



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Advances in Mathematics and Computer Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JAMCS_36521
Title of the Manuscript:	Achieving System Reliability with the Fewest Identical Components
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	This paper presents an explicit polynomially bounded algorithm for a special class of redundancy allocation models. It is meaningful. But this paper must be done major revision as follows: 1) Introduction of redundancy allocation is not enough, many important references should be added. 2) There in no Definition 3.1. Section 4 should be rewritten to add the description of computing optimal solutions. 3) More examples should be added in Section 5. 4) Add some analysis comparison figures in Section 5. 5) Reference is not enough, some references before 2007 are out-of-date, they should be deleted. Many important recent references are missing, the following references must be totally added in Section "References" : [1] Xiang Wang, Xiaodong Song. New Clustering Routing Method Based on PECE for WSN. EURASIP Journal on Wireless Communications and Networking, 2015, 2015(162):1-13. DOI: 10.1186/s13638-015-0399-x [2] Degan Zhang, Guang Li, Ke Zheng. An energy-balanced routing method based on forward-aware factor for Wireless Sensor Network. IEEE Transactions on Industrial Informatics, 2014, 10(1):766-773 [3] Degan Zhang, Xiang Wang, Xiaodong Song. A Novel Approach to Mapped Correlation of ID for RFID Anti-collision. IEEE Transactions on Services Computing, 2014, 7(4):741-748 [4] Yanan Zhu. A new constructing approach for a weighted topology of wireless sensor networks based on local-world theory for the Internet of Things (IOT). Computers & Mathematics with Applications, 2012, 64(5):1044-1055 [5] Yanping Liang. A kind of novel method of service-aware computing for uncertain mobile applications. Mathematical and Computer Modelling, 2013, 57(3-4):344-356 [6] Xiaodan Zhang. Design and implementation of embedded un-interruptible power supply system (EUPSS) for web-based mobile application. Enterprise Information Systems, 2012, 6(4):473-489 [7] Degan Zhang. A new approach and system for attentive mobile learning based on seamless migration. Applied Intelligence, 2012, 36(1):75-89 [8] Ke Zheng, Dexin Zhao. Novel Quick Start (QS) Method for Optimization of TCP. Wireless Networks, 2016, 22(1):211-222. [9] Xuejing Kang. A novel image de-noising method based on spherical coordinates system, EURASIP Journal on Advances in Signal Processing, 2012, 2012(110):1-10 DOI: 10.1186/1687-6180-2012-110 [10] Xiaodong Song, Xiang Wang. New Agent-based Proactive Migration Method and System for Big Data Environment (BDE). Engineering Computations, 2015, 32(8):2443-2466 [12] Ke Zheng, Ting Zhang. A Novel Multicast Routing Method with Minimum Transmission for WSN	I am very grateful to this referee for taking the time to read through my manuscript. However, the proposal to add 15 more current references is inappropriate for many reasons; for one, the content of the proposed references is not related to the content of my work. For instance, - Proposed reference 9 is an open-access paper. Its key words do not overlap my work and a full-text search produces no occurrences of "reliability" or "redundancy". Among the 19 references in the paper, 5 were published before 2000. - Proposed references 2 and 3 though available through IEEE Xplore, their key words do not overlap my work and full-text searches produce no occurrences of "reliability" or "redundancy." The oldest reference in the second proposed reference is dated 1960 and the oldest reference in the third proposed reference is dated 1983. Thus, the proposal to eliminate older references is not even consistent with the reviewer's suggested references. Certainly, the body of work cited in the proposed references is distinguished, as evidence by citations and funding from sponsors. However, it deals with an unrelated topic. Furthermore, the extensive bibliography in Soltani, one of the references in my bibliography, runs for more than ten pages. Thus, it affords the interested reader adequate access to related literature. Also, given the huge volume of papers on redundancy allocations in my references, I do offer my readers a direct route to my specific project. Consequently, I respectfully decline this reviewer's remedies for the introduction and more references. I could not see the reviewer's concern about Section 4; I thought that the comments that precede Proposition 4.1 shared lights on the procedure in the proof of the algorithm. Nonetheless, I made another attempt at clarifying it. Concerning the comment on there not being Definition 3.1, the reviewer would agree that the labelling is consistent with labelling in the literature. For example, see the labelling in Section 3 of Baxter and Harche (bibliographic item #5) in my work. On the other hand, I accept the reviewer's recommendation for more examples in Section 5; hence, I added Table 5.2, showing variation in R as well as in the other parameters. Because a complete sensitivity analysis is beyond the scope of this paper, I respectively decline to conduct a complete sensitivity analysis herein.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	of Cloud Computing Service. Soft Computing, 2015,19(7):1817-1827. [13] Zhao C P. A new medium access control protocol based on perceived data reliability and spatial correlation in wireless sensor network. Computers & Electrical Engineering.2012,38(3):694-702 [14] Ma Z. Shadow Detection of Moving Objects Based on Multisource Information in Internet of Things. Journal of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence. 2017,29(3):649-661. [15] Si Liu,Ting Zhang. Novel Unequal Clustering Routing Protocol Considering Energy Balancing Based on Network Partition & Distance for Mobile Education, Journal of Network and Computer Applications, 2017,88(15):1-9 DOI:10.1016/j.jnca.2017.03.025 6) Polish the whole paper.	Furthermore, while I did not fully understand what this reviewer meant by “Polish the whole paper”, I made as much revision as is feasible and compatible with suggestions by other reviewers. Again, I am grateful to this reviewer for his/her contribution to my manuscript.
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		