



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	British Microbiology Research Journal
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BMRJ_28481
Title of the Manuscript:	Genotyping Human Papillomavirus in Women Attending Cervical Cancer Screening Clinic in Harare, Zimbabwe
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Referees report: Genotyping Human Papillomavirus in Women Attending Cervical Cancer Screening Clinic in Harare, Zimbabwe. Ms-BMRJ_24841. Original script in black; comments/criticisms in red; suggested edits improvements in blue. Comments to the editor: This is a worthy prevalence study among 60 sexually active women for HPV genotypes attending a cervical cancer screening clinic in Zimbabwe. . <i>With some minor edits and additions it may proceed to publication.</i> Generally the submission is well written in an acceptable direct comprehensible form with very few aberrations of style. For example: The panel HPV DNA samples were leftovers from the Global HPV DNA Proficiency Study in which our laboratory participated in. Use of 'leftovers' not appropriate; indicates spurious supply. Grammar. Suggest:- The panel HPV DNA samples were derived from material procured in the Global HPV DNA Proficiency Study in which our laboratory had participated. A major shortcoming of this submission is the omission of stating prophylactic HPV vaccines have been used successfully in other countries. With a prevalence of 50% HPV	- - -The use of 'leftovers' has been changed to "The panel HPV DNA samples were derived from material procured in the Global HPV DNA Proficiency Study in which our laboratory had participated" and is indicated in red in the manuscript. -we have not come across studies showing the successful prevention of HPV infection by HPV vaccines. These vaccines were only introduced in the past few years and evaluation of vaccine success needs more time. -A statement " Therefore, with a high



SDI Review Form 1.6

	found in this Zimbabwean group, there is a serious and urgent need for introducing HPV vaccination for young boys and girls before their sexual debut. Keywords: Human papillomavirus; Genotypes; Consensus nested-PCR; Sequencing; Zimbabwe. .Why exclude the abbreviation and the other main focus of the article? Include: HPV and HIV. A list of abbreviations is needed and placed next to or below the abstract. Suggested inclusions:- HPV;HIV;PCR;DNA;UV; TRIMα; VIAC; OI; EDTA; OR; etc Ethical issue: Modification of permission needed. . An IRB <i>certificate Number with Title, the date and the name of the approving constituent Institution must be provided.</i> This shd be place at the end of the submission, before the References. The details of conformity may be included, but once the IRB data are provided, the confident assumption is made about the satisfactory adherence to the rules stated. A statement about the authors having no competing interests is needed at the end of the article placed before the IRB certificate statement. The detailed description of techniques and materials and methods used, may have been published by the suppliers of the reagents. Details are found with the providers reagents.	prevalence of HPV found in this Zimbabwean group, there is a serious and urgent need for introducing HPV vaccination for young boys and girls before their sexual debut.” has been added to the Discussion section. - “Abbreviations: HPV: Human papillomavirus, HIV: Human immunodeficiency virus, VIAC: Visual inspection with acetic acid, OI: Opportunistic Infection, TRIM5α: Tripartite motif 5 alpha, PCR: Polymerase chain reaction, DNA: Deoxyribonucleic acid, UV: Ultraviolet, OR: Odds ratio, EDTA: Ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid ” have been added to the manuscript. -Details of the ethical document have been added. -A statement “Authors have declared that no competing interests exist” have added to the manuscript. -details of techniques and methods have not been published in referred journals and that is the reason why we included them in details.
--	---	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

