



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</a>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJPSS_27098</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Selection of salt- tolerant triticale (× Triticosecale Wittmack) and genetic variation assay for agronomic and physiological traits</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p>The manuscript represents a very valuable study on the effect of application of three levels of salt concentrations (1:1 ratio of NaCl and CaCl<sub>2</sub> salts with EC 0, 7, 14 and 21 dS/m) on selected wheat, rye and triticale genotypes. Important physiological, biochemical and agronomical characteristics were evaluated separately by ANOVA, LSD test as well as a whole using multivariate statistical analyses (cluster analysis and principal component analysis) which showed important correlations between different characteristics such as the positive effect of awn length on grain yield. Triticale genotypes revealed the highest salinity tolerance with respect to wheat and rye materials.</p> <p>I have only a few minor comments on the manuscript:</p> <p>1/ References: In the Reference list, the following references cited in the manuscript text are missing in the Reference list. Page 3, line 13: Forster et al. 1994 - missing reference Page 11, line 4: Singh et al. 1987 - missing reference In the Reference list, correct the spelling of the authors' name in the reference "Pakniyat et al. 2003" (not "Pakniat")</p> <p>2/ In Table 3 legend, statistical test used for the evaluation of the presented data has to be specified.</p> <p>Formal comments on the text:</p> <p>Abstract, line 9: Insert "the" before the words "highest correlation", i.e., "the highest correlation"</p> <p>Introduction, page 2, line 3: Remove the verb "is" in the sentence "Salinity in agricultural lands affects crop plants growth..." (not "Salinity in agricultural lands is affects ...")</p> <p>Page 2, line 6: Replace the words "used as" by "grown for" in the</p>	<p>I would like to thank the reviewer for his/her valuable comments to enrich to the quality of the paper. Authors had considered all comments in the text. Changes can be found as highlighted yellow color.</p>



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p>sentence "Triticale is mainly grown for feed grain and biomass production..."</p> <p>Page 2, line 13: Correct the spelling in the word "in comparison (not "in compassion")</p> <p>Page 2, line 17: Insert a space between a number and a corresponding unit in "7.3 dS m<sup>-1</sup>"</p> <p>Page 2, line 20: Insert "An" at the beginning of a sentence "An increase in salt concentrations..."</p> <p>Page 3, line 1: Insert the word "production" in the sentence "...by increasing reactive oxygen species (ROS) production comprising of..."</p> <p>Page 3, line 16: Insert a comma following the words "particularly wheat and barley,..."</p> <p>Page 3, line 21: Insert a space between the two sentences.</p> <p>Page 3, line 23: Modify the sentence as follows: "...in making decisions for breeding triticale to become as important as wheat or even more at a global scale."</p> <p>Page 4, line 2: Insert a comma following the words "in the present study,..."</p> <p>Materials and methods, page 4, line 5 in the section: Add the verb "were employed" in the sentence "...16 genotypes and four levels of salinity were employed."</p> <p>Page 4, line 8: Correct the spelling of the chemical name "sodium hypochlorite" (not "sodium hydrochloride")</p> <p>Page 4, line 13: Insert a comma following the words "Forty days after sowing (four-leaf stage),..."</p> <p>Page 4, line 14. Remove the verb "was" in the sentence "Application of saline solutions continued..."</p> <p>Page 5, lines 2, 3: Use "h" instead of "hr" for "hour".</p> <p>Page 5, line 4: Correct the spelling of the chemical formula "HCl" (not "HCL")</p> <p>Page 6, line 14: Modify the word "discriminant" to "discrimination" in "K<sup>+</sup>/Na<sup>+</sup> discrimination"</p>	
--	--	--



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p><b>Results and Discussion,</b></p> <p><b>Page 9, line 6: Insert a comma following the words “but in tolerant cultivars,...”</b></p> <p><b>Page 9, line 9: Modify the sentence as follows: “The high ratio of <math>K^+/Na^+</math> can be achieved by excretion of <math>Na^+</math>”</b></p> <p><b>Page 10, line 2: Insert “an” before the words “An increase in antioxidants...”</b></p> <p><b>Page 10, line 5: Insert “the” before the words “the lowest (0.074) SOD activity.”</b></p> <p><b>Page 10, line 7: Insert “a” before the words “A decrease in protein content...”</b></p> <p><b>Page 11, line 8: Replace the word “of” by the word “in” in the sentence “Overall, variation in SPAD unit...”</b></p> <p><b>Page 11, line 12: Insert a comma following the words “in some studies,..”</b></p> <p><b>Page 11, line 15: Insert a comma following the words “Under salt stress conditions,...”</b></p> <p><b>Page 11, line 18: Modify the verb form “grew” to “grown” in the sentence “in triticales grown under normal conditions.”</b></p> <p><b>Page 11, line 21: “Number of days to maturity” (not “Number of day to maturity...”)</b></p> <p><b>Page 15, lines 2, 3: Insert a comma both before and after the words “especially TRT808, TRT811 and TRT815,...”</b></p> <p><b>Page 16, line 3: Use “between” instead of “of” in the sentence “Correlation between <math>K^+</math> and leaf area”</b></p> <p><b>Page 16, line 4. Insert “an” before the words “increase in leaf area results”, i.e., “an increase in leaf area results”</b></p> <p><b>Page 17, line 7: Insert “a” in the words “negative correlation”, i.e., “a negative correlation”</b></p> <p><b>Figure 4 legend: Insert a comma both before and after the word “respectively”</b></p> <p><b>Page 19, line 3: Modify the sentence as follows: “...were</b></p>	
--	---	--



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p>restricted to maturity time whereas a wide variation was observed for Na<sup>+</sup>..."</p> <p>Page 19, line 10: Insert a comma before the word "especially"</p> <p>Conclusion, page 20, line 6. Insert a comma following the words "Among triticales,..."</p> <p>Page 20, line 16: Modify the sentence as follows: "Correlation coefficients also revealed that higher K<sup>+</sup> and SOD activity lead to higher protein accumulation."</p> <p>Page 20, line 17: Correct the spelling in the words "Acute angles" (not "angels")</p> <p>Page 21, line 4: Correct the spelling in the word "characteristics were" (not "characteristic were...")</p>	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments		
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		