

Editor's Comments:

Please find the observation/ decision on the V2 of the article under reference for your perusal and needful action.

Associate Editor's observation on article , "Decision support system for runoff water harvesting and irrigation" , V2.

The DSS is based on further extension of less known NAM model. The editor's summary is that the study finds catchment to irrigation command area of known from experimental study in some soil agro-hydrologic condition as 10:1, the water productivity of bean 0.7g/l (0.7kg/m³), known to have low water demand. The agro-hydrology model viz NAM in the Sub Saharan Region in Africa is not so well known in rest part of the world. There is no reference and authors do not describe the NAM model. Hence, it will be difficult to make use of the study by other interested researchers.

Some specific line wise MSS based observations are as under. Authors do not write their Departmental affiliation. The subject of DSS demands finer knowledge of hydrology, irrigation, water conservation reservoirs, irrigation and crop science, which are in generalized form in the article. Thus, the article deals with precision with imprecise data. May be this topic of research is new for Malawi, world over researches on weather, cultivation, irrigation optimizations are plentiful. Further, observations are listed in the table below:

S.No	MSS lines No.	Existing	Observation	Remark
1	Abstract	The DSS result should be clearly given	Case study results should be given and many inferences drawn	The DSS should be free from the scale effect
2	41,50	Malawi	And which other ones	English
3	41-43 and other	Limitations of existing agro-hydrology models	Better to include a table of relative merits and limitations of known DSS models	Quick readership demands this type of MSS
4	55	As above	As above	As above
5	66-68	Objective in specific term	Not specific	Set objective enables whether study could dent the accomplishment of set objectives.
6	91	reference	Not found in list	Be given
7	Was there no rain	Define distribution characteristics	Not revealed	Be given
8	98-99	Too simplified approach	Need specific and precise	Science domain should value this aspect in the Am J Expt Agric.
9	103	Which treatments	Be specific	Needs clarification
10	112	Method of assessment of willingness to pay	Basic of method be cited in a sentence to facilitate readership	It is a standard style of international journal.
11	2.1,74	74 should come after line 114	DSS other components are free from site specificity. The case study is site specific	It needs reorganization
12	127	Fig1	Since it is based on computer simulation why not to use flow charts with standard notations of data read,	The science/engg demands stard notations and flow chart.

			interaction and logic for decisions	
13	149	Fig2	Arrows are not precisely indicative	Needs correction.
14	156	Double mass analysis	If there had been shift in rainfall station it should be mentioned in the data use in experimental case study	This is standard method for find in correct rainfall when there is change in mean rain accumulated rainfall against existing surrounding gauges. This can indicate the effect of climate change in rainfall pattern
15	Fig 3	The comment at s.no.12 is again applicable here	Flow chart might be more rational, widely understandable.	Follow the world over used and accepted convention.
16	167	Not very clear	Why it should be repeated again?	Needs deletion
17	173	Factor values in Table1	It is too much simplified generalization.	
18	199	Double mass analysis	The author's fig and justification do not display need of double mass analysis.	The doublemass analys used to test consistency of three station data should be setout in method as a procedure of DSS.
19	199,210	Trend of Fig in tow double mass analysis	It should be linear, but it is different in Figs.	Authors need to clarify the variation in two Figs trend of lines.
20	224	Gross margin and breakeven	If it is part of simulation a page of the Excel spread set be given as an example case.	It will clarify several doubts.
21	225-229	Margin and breakeven cost	It is a known and applied method of economic analysis	How it is becoming part of DSS should be an integral part of the spread sheet.
22	237	Would like	wished	change
23	245-249	Spread sheet simulation	One full page indicating all variables should be given	It will be an example of all DSS files and complete sheet.
24	250	Table 5	Can be replaced by computer spread sheet	It will add confidence in the readership.
25	Discussion	Discussion supports work and results justification	Discussion absent	Needs include discussion
26	273-275	No introductory sentence is required.	Give results	Follow the convention.
27	282-288	National llevel	May form recommendation and followup action	Recommendation tof lessons learnt be give.
28	Refernce	MIWD,2011	Not found in the reference list	It should be added.

The article should be modified as per these observations. If meticulously carried out, it can be published in the AJEA. Otherwise, it may be tried in any journal of geography.

Editor's detail:

Prof. Ram Charan Yadav

Ex Head CSWCRTI, Research Centre, Agra, India