Minor REVISION comments	Comments on the script:	
	The methodology is indicated in detail. The technique(s) are described in detail in the literature. Suggest: A shorter less detailed description using generic descriptors. A detailed reference of source and data for suppliers of material shd be provided for each test used. 2.5 Sequencing and Bioinformatics Analysis A total of 30 positive PCR amplicons from the participant samples were sent for sequencing at Inqaba Biotechnical Industries (Pretoria, South Africa). As positive controls, a total of 7 out of 8 amplicons from the Global HPV Proficiency Study were also sent for sequencing. DNA sequence data (chromatographs and sequences) for all the samples were sent back by email for analysis. DNA sequences were analysed using the Geneious Basic program (Biomatters, USA) and BLAST programs. Reference needed here. Numerical notation is not needed for introduction; Materials and Methods; Statistics, Discussion and Concluding Remarks.. Conventional use of these are in dissertations not articles for publication. 2.7 Ethical approval and considerations The study was approved by the Joint Research Ethics committee of Parirenyatwa Hospital and the University of Zimbabwe College Of Health Sciences (JREC) and the Medical Research Council of Zimbabwe. The experiments were performed in accordance with the ethical standards laid down by the Declaration of Helsinki of 1964. All participants signed informed consent forms according to the recommendations of the ethics committees. An IRB certificate Number with	-details of techniques and methods have not been published in referred journals and that is the reason why we included them in details so that anyone who wants to repeat the same sort of experiments can do so. -The internet references have been added. -The numerical notations have been removed from the manuscript. -Details of ethical approvals have been added.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Title, the date and the name of the approving constituent Institution must be provided. This shd be place at the end of the submission, before the References. The details of conformity may be included, but once the IRB data are provided, the confident assumption is made about the satisfactory adherence to the rules stated . A statement about the authors having no competing interests is needed at the end of the article placed before the IRB certificate statement. 3.2 Amplification of HPV DNA The PCR products of the house-keeping gene TRIM5α by gel for the Trim5a gene. Spelling annotation. The PCR products of the house-keeping gene TRIM5α by gel for the TRIM5α gene. Fig. 1. Representative gel showing amplification of TRIM5α gene. Lane M: DNA marker, Lanes 1-9: amplified Trim5a gene, Lane C: PCR negative control. For the 60 women who participated in this study, 50% (30) of them were HIV positive and 50% (30) were HIV negative. Larger numbers may reflect a relationship or association. Other viral infections are more prevalent in HIV+ve people. Suggest: For the 60 women in this group, who participated in this study, 50% (30) of them were HIV positive and 50% (30) were HIV negative. Etc.. 5. CONCLUSION The findings of this study showed that consensus nested PCR using MY9/11 and GP5/6 primer sets and sequencing could be used to detect HPV genotypes in women in cervical cancer screening programmes. However, although the method was sensitive, it was inefficient in picking multiple HPV infections.	-Statement of competing interests has been added. -the spelling mistake for TRIM5α has been corrected. -the spelling mistake for TRIM5α has been corrected. The statement changed to “For the 60 women in this group, who participated in this study, 50% (30) of them were HIV positive and 50% (30) were HIV negative” - Conclusion modified to “HPV genotypes were found in 50% of the women tested. Other risk factors compared between HPV positive and negative included parity, level of education, residence, history of STI, contraception use and sexual debut. There was no significance association between these risk-factors and HPV infection. Although 50% were also HIV-positive, there was no significance association between this risk-factor and HPV infection. The findings of this study showed that consensus
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Conclusions are indicated in polemical views. A neat summary of results is needed. Suggest:- CONCLUDING REMARKS HPV serotypes were found in 50% of the women tested. Other risk factors compared between HPV positive and negative include parity, level of education, residence, history of STI, contraception use and sexual debut. There was no significance association between these risk-factors and HPV infection. Although 50% were also HIV+ve, there was no significance association between these risk-factors and HPV infection. The findings of this study showed that consensus nested PCR using MY9/11 and GP5/6 primer sets and sequencing could be used to detect HPV genotypes in women in cervical cancer screening programs. Although this method is sensitive, it is inefficient at detecting multiple HPV infections.	nested PCR using MY9/11 and GP5/6 primer sets and sequencing could be used to detect HPV genotypes in women in cervical cancer screening programs. Although this method is sensitive, it is inefficient at detecting multiple HPV infections". -Conclusion for the abstract changed to "A number of HPV genotypes were detected in half of women tested. There was no significance association between risk-factors (parity, level of education, residence, history of STI, contraceptive use and sexual debut) and HPV infection. The findings of this study showed that consensus nested PCR and DNA sequencing could be used to detect HPV genotypes in women in cervical cancer screening programs. Although this method is sensitive, it is inefficient at detecting multiple HPV infections."
--	---	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Comments to the Author(s): This is a worthy project and the effort put into acquiring the data is acknowledged. Some minor refinements are needed, as will be indicated by the editors notes. This referee request that you include in the discussion insights relating to HPV vaccination. One major shortcoming of this submission is the omission of successful use of prophylactic HPV vaccines in other countries, like China. A 50% HPV positive prevalence found in this Zimbabwean group, indicates there is a serious and urgent need for introducing HPV vaccination for young boys and girls before sexual debut. The exact etiology of cancer remains obscure, but since HPV infection is known to be causally related to genito urinary and oropharyngeal neoplasms, the findings of your report is most important. Prevention remains better than cure. It indicates, establishes and confirms a fundamental principle: half the Zimbabwean women are HPV positive and may be at risk for developing cervical cancers. This should strongly influence the health policies of all sub-Saharan and Southern African States. Respectfully submitted.	-The results on the success of prophylactic HPV vaccines in preventing cervical cancer are still sketchy since these vaccines were only licensed for use in the past few years. -
---	--	---