



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BJAST_18853
Title of the Manuscript:	Formation of Magnetic Semiconductor Carbon Nanotubes via Iron Incorporation
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The authors have shown a progressive approach to improve the overall quality of the paper by incorporating some of the required major revisions. However, it is difficult to be entirely convinced to propose acceptance of the paper UNLESS further major/minor revisions are considered as follows: MAJOR revisions: 1. The title of the paper definitely NEEDS correction. As per the response of the authors, the work is expressing only the POSSIBILITY of synthesis of magnetic-semiconductor composites without actually supporting the claim by experimental tests. Since the claim is based on theoretical assumption only, the present title of the paper cannot be accepted; the revised title should also substantiate the claim. 2. The benefits of the present Fe doped CNT synthesis technique as being simple and low cost should be mentioned in the paper. 3. The state-of-the-art techniques or competing synthesis techniques like co-precipitation, thermo-solution, in-situ growth (CVD) need to be touched upon in the introduction section. 4. No explanation from the authors in regard to TABLE 1 (as pointed out in red ink in the previous review) could be found in the revised manuscript. Please be advised to refer to my comments in the previous & revised manuscript and incorporate the crucial correction/revision. 5. The FONT SIZE Of the DATA Labels in the diagrams MUST be increased to the benefit of the readers. Please refer to my notes in the draft. 6. Some theoretical explanation/ scientific assumption or exp. evidence must be presented to possibly clarify the presence of spherical C-structure in the CNT yield as the authors claim it to be reproducible phenomenon. (No response from previous review) 7. Minor revisions as pointed out in the previous review: Ok to negate for the present purpose of the paper. However, some insights about the choice of D.I water as the suspension medium over alcohol based solvents would be definitely helpful to respond to the “electrolysis of water” concern. 8. The authors are requested to work on the general representation of the paper over all (images, scale bar in the TEM images, diagram labels, sentence construction) to the benefit of the readers.	Dear Reviewer, thank you for your comments that helped us to see the paper again in depth. We have suggested new title following your comments as 1. Purification and Characterization of Carbon Nanotubes and Prospects for the Formation of Magnetic Semiconductor via Iron Incorporation 2. We have included the advantage of using the deionized water. 3. Though not detail explained we have touched on iron incorporation issues as “Iron catalyzed production of CNTs have been investigated using different incorporation mechanisms and technique [6, 22] for both quantity and quality improvement” in the introduction section. 4. Explanation was also given to table I from the beginning, mentioning “Table I demonstrates inter planar spacing between the diffraction fringes calculated from the XRD patterns shown in fig. 2a, applying the famous Braggs’ equation, $n\lambda = 2d \sin\theta$, signifying the decrease of the spacing with increase in Braggs’ angles”. 5. Size of figures is now increased. 6. Spherical structure has been obtained by Cakan et al. [31] in the presence of Silicon Si impurity in a one-step procedure using hydrothermal carbonization of glucose as well. 7. We have also revised sentences to make understandable as much as possible.