



SDI Review Form 1.6

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a>                                                                                                                             |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_IJTDH_38538                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Antimicrobial susceptibility profiles and molecular Characterization of Salmonella isolated from fecal matter of Cattle in Chiang Mai, Thailand and their relatedness to human Salmonella isolates |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                                                                          |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>The objective of the current study was to isolate of <i>Salmonella</i> from fecal samples of slaughter cattle in Chiang Mai, to test for some serotypes and antimicrobial resistance of the isolates and compare with some human isolates.</p> <p>There is no information about the abattoir in terms of hygienic status, capacity etc.</p> <p>Also , the sampling method including the number of the visits, the number of the samples collected at each visits, the origin of the animals whether they are from same herds etc. is not sufficient.</p> <p>The aim of collecting blood samples from patients at a provincial hospital is not described well and there is not sufficient information about the health status and severity of the disease of the patients. Because there are some blood samples of human found positive for salmonellae which might be a serious bacteremia situation. It is also hard to understand to find out a close link between the human-animal salmonellosis based on the findings of this study, because this study in its current form can not provide enough epidemiological data to make a reliable assessment.</p> <p>Conventional culture method including four biochemical tests was used for the isolation of salmonellae, but polyvalent anti-serum test is not performed.</p> <p>It is not well discussed the high incidence of salmonellae around 22.6 % in the fecal samples of cattle, and also the authors found only three different serotypes. It should be discussed extensively about the high number of positive samples with possible underlying causes. The explanations about high prevalence and serotype distribution (only three) in this study are poor.</p> | <p>We thank the reviewer for the comments.</p> <p>Chiang Mai municipal slaughter house complex is certified by the Department of Livestock, Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperative, Thailand. The hygienic status must be accordance with the Regulations. As we have known, the capacity of slaughter house complex is 100 animal per day. The origin of animals were from different part of the city as described in method.</p> <p>Our focus for this study based on the possibility of <i>Salmonella</i> transmission from cattle to humans. We provided information related to Salmonella infection cases from Chiang Mai provincial hospital from June to September 2017 in the manuscript. The isolation of human blood was not our main focus in the study. However, this study was provided primary investigation. We have stated that the further studies of molecular epidemiology should be conducted as described in discussion.</p> <p>In this study, conventional culture method was used for isolation and DNA sequencing was performed for identification.</p> <p>The high prevalence of Salmonella founded in this study are higher than those reported in previous study. The difference may be from many factors as discussed in the manuscript.</p> <p>Serotype distribution in this study was not much but similar to previous study in Sakon Nakorn, Thailand which was only one serovar isolated from cattle (28).</p> <p>As we described in manuscript, The regular surveillance programs and information on the prevalence of <i>Salmonella</i> in animals in Thailand are limited. Moreover, we have known very little about Salmonella transmission between animal and humans. The data from our study is preliminary report. Further studies must be conducted.</p> <p>However, information from our study is valuable. It may be beneficial for Salmonella surveillance in future.</p> |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |