



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BJAST_30117
Title of the Manuscript:	GEOCHEMICAL CHARACTERIZATION AND PROTOLITH OF THE MIGMATITE-GNEISSES OF TANDAMA AREA, KATSINA STATE, NW NIGERIA
Type of Article:	

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
As I thought looking at the presented data, Sr/Y-Y relationships show that at least some granite gneiss and migmatite samples display slab melt (adakite) characteristics. At least 4 data points in Figure 8a are classic slab melts. This is important and should be emphasized. I suggest that author adds typical fields for slab melts (adakites) and basalt-andesite-dacite-rhyolite (BADR) calc-alkaline associations and adds a proper reference to his reference list. I suggest the following: Drummond M.S., Defant M.J. and Kepezhinskas P.K. (1996). Petrogenesis of slab-derived trondjemite-tonalite-dacite/adakite magmas. Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh, Earth Sciences, v. 87, p. 205-215. I also suggest that this is mentioned in conclusions, e.g. that there are essentially two types of felsic protoliths – crustal melts and slab melts which is a common case at many modern continental margins (Andes, for example).	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Pavel Kepezhinskas</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>PNK GeoScience, Tampa, Florida, USA</i>