



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJTDH_27212
Title of the Manuscript:	Prognostic value of Serum Estrogen, Cortisol, Calcium and Alkaline Phosphatase Activity in Pre and Postmenopausal HIV Women at Nnewi, Nigeria
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	No article is published in PubMed regarding osteoporosis/alkaline phosphatase in the setting of HIV infection and menopause, what highlights the relevance of the results included in the present manuscript. Nevertheless, the manuscript needs extensive review: not only in terms of the English language but also in terms of aims definition, coherence along the text (most particularly in what regards results description and their discussion) and ideas organization. Please when reorganizing the discussion section, consider what would be expected to obtain for the parameters evaluated assuming that HIV infection is associated with osteoporosis, check if the results obtained matched the expectations and then discuss the results taking into consideration what is published in this context. Results. Figure 1 should include symbols for the statistical	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	significances found for alkaline phosphatase and cortisol. Figure 2 should include symbols for the statistical significances found for estrogen and cortisol. Figure 3 should include a symbol for the statistical significance found for estrogen. CD4 results should be removed from Figure 3, because their high values make almost impossible to perceive the other parameter columns. CD4 results should be given only in the text. Discussion. Lines 148-156. There are quite a lot of published articles on bone impairment/osteoporosis and alkaline phosphatase although there are just a few published studies on osteoporosis and alkaline phosphatase in the setting of HIV infection (21 in PubMed). Does the entire 1st paragraph of the discussion relate to osteoporosis in HIV patients? If so, this should be made clearer. If not, the last section of the 1st paragraph should be corrected/adjusted. Estrogen is protective against and not an inducer of	All these have been corrected and shown in Tables. Details of the CD4 results has been shown. Discussion Line 148-156 have been clarified. The first paragraph of discussion has been removed.
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	bone resorption. Lines 174-175. So the sentence “Therefore estrogen induces apoptic death of osteoclasts, increases osteoprogesterin production thus leading to bone resorption [17]” should be corrected/adjusted. Lines 191-192. The sentence “The mean serum level of calcium in HIV infected premenopausal females was found to be statistically decreased than in those of premenopausal control.” should be corrected/adjusted since there is no difference in calcium levels in Figure 1 neither in the text of the results section. Lines 209-213. “The insignificant difference observed in the mean serum alkaline phosphatase activity between HIV-infected postmenopausal females and their Control counterpart was similar to the research work carried out by Gibellini et al., [26]. The authors explained that the magnitude of bone alkaline phosphatase decreases in population of postmenopausal females with normalization to premenopausal levels.” I do not understand what the authors of the manuscript under review meant to explain here in this section of the discussion.	Line 174-175, have been clarified and corrected. Line 191-192 have been corrected Lies 209-213 have been clarified and corrected
--	--	---

	Line 228-230. “This study reveals that premenopausal and postmenopausal women with HIV infection have reduced estrogen and higher levels of cortisol and alkaline phosphatase activity when compared with premenopausal and postmenopausal Control female subjects.” This sentence in the conclusion section does not adequately summarize the results obtained. References section. Reference 25 does not match to what is mentioned in the discussion section. The same for reference 17 in Line 175: “Therefore estrogen induces apoptic death of osteoclasts, increases osteoprogesterin production thus leading to bone resorption [17].” Ethical Issues: Yes. A human study was conducted but ethical approval was obtained from the adequate local commission.	Line 228-230 have corrected. Reference section has been revised Ethical issues was also considered
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		