



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a>                                                   |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_IJTDH_27298</b>                                                                                                    |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Clostridium Difficile infection in immunocompromised and non-immunocompromised Hosts – a single-center Experience</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original Research Article</b>                                                                                         |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                            | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <b>Overall, a lovely study of CDI in an Asian population stratified by immunocompromised versus non-immunocompromised.</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments      | <p>Revision of some of the language is necessary:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Abstract. Line 25 replace 'remarkable' with 'significant'?</li> <li>2. Abstract line 27-28. Last sentence delete 'that adds information, etc' and replace with 'this paper'.</li> <li>3. Methods, page 4. Description of your hospital is too repetitive. Delete 'situation in the ...New Territories'. Sufficient to say tertiary hospital in Hong Kong serving over 1 million patients.</li> <li>4. Methods. Phrasing awkward throughout text for describing the CD diagnosis method. Suggest saying 'a positive PCR test for toxigenic C. difficile...'</li> <li>5. Methods, page 4, line 75. 'with bowel open' is not a good English phrase. Revise to 'well-formed stool &lt;3 bowel movements/day'</li> <li>6. Page 5, Definition section. See comment 4.</li> <li>7. Page 5, line 90. Revised to 'A CDI case was defined as a healthcare facility-related...'</li> <li>8. Methods. Please find what authors mean by 'hostel' and how this facility is different than a hospital. Does this mean a long-term care facility? Hospice?</li> <li>9. Methods, page 6, please provide citation for your PCR method and add that this is a PCR method when describing your kit.</li> <li>10. Methods. Since authors state this was a well-powered</li> </ol> |                                                                                                                                                                                      |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | <p>study, please give sample size calculation in methods.</p> <p>11. Results, line 8, line 144. All patients have an immune status, please revise sentence by adding 'associated with an <i>altered</i> immune status,.'</p> <p>12. Disease Outcomes, page 9., line 163. Please spell out DM.</p> <p>13. Disease Outcomes, page 9, line 168-171. Unclear sentence. Do authors want to say 'clinicians took longer to diagnose CDI in the immunocompromised patients (mean....)'</p> <p>14. In Results, risk factors for Mortality. Please revise text, as hostel residency is not significant (CI include 1.0) in multivariate model. Hostel is risk factor for recurrence only.</p> <p>15. Page 11, Discussion line 197. Awkward sentence. Suggest '...mortality rate was 27.7%, which is similar to mortality rates reported in other countries.' Then provide some citations and rates here.</p> <p>16. Discussion, page 11, line 204. Replace 'hostile' with 'severe'.</p> <p>17. Discussion, page 12, line 209-213. These sentences are also unclear and awkward. Revise.</p> <p>18. Discussion, page 12, line 219-220. Suggest revising to 'Increasing age, particularly over 65 years of age, is associated with...'</p> <p>19. Discussion, page 12, line 224. Authors can just point out that older age was not a risk factor once other confounding factors were adjusted for in the multivariate model.</p> <p>20. Discussion, page 13, line 229. Revise to 'treatment failure rate in the literature varies from 2%...'</p> <p>21. Discussion, page 14. Please include a discussion of how 'hostel' patients may have less exposure to C. difficile spores? We find high rates of environmental contamination of CD spores in our long-term care</p> |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |  |
|-----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                         | <p>facilities.</p> <p>22. Page 15,lines 271-274. Do not pool together the risk factors for mortality and recurrences as these turned out to be very different. Please provide risk factors in 2 sentences, separate by outcome.</p> <p>23. Table 1. Please delete text on the bottom of the table (lines 413-416) as this is given in the main text. Please define all abbreviations in the footnote, not just a few.</p> <p>24. I'm not sure you need Table 2, as this description could easily be given in the text under 'results'....</p> <p>25. Discussion-since this is the first study to describe CDI in a completely Asian population, can authors cite and describe how their outcomes were different or similar and give a few examples? This would be very interesting.</p> |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | <p>Overall, nice description of Asian patients with CDI. The text needs some polishing on English language.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |  |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                                           |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>Lynne McFarland</b>                                    |
| Department, University & Country | <b>University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, USA</b> |