



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Agriculture and Ecology Research International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JAERI_41754
Title of the Manuscript:	Growth and yield response of some rice genotype under different duration of complete submergence
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Comments on the manuscript " Growth and yield response of some rice genotype under different duration of complete submergence" The objective of the study was to observe the effect of complete submergence at vegetative stage of plants for different duration on the growth and yield of some rice varieties and the experiment was conducted in a randomized complete block design having split plot arrangement with three replications and the number of genotypes tested are six. The authors concluded that two genotypes are tolerant while two are susceptible to submergence stress. The comments are: 1. The field data presented is only from one experiment only. To make any conclusions, the data from two seasons is necessary to confirm the findings. The number of entries (6) is low for identification of donors/or to draw any conclusions. 2. The experiment was conducted in 2017 (line 62). Though many varieties with <i>sub 1</i> are available in all the countries, none of them were used in the study so as to make relative yield reductions in the genotypes under study. The yield losses due to submergence stress in rice are well documented and the utility of <i>sub 1</i> QTL and the <i>sub 1</i> introgressed varieties is now well known. 3. The authors stated that the rice genotypes tested are aman varieties. But the data shows that they flowered around 70 d and can mature in 100+ days. 4. The experiment was not conducted as per the established protocol of IRRI, which is generally followed all over the world.	1. Field data presented is only from one experiment because Transplanting Aman rice are grown from June to September at the peak period of monsoon rainfall. As a result following seedling transplantation as well as at early vegetative stage of the aman rice is often completely submerged by flash flood. So, one experiment in flood season is enough for this research conclusion. 2. Six rice varieties were used for this experiment. Among them BRRI dhan51 is submergence tolerant which is released by BARI. I try to compare this variety with other 5 inbred and hybrid varieties. 3. The modern high yielding transplanting aman rice were used in this experiment that are quite different (morphology) from local aman rice varieties. For this reasons data showed that they flowered around 70 d and can mature in 100+ days. 4. We conducted our experiment in natural flooding (submergence) condition that is main fact. We think that the methodology was good for conducting this experiment.
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		