



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Journal of Advances in Medical and Pharmaceutical Sciences
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JAMPS_24382
Title of the Manuscript:	A Comparative Study of the Ameliorative Effects of Skimmed Milk and Tuna Fish in the Dietary Management of Osteoporotic Female Rats
Type of Article	Original Research Article

PART 2:

EBM1 comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The paragraph INTRODUCTION must be rewritten because the word "osteoporosis" is cited too many times. Put in order the concept: "Osteoporosis is considered a public health problem of major concern and it is characterized by decreased bone density which results in skeletal fragility and fractures [3]." In the United State, ... should be cited at first, then the clinical aspect and finally the therapeutics approach. Line 56-66. Effect of nutrition and bone is complex and not well explained. Line 60-66. Fish are very beneficial for bone health.... It needs a specification what this beneficial is. Tuna fish has a high prevalence of selenium, Vitamin B3, B12, B6, etc. the calcium is not so highly present in salmon and tuna. Calcium percentage is modest, only 1%. Line 118. The hormonal changes before and after treatment are not reported. This comparison is essential to demonstrate any effect. References mistake: the ref.13 does not exist (13. Torben, L, Shakuntala, H, Katja, K. Whole small fish are rich calcium source. British Journal of Nutrition.1999; 83(8): 191-196) and the ref. 9 its'n complete (9. Rizzoli, R,Boonen S,Brand ML et al. The role of calcium and vitamin D in the management of osteoporosis. 2008; 42: 246- 249). In the table 2 calcium, phosphorus and protein concentrations of skimmed milk and dried tuna fish powder how is calculated. Generally, tuna fish fresh (60% of water contain 38mg/100gr, and phosphorus 264 mg/100 gr. In table 5 the difference in the changes of hormones levels should be reported before and after diet supplementation, an histogram can help the readers. Immunohistochemical analysis is very important to demonstrate the changes in bone tissue and in this article the methodology is insufficient (see Wittenburg G et al. J Physiol Pharmacol. 2009, Knabe, C. et al. Biotech Histochem. 2006, Yang R et al Eur Cell Mater. 2003 The use of immunohistochemistry on sections of bone can provide a convenient and reliable method that can be used routinely and shows fantastic images of bone tissue and cells.	We have rewritten the INTRODUCTION in line with your comments in this format: introduction, clinical aspect and therapeutic approach. The effect of nutrition and bone was also explained. The hormonal changes before treatment was not measured in the course of the experiments hence no data to compare with hormonal changes after treatment. Our research model was modelled after comparing the hormonal changes of untreated induced osteoporotic Wistar rats with groups administered skimmed milk and dried Tuna fish. The anomaly in the 2 references was also corrected. The method used for the determination of calcium, phosphorus and protein concentrations of skimmed milk and dried tuna fish powder were stated I the manuscript. We used fresh Tuna locally processed into powder as described in the manuscript. The use of immunochemistry in demonstrating changes in the bone tissue is innovative. It is a method we are hopeful of trying out in our future research works. However, for the current research, we have exhausted all the bone tissues for histological analysis. We wish to thank you for your meticulous approach to reviewing our manuscript, your constructive criticisms that enabled us to improve the manuscript and also the knowledge we gained by exploring further our scope of this current research. We appeal that having significantly improved this paper, that we receive your acceptance for its publication. Thank you.