



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                   |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Journal of Advances in Medical and Pharmaceutical Sciences</a>                                        |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_JAMPS_28571</b>                                                                                             |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Hepatoprotective activity of Nigella sativa oil against Antitubercular drug-induced Hepatotoxicity in Rats</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original Research Article</b>                                                                                  |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                        | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b><br>REVISION comments | <p>1) This study lacked a positive control group in which animals are treated simultaneous with an appropriate reference drug and the two antitubercular drugs.</p> <p>2) Figure 1 presented the macroscopic structure of the liver after different treatment. These results have nothing to do with the histological study described in the section 1.4 (Grading liver) of "Material and methods". As described in this section, the authors are supposed to present in the "Results", histological preparations of the liver after different treatments, not liver structure.</p> <p>3) Authors only established comparison between treated groups and the control group (Tables 1 and 2). As they did not make statistical comparison between the group of animals treated with the antitubercular drugs and the group of animals treated with both <i>Nigella sativa</i> oil and the antitubercular drugs, how could they conclude on the hepatoprotective activity of <i>Nigella sativa</i> oil?</p> <p>4) It seems like the administration of <i>Nigella sativa</i> oil (drug control) resulted in a modification of the activity of liver enzymes (see Table 2). Sub-acute toxicity study of <i>N. sativa</i> oil is then essential.</p> <p>5) the authors stipulated in the "Discussion" that the combination of isoniazid and rifampicin treatment in experimental animals enhanced lipid peroxidation, indicating increased oxidative stress in liver. Why don't they assay oxidative stress biomarkers in the liver after different treatments?</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. You are sir true that we should have kept a positive control which we did not. We can do this in the future studies.</li> <li>2. Yes fig. 1 represents microscopic structure of the liver not the histopathological study. So there is no histopathological study.</li> <li>3. Statistical comparison is now made between the groups of animals treated with the antitubercular drugs and the group of animals treated with both <i>Nigella sativa</i> oil and the antitubercular drugs.</li> <li>4. There is some modification in the activity of liver enzymes but at that time sub acute toxicity of NSO was not in mind.</li> <li>5. At the time of experiment it was thought that the treatment of N. Sativa oil may protect the liver due to the production of marker enzymes that is why we only performed marker enzymes and not lipid peroxidation. Lipid peroxidation is one of the mechanism of liver damage but our aim was the detoxification mechanism of the N. Sativa oil that is why we did not perform the lipid peroxidation test.</li> </ol> |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |