



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a>                                                                                         |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_IJTDH_27040</b>                                                                                                                                          |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Parasitological Assessment and Public Health Implications of Water used for Domestic Purposes in Ebonyi Local Government Area of Ebonyi State, Nigeria.</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original Research Article</b>                                                                                                                               |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|--------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <p><b>Ethical Issues:</b> There is no statement whether authors obtained permission from the Ebonyi Local Government of Ebonyi State to conduct the research.</p> <p><b>Plagiarism issue: <u>Plagiarism and data falsification are obvious in this manuscript.</u></b></p> <p>This work was done in one month (September 2014 to October 2014) from April to October which is the rainy season. This is just one half of the story, i.e. the study should have included October to April, dry season as well. Because this was not done the data is inconclusive. By all fairness a one month study is too short to be an original research article.</p> <p>What is the population of Ebonyi State? Where do Ebonyi state inhabitants dispose of their excreta? Do they do it in the open?</p> <p>How many wells, boreholes, streams, ponds were included in the study?</p> <p><b><u>Authors state that eggs/cysts/larvae of parasites observed in the study.</u></b> When I checked in Google I found that all six plates have been stolen</p> | <p>Permission was duly sort and obtained from the Public Health Department of Ebonyi Local Government Area of Ebonyi State, Nigeria.</p> <p>The study was not a one-month study but about two months as we started early September and concluded late October. The period was deliberately chosen so as to reduce a lot of confounding factors resulting from heavy flooding associated with the peak of rainy season.</p> <p>We never said that the study was for the whole of Ebonyi State. Ebonyi State has 13 Local Government Areas, but the study was just for Ebonyi Local Government Area. Four communities were randomly selected from the Local Government Area out of which one each of wells, boreholes, streams and ponds was selected for the study, making a total of 4 wells, 4 boreholes, 4 streams and 4 ponds. The state capital has a central place for waste disposal; however, rural communities such as those in Ebonyi L.G.A. dispose wastes indiscriminately in drainage channels, farmlands and also open defecation is a common practice in this part of the state.</p> <p>As for the plates, note that the images you</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                         | <p>from Google. [access Google, type any of the 6 plates, enter and you will see in picture what you asked for]. This is serious plagiarism. Therefore authors did not see what they state they saw. They did not do this work; if they did they are falsifying the data. There are some of the parasites (e.g. <i>Strongyloides stercoralis</i>, <i>Diphyllobothrium latum</i>) that are hard to see their eggs/cysts/larvae even by the trained eye. How did authors discriminate <i>Entamoeba histolytica</i> from <i>Entamoeba dispar</i>?</p> | <p>see are charts we used to compare our observations. We never said that they were from our personal studies. We could not place our own pictures because they were not taken, as photographing was remembered only during result compilation and there was nothing we could do.</p> <p>This work is part of a Masters Degree Research project submitted to the postgraduate school of Ebonyi State University, Abakaliki, Nigeria. The postgraduate school duly checked the work for plagiarism before acceptance.</p> |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |