



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                             |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Current Journal of Applied Science and Technology</a>           |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_CJAST_26120</b>                                                       |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Toxicity of fungicides inhibitors to Phytophthora megakarya in cacao</b> |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                             |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>Author has mentioned that " Black pod disease of cacao caused by <i>Phytophthora megakarya</i> and <i>P. palmivora</i> is the most important and devastating one in Nigeria." Therefore it becomes essential to first identify the pathogen as <i>P. megakarya</i> and then use it for toxicity studies, here manuscript is lacking in basic aspects. Moreover use of Cuprous oxide, Copper hydroxide and Copper hydroxide +metalaxyl against <i>P. megakarya</i> is already well studied in west Africa, kindly go through following Internet resource(<br/><a href="http://www.bioline.org.br/pdf?cs15007">http://www.bioline.org.br/pdf?cs15007</a>).</p> <p>Here are my comments as a reviewer on following manuscript.</p> <p>Title: Toxicity of fungicides inhibitors to <i>Phytophthora megakarya</i> in cacao.</p> <p>1. The manuscript describes toxicity and efficacy of copper based fungicides to <i>P. megakarya</i> infecting cacao.</p> <p>2. There are many fallacies and therefore manuscript becomes unpersuasive. such as,</p> <p>A. Use of Cuprous oxide, Copper hydroxide and Copper hydroxide +metalaxyl against <i>P. megakarya</i> is already well studied in west Africa, so the work appears just a repetition. Author can go through following Internet resource (</p> | <p>Earlier studies refers are based on efficacy of copper-based fungicide on mycelia growth of the pathogen and on some instance on spore production.</p> <p>The particular study however based on the <b>toxicity estimation of the active ingredients</b> in such fungicides, the essence being on reduction of chemical usage on crop and accumulation in soil and running water.</p> <p>The efficacy testing of such fungicides in Nigeria are part of earlier works of this author.</p> <p>There are scarce information on toxicity estimation studies of fungicides against pathogen in Nigeria, this study has open up such areas and could be assayed on other major pathogens of economic crops.</p> <p>The study is reproducible and methodology adequate for such and author has carried out similar works published in reputable international referred journals.</p> <p>The toxicity evaluation on the pathogen was the bane in this study and a knowledge of toxicity studies should guide in such judgement</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                         | <p><a href="http://www.bioline.org.br/pdf?cs15007">http://www.bioline.org.br/pdf?cs15007</a>).</p> <p><b>B. Author has mentioned that " Black pod disease of cacao caused by Phytophthora megakarya and P. palmivora is the most important and devastating one in Nigeria." Therefore it becomes essential to first identify the pathogen and then use it for toxicity studies, here manuscript is lacking in basic aspect.</b></p> <p><b>3. Only thing in this manuscript is the data generated on efficacy of copper based fungicide against Phytophthora megakarya mycelia growth.</b></p> <p><b>4. But the logic behind the approach is fundamentally flawed. The work appears incompetent.</b></p> <p><b>For corrections please go through the PDF file attached. The completed review comment form is also attached.</b></p> | <p>otherwise tools that probit analysis (used in this study) would not be appreciated.</p> <p>Beyond testing the efficacy of the active ingredients on the pathogen, estimating the toxicity of such is a required standard vis-à-vis food safety and chemical residue issues in food crop of which cocoa is of utmost importance as a world wide beverage.</p> |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | For revisions please go through the PDF file attached.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |