



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<u>Journal of Advances in Medical and Pharmaceutical Sciences</u>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JAMPS_24382
Title of the Manuscript:	A Comparative Study of the Ameliorative Effects of Skimmed Milk and Tuna Fish in the Dietary Management of Osteoporotic Female Rats
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	General remarks: The script is much improved; there are many minor grammatical and spelling mistakes. Have tried to rake through and indicate these below. Extra edits still needed. The whole Methods and Materials must be re-scripted in the journal style for reading, without numerical headings. See notes on lines 76-146 below. There is an overall lack of discipline in checking and no due diligence to detail. For example (1) they start with 66 rats; ten (10) are separated group 1, leaving the other 50 which are accounted for. Total 60; what happened to the other 6 rats? (2) Also see Lines 175, 218 and 242. Where does "sardine powder" come in?? This is a spurious confounder and an inconsistency which casts doubt on the integrity of the whole experiment. Kindly check and correct this variable. Lines 329-377: DISCUSSION: This section is verbose, over-written and needs to be shortened by at least half. Linking words like meanwhile shd be omitted. Over analysis leads to paralysis. High first class protein combined with adequate calcium in the diet favours minimizing developing OP. Each statement selected shd bear in mind that the statement(s) shd support this, as this insight is the authors. Figures: Obviously much effort went into obtaining these histopathology slides. The slides show clear changes. But these are labeled as "Photo"; they are not	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	photographs, but coloured micrographs. They must be correctly referred to as Figures in the text, and also labeled as a Figure with an explanatory proper legend. See notes below.	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

Minor REVISION comments	Specific Comments: The Ms script is in black. Comments in red. Suggestions in blue. Line 10: Aim: This study was carried out to comparatively investigate the ameliorative effects of skimmed milk and whole dried Tuna fish in osteoporotic female rats. Grammar. Prejudgment shd be avoided. Suggest: This investigation was carried out to compare the moderating effects of skimmed milk and whole dried Tuna fish in osteoporotic female rats. Line 12: Method: Sixty six female albino rats. What strain? Sprague –Dawly? Wistar?; you must mention the strain here, to ensure genetic homogeneity. Some rats may be bred to be OP-prone. This is mentioned later in the M&M of the Ms. Line 27: The best results were observed of rats fed diet supplemented with 10% skimmed milk. Suggest: The best results were observed in rats fed diet supplemented with 10% skimmed milk. Line 34: Osteoporosis (OA) is a disease... Osteoporosis (OP) is a disease Line 34-36: Osteoporosis (OA) is a disease predominantly involving deterioration of articular cartilage which is marked clinically by a gradual onset of pain, stiffness and loss of mobility in synovial (weight-bearing) joints. Does this apply to rats? In humans the intramembranous and cartilaginous derived bone, (as cortex and trabeculae) and the juxtaposed bone forming cartilage are also affected. Suggest: Osteoporosis (OP) is a disease predominantly involving deterioration of cartilage and bone; the loss of articular cartilage is marked clinically by a gradual onset of pain, stiffness and loss of mobility in synovial (weight-bearing) joints. Line 36: The therapeutic approach is mainly at the relief of symptoms. Suggest:- The therapeutic approach is targeted	
---------------------------------------	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	mainly at the relief of symptoms. Line 41: Osteoporosis is a major complication in patients who requires chronic glucocorticoid treatment [4]. Sense not clear. Suggest: Osteoporosis is a major complication in patients who are usually treated with chronic glucocorticoid treatment [4]. Line 47: ... that about 44 million Americans or 55 % of people 50 years and alder are both osteoporosis and low bone mass [7]. Grammar and spelling. Suggest: ...that about 44 million Americans or 55 % of people 50 years and older are both osteoporotic with low bone mass [7]. Line 83: (without head) was ...(without heads) were... Line 93: Table 1: This has a heading. It also needs an explanatory legend at the bottom which must include all the notes on the minerals and vitamins. Suggest: Table 1: Composition (g/kg) of the basal diet (BD). Note: Group 2 had skimmed milk, Group 4 and Group 5 had 15g/kg and 30g/kg respectively. Vitamins etc etc Lines 76-145. Change of style and numerical headings. THIS IS AN ARTICLE for a scientific journal to be read; this seems to have been exerpted from a thesis or lab-report. The headings must be clear and numerals minimized or removed. Line 175: 5% sardine fish powder....the variable is dried Tuna fish!!! Where does sardine powder come in?? Line 218: Table 5 shows the effect of skimmed milk and dried sardine fish..... the variable is Tuna!!! Where does sardine powder come in?? Line 242: Table 6 shows the effect of skimmed milk and dried	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	sardine fish powder on calcium..... the variable is Tuna!!! Line 301: Photo 2: Photomicrograph of femur of experimental rats from positive control group showing thin bone cortex and dilatation of bone marrow cavity (H and E x 200). Suggest:- Figure 2: Photomicrograph of femur of experimental rats from positive control group showing thin bone cortex (black arrow) and dilatation of bone marrow cavity (H and E x 200). Line 306: Photo 3: Photomicrograph of femur of rats from positive control group showing cracks and necrosis in bony cortex (H and E x 200).Suggest: Figure 3: Photomicrograph of femur of rats from positive control group showing cracks and necrosis (black arrows) in bony cortex (H and E x 200). Lines 287: Photo 1: These are micrographs of histology slides. Suggest: Figure 1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8, etc. Each Figure must have its own legend: Suggested examples: Figure 1: Photomicrograph of femur of experimental rats from negative control group showing no histopathological changes . White horizontal lines of scale are discernable. (H and E x 200). Figure 2: Photo 2: Photomicrograph of femur of experimental rats from positive control group showing thin bone cortex and dilatation of bone marrow cavity (H and E x 200). Suggest: Figure 2: Photomicrograph of femur of experimental rats from positive control group showing thin bone cortex (arrow) and dilatation of bone marrow cavity (H and E x 200). Line 348 {31}....[31] Lines 465;466;467;470;472;476. Refer to Figures 1;2;3;4;5;6; etc	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Line 482: These findings show that skimmed milk and Tuna fish are effective in positively moderate metabolic dysfunctions associated with osteoporosis in DOPI rats. 10% skimmed milk dietary supplementation is more therapeutically effective compared with the other three methods. This may have implications for humans, which indicates for more research into this important field of medicine. Suggest: . These findings show skimmed milk and Tuna fish are effective at positively moderating metabolic dysfunctions associated with osteoporosis in DOPI rats. 10% skimmed milk dietary supplementation is more therapeutically beneficial when compared with the other three methods. This may have implications for humans, which indicates for more research into this important field of medicine.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	This is a good piece of research and shd be improved before proceeding to publishing; it still needs sound detailed revision	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	McGill University, Canada