



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                            |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Current Journal of Applied Science and Technology</a>                          |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_CJAST_36495</b>                                                                      |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Profitability of Agro-forestry system: A study of U.S.Nagar district of Uttarakhand</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original Research Paper</b>                                                             |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><u>Review comments</u></p> <p>The topic chosen for this paper, “<i>Profitability of Agro-forestry system:</i>” is not only an excellent contribution to the <i>Current Journal of Applied Science and Technology</i>, but also the highlighted economic aspects is informative.</p> <p>The idea is innovative and the analyses are strong, but the paper is not well written, and data weakly presented. I would be happy to review the revised article.</p> <p><u>Specific comments</u> that would strengthen this paper include the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Edit for grammar, coherence, and repetitions. The manuscript bear so many typos (even for the main title the district is misspelled as “distrct,” other places into as “in to,” and “form” instead of “from”. There is so much redundant that need editing out. (Manual proof-reading should help)</li> <li>2. A Map and more details about the Study Area needed</li> <li>3. Spell out in full the initials U.S and edit all U.S from the text (presently it seems like United States because these are the official abbreviation for the United States); provide full geographical location name.</li> <li>4. Thus, with geographical details, the entire title (when corrected for typo and clarity) should read, “<i>Profitability of Agroforestry System: The case of Udham Singh Nagar District of Uttarakhand State, India.</i>”</li> <li>5. In text you can abbreviate as USN District (or plainly as USND)</li> <li>6. Agroforestry is one word not hyphenated (not agro-forestry)</li> <li>7. Where currency (in Rupee) is indicated please give as parenthesis the equivalent US\$ (USA Dollars)</li> <li>8. For Tables 3 &amp; 4 and 5 &amp; 6 can be use standardized values instead of the raw data</li> <li>9. Use Figure instead of Table for Tables 7 &amp; 8 and 9 &amp; 10: that way it is more informative as regards trends</li> <li>10. In text reference to Table should be indicated in number format e.g., Table 1, Table 2 ... and so on and not “table”</li> <li>11. More references from the current works from the World Agroforestry Center (ICRAF) are needed</li> </ol> | I corrected as much as possible but it is not possible to remove the raw data paper does not mean to fruitfull if raw data is removed                                         |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                               |