

Editor's Comment:

I reviewed the original and revised manuscript as well as the reviewers comments. Although the manuscript has interesting data on *Lannea Welwisheii*, the information presented are incomplete and are very difficult to comprehend. The authors are encouraged to revise the text along the following suggestions:

1. The authors did not provide detailed information on the chemical composition of the active ingredient(s) which have relevant pharmacological actions. The authors cited a substance named lanneaquinol as an active ingredient, but we need to know if other active substances are also present in the plant and their relative concentrations.
2. The authors did not provide detailed pharmaceutical information on the methods of their extraction of the active ingredient from the plant. The authors must provide a new section in the manuscript devoted to the pharmaceutical preparation of the dosage forms and the stability of the plant extract dosage forms, if known.
3. In Figure 3, the authors mentioned a cytotoxic metabolite of this plant extract, however, we were not given the chemical structure of this metabolite with respect to other active ingredients.
4. The subchronic toxicity study discussed data on a presumably active component named AD-199. However, we are not told whether AD-199 has beneficial pharmacological action, if any.
5. The authors review of the pharmacology data must include information on what was tested, the pharmaceutical preparations of the extract, the dose of the extract with respect to a presumed active ingredient and a comparative results with active reference standard drugs, i.e., such as morphine quoted in the analgesic studies. Only adequately conducted pharmacological studies in which various doses of the extract was being compared with various doses of a reference drugs must be used in their analyses. Pharmacological testing without comparative reference standards are misleading and should be removed from the manuscript.
6. Therapeutic indices (ED50 of the toxic dose divided by the ED50 of effective doses) calculation are needed to decide whether the plant has useful therapeutic activity, if any, at non toxic doses.

Editor's Details:

Dr. Esam Z. Dajani
President, IDDC Corporation, USA
Adjunct Professor of Medicine, Loyola University Chicago, USA