



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_33835
Title of the Manuscript:	Assessment of land suitability and water requirements for different crops in Dakhla Oasis, Western Desert, Egypt
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Methodology need clarity regarding soil survey. Try to include kind of survey, scale of map used, intensity of sampling, how 31 profiles studied in 555.27 km ² . How many soil series identified ? What kind of the soil landscape relationships exist ? What are the mapping units? Then how land evaluation did considering soil-site parameters with the existing crops and their yield trends in the region ?	• A semi-detailed soil survey was done using a 1 : 100,000 map • Excluding the plateau, the remaining area is about 500 km². Profiles were distributed on the remainin landscape. The distribution was performed according to the total area as follows: 3 profiles in the pediplain; 7 profiles in the Aeolian plain, and 21 profile in the depression (60%of the total area) • Soil series is a group of soils or poly-pedons that have horizons similar in arrangement and in differentiating characteristics. The soils of a series have a relatively narrow range in sets of properties. The area of study contains 4 soil series • The pediplain is an erosional landscape It is found as a foot slope of the plateaus, hills, and mountains. This plain is usually covered with pediments and soil materials forming soils with moderately deep to shallow profiles. • The depression is depositional landscape depressed below the surrounding area. It is formed by the actions of wind and water which carry soil particle and deposit in the low-lying area of the depression. • The Aeolian plain is depositional landscape formed by Aeolian deposits. It is built from successive deposits of sand left



SDI Review Form 1.6

		behind by the migration of ordinary small sand ripples, along with fine sand sheets. • The mapping units are a collection of areas defined and named the same in terms of their soil components or miscellaneous areas or both. Each map unit differs in some respect from all others in a survey area and is uniquely identified on a soil map. Each individual area on the map is a delineation. • The majority of the studied area is virgin soils with no cultivation, and the current work is a trial to select the optimum land use according to soil properties.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	See journal format for references. Spacing within the line and between the lines. In land evaluation, twelve crops were taken; wheat, maize, watermelon, potato, soya bean, cotton, sunflower, sugar beet, alfalfa, peach, citrus, and olive. What about climatic requirement and its suitability for these twelve crops? Please speak something about crop calendar in the region.	• Journal format is already followed. • The MicroLEIS program evaluates the agricultural suitability for traditional crops, which proved success under climatic condition of the Mediterranean region. Thus, climatic conditions are not considered in evaluation.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	It is interesting to learn something about Dakhla Oasis, Western Desert, Egypt. Figures are good but not discussed anything about these figures in the text. Any figures relating to soils and landscapes of study area with series wise physical and chemical characteristics. Lacking specificity in the subject.	• The detention of each of symbol in the figures is already included in the text and in the titles of the figures.