be conserved during 7 days without losing its stimulant power. Furthermore, ALM-air-Dd is the control 2 because in the practice the stimulant paste is prepared the day of the stimulation... In line 105, ALM-air-Jj is a mistake ; it is really ALM-air-Dd. (2) The temperature for the cold condition was 4 °C. (3) The pH has not been examined before the stimulant products were applied. 2. Year of planting: 1997 ; year of opening : 2003 ; year of starting the experiment : 2012. The trees were tapped on virgin bark of high panel (S/4U d4). Before the experiment, the trees were tapped in virgin bark in half spiral downward every four days, with one day rest in the week, 12 months on 12 (S/2 d4 6d/7 12 m/12) during nine years. There were stimulated with Ethrel-oil palm at the concentration of 2.5 % of Ethephon.
Minor REVISION comments	1. All the "Dry trees" in the text should be replaced with " Trees with TPD" or "TPD-suffered trees"; 2. In Table 1, ETH-cold-3-----56, these products should	1. All the "Dry trees" and "Dry cuts" in the text were replaced with "Trees with TPD" and "Cuts with TPD"



SDI Review Form 1.6

	be conserved at cold condition not “at room temperature”; and ALM-air-3-----56, these products should be conserved at room temperature not “at cold”, please check them carefully. 3. Whether it’s better that Table 4 and Table 5 is re-organized into one table, so that the general readers could get more obvious information. 4. The paper was poorly written, please consider re-editing it, including polishing the language, correcting the wrong words and sentences etc. 5. Please specify the manufacturer of the two stimulant products, Ethrel and Almephon., in the text.	respectively. 2. The corrections were made. 3. The Tables 4 and 5 were re-organized into one table. 4. The English was improved. 5. The manufacturers of the two stimulant products were specified (ALM West Africa and CFPI).
Optional/General comments		