



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	<u>European Journal of Nutrition & Food Safety</u>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_EJNFS_32175
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Natural Antioxidants Extracted from Simarouba glauca and Radermachera xylocarpa Deoiled Seed Cakes on the Oxidative Stability of Soyabean Oil during Accelerated Storage
Type of Article:	Original Research Article



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The problem is that the authors used a wrong value for positive control (200 ppm) when as a limit they have to use 75 ppm as in Reference: Codex stan 1999: Codex Standard for Edible Fats and Oils not Covered by Individual Standards (CODEX STAN 19-1981, Rev. 2 - 1999). Authors responde that "It is clear that the concentration of BHT used was high. According to the Codex Stan 1999, it should not be more than 75 ppm or 75 mg/Kg of oil. In this study, we have used the legal concentration limit of synthetic antioxidants (and not of BHT) to be added in oils and fats, which is 200 ppm or 200 mg/Kg. BHT was just a positive control." Positive control is to be use at the limit concentration if the authors use as reference for BHT the value of legal concentration limit of synthetic antioxidants is SO WRONG, we can't compare different things. The value of legal concentration limit of synthetic antioxidants can be used as an indication for the extracts. All the results are compare with the positive control (BTH) and concentration of control is too high, so is a fundamental error.	In many previous similar studies, where BHT was used as positive control, authors have used the concentration 200 ppm (See ref): - Iqbal, S., Bhanger, M. I. (2007). Stabilization of sunflower oil by garlic extract during accelerated storage. <i>Food Chemistry</i>, 100: 246-254 -Iqbal, S., Haleem, S., Akhtar, M., Zia-ul-Haq, M., Akbar, J. (2008). Efficiency of pomegranate peel extracts in stabilization of sunflower oil under accelerated conditions. <i>Food Research International</i>, 41: 194-200 - Anwar, F., Qayyum, H. M. A., Hussain, A. L., Iqbal, S. (2010). Antioxidant activity of 100% and 80% methanol extracts from barley seeds (<i>Hordeum vulgare</i> L.): stabilization of sunflower oil. <i>Grasas Y Aceites</i>, 61: 237-243 - Nyam, K. L., Wong, M. M., Long, K., Tan, C. P. (2013). Oxidative stability of sunflower oils supplemented with kenaf seeds extract, roselle seeds extract and roselle extract, respectively under accelerated storage. <i>International Food Research Journal</i>, 20: 695-701 -Mei, W. S. C., Ismail, A., Esa, N. M., Akowuah, G. A., Wai, H. C., Seng, Y. H. (2014). The Effectiveness of Rambutan (<i>Nephelium lappaceum</i> L.) Extract in Stabilization of Sunflower Oil under Accelerated Conditions. <i>Antioxidants</i>, 3: 371-386



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

	- Womeni, H.M., Tonfack, D.F., Anjaneyulu, B., Karuna, M.S.L., Prasad, R.B.N., Linder, M., 2016. Oxidative stabilization of RBD palm olein under forced storage conditions by old Cameroonian green tea leaves methanolic extract. NFS Journal. 3, 33-40. We have followed the same line by considering the concentration of BHT 200 ppm.
--	--