



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                 |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">British Journal of Applied Science &amp; Technology</a>             |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_BJAST_25686</b>                                                           |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Silver nanoparticles as inhibition agent of cooling tower microorganisms</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original research paper</b>                                                  |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                            | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <p>This study is an interesting contribution in the field of Ag nanoparticles study that fits with the required criteria for publication in BJAS&amp;T. However, the paper can be improved; more specifically the quality of the figures.</p> <p>The HRTEM image of figure 3a needs to be improved. This image only shows a big agglomerate of Ag nanoparticles. The authors should change this image and add a HRTEM image in which at least 1 nanoparticle is clearly visible. It is hard to see the morphology and the size of the Ag nanoparticles in the present HRTEM image. Why did the authors only include one XRD pattern? They should comment on the other XRD patterns. Are they different? In addition, what is the origin of the broad shoulder visible at the lowest angles?</p> <p>In table 1, the authors should include a realistic error bar. In fact, DLS measurements indicate that the size distribution is quite broad. This error bar should then be taken into account in the discussion and the authors should not only consider the average value.</p> |                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments      | <p>The resolution of figure 4 is very low and it is difficult to read the characters.</p> <p>The paragraph from line 40 to 46 should be completely rewritten.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                      |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|-----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | <p>The English needs to be improved. The manuscript should be carefully read by a person proficient in English; there are numerous typos (further, Cr    , f, the to the...) and grammatical errors.</p> <p>The authors should maybe comment on their broad size distribution. It is commonly admitted that it is difficult to obtain a sharp size distribution using green synthesis methods. I would suggest the authors to compare their method with green synthesis methods. A recent review paper has highlighted the broad size distribution of Ag nanoparticles synthesized using green synthesis method (Advances in Materials Science and Engineering_Hindawi, Volume 2015, Article ID 682749, 1-9 (2015)). This reference can be added in the discussion about the broad size distribution obtained using ascorbic acid</p> |  |
|-----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                                  |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>Erwan Rauwel</b>                              |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Tallinn University of Technology, Estonia</b> |