



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a>                                                                   |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_IJTDH_37809                                                                                                                           |
| Title of the Manuscript: | PATTERN OF BEDNET OWNERSHIP AND USAGE OF INSECTICIDE TREATED BEDNET (ITN) AMONG PREGNANT WOMEN IN NIGERIA (REVIEW OF 2003 AND 2008 NDHS) |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>In the Methods section, the authors state that 883 and 3397 pregnant women were interviewed in 2003 and 2008, respectively. In the Results section, the responses of 848 and 3547 pregnant women were analysed. The discrepancy between these numbers of pregnant women in 2003 (883-848=35) and 2008 (3397-3547=-150) should be explained.</p> <p>Table 2 does not contain a lot of data, and a single sentence describes the results presented in Table 2. It should be combined with either Table 1 or Table 3. Please explain why the total numbers of women in 2003 and 2008 are different from those in Table 1. Because the response of a woman is either "yes" or "no," there is no need to present the number and frequency of both yes and no. Please just provide the data for "yes." The second row (variable) should be "Number (frequency, %)" and not just "frequency (%)." The P value cannot be 0 with chi-square value of 41. Is it <math>P &lt; 0.05</math>? Please also check the text "The pattern was statistically significant, <math>\chi^2 = 41.07</math>, <math>P = 0</math>."</p> <p>Table 3: Only the data on "yes" can be presented because the response (Yes/No) is mutually exclusive. For "literacy": "cannot read at all" OR "illiterate"; "can read partly" OR "partly illiterate." The text corresponding to Table 3 is excessively long (almost 2 manuscript pages). Since data in Table 3 are clearly presented, the corresponding text can be considerably shortened to highlight only the essential findings.</p> <p>Table 4: Same comment as for Table 2. The results are described in a single sentence in the text. The number and frequency for "No" can be deleted. Data in Table 4 should be incorporated into Table 3.</p> <p>Table 5: Similar comments as for Table 3. Only the data on "yes" can be presented. The text describing the data in Table 5 runs through 2 manuscript pages. It is too long for data that are clearly presented.</p> <p>Table 6 should be part of Table 5. The row on "No" can be deleted. Likewise, readers do not need to see the chi-square values. P value should be presented as "<math>P &lt; 0.05</math>." This comment applies to all other tables.</p> <p>Table 5 and Table 7 present similar data. One of these tables should be deleted. The text mentions: "continuation of Table 7: pattern in association between socio-demographic variables and SP uptake from 2003 and 2008." I did not see any data on SP.</p> <p>In all tables and throughout the text, the P values are expressed up to 7 decimal places. This is not necessary. To simplify data presentation in this manuscript, P values can be more simply presented as either "<math>P &gt; 0.05</math>" or "<math>P &lt; 0.05</math>".</p> |                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments      | <p>Abbreviations: NDHS, ANC, SES, DRC, FGD: Please explain what the abbreviations stand for when they are first mentioned in the text.</p> <p>Introduction, "Malaria... responsible for about 3,000 deaths per day worldwide (Syed et al., 2009)": The reference Syed et al., 2009 was a study carried out in Bangladesh. The statement should be supported by a reference that covers the whole world, for example, the latest WHO World Malaria Report.</p> <p>Introduction, "species" in both the singular and the plural form</p> <p>Methods, "...the unit of enquiry were pregnant women": the unit of enquiry WAS or the</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                      |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                  | <p>unitS of enquiry were</p> <p>Results, age: The mean age should be expressed to one decimal place, 27.0 in 2003 and 27.1 in 2008.</p> <p>Results, Table 1: Reference to Table 1 should be included in the main text. For example, "The responses of a total of 848 and 3547 pregnant women were analysed in 2003 and 2008, respectively (Table 1)." Moreover, in the Table, the second row (variable) should be "Number (frequency, %)" and not just "frequency (%)." The "wealth index" needs further explanations, which can be added in the Table legend. What are the definitions of the terms "poorest," "poorer," "middle," "richer," and "richest."? If available, please add the data on the number of pregnancies (first pregnancy, second, third, etc.).</p> <p>Results, just before Table 3: "Christians" (not "Christiana")</p> <p>Discussion, "WHO recommendS that... at least two bednetS..."</p> <p>Discussion, "The age of the respondents..." to "...25 years for 2003 and 2008 respectively": Please delete these results which were already presented in the Results section.</p> <p>Discussion, Pattern of bednet ownership among pregnant women: "Education of the respondents and their partners followS ..."</p> <p>Discussion, Pattern of bednet usage among pregnant women: "There WAS NO (not "wasn't") significant effect"</p> <p>Discussion, "Pattern of bednet usage among pregnant women" and "Pattern of ITN usage among pregnant women":</p> <p>References, Baume et al., 2009 and Pettifor et al., 2008. Please change the format so that their family names are in alphabetical order.</p> <p>Please provide an ethical statement in the text.</p> |  |
| <u>Optional/General</u> comments | <p>The authors evaluated the effectiveness of an intervention based on the mass distribution of insecticide-treated bed nets among pregnant women in Nigeria in 2003 and 2008. Pregnant women were selected for interview using a cluster design involving 883 and 3397 women in 2003 and 2008, respectively.</p> <p>The results are clearly presented, but the Tables are not well constructed. The Results section is much too long. Likewise, Discussion is too long and repetitive.</p> <p>The authors should add their Conclusions.</p> <p>English needs minor corrections.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |

Reviewer Details:

|                                  |                                         |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>Leonardo Basco</b>                   |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Aix-Marseille Université, France</b> |