



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BJAST_26986
Title of the Manuscript:	Comparison of Some Extraction Methods for Estimating Available Mn to Maize (Zea mays L.) in Acid Soils of Agro-Climatic Conditions of Southeastern Nigeria
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	7 Change "At the" to " In the" 9 Change "sulphate was applied to the soils during the first year experiment only, at seventh levels" to "sulphate was applied to the soils during the first year experiment only at seven levels" 11 Change "while, 1N" to "while 1N" 16 Change "0.509*", while" to "0.509*) while" 26 Change "Nigeria, are" to "Nigeria are" 24 delete one "similarly" Provide reference to the first sentence in line 30 41 change "deficient/low" to "deficiency of" 45 change "Manganese" to "Manganese (Mn)" 48, 49 & 50 Rewrite this sentence "From the point of view of availability to plants, it is an established fact that only a small fraction of total manganese in soil is made available to plants in a growing season." to "It is an established fact that only a small fraction of total manganese in soil is made available to plants in during the growing season." 50 include "Application of Manganese fertilizer increases the ..." 54 & 55 Rewrite "Ibrahim et al. (2011) reported a ranged of available Mn in soil from 1.2 to 30.3 mg kg-1 55 with mean values of 9.8 mg kg-1" to "Ibrahim et al. (2011) reported that available Mn in soil ranged from 1.2 to 30.3 mg kg-1 with mean values of 9.8 mg kg-1" 81-84 Change "objectives; assessed the status of different forms of Mn in soils, developed a soil test method for the estimating available Mn in these soils,	Thanks for your scientific and constructive criticism of the article. I have affected the corrections as directed and have learnt from the revision. All the grammatical errors have been corrected as pointed out and the units were properly written accordingly. The contents of the manuscript has been recast and summarized to sustain the aim of the study.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	determine critical limits of Mn in soil for maize plant, estimated response of maize (Zea mays L.) to manganese application and recommended Mn rate for maize production in acid soils of southeastern, Nigeria." to "objectives: (i) to assess the status of different forms of Mn in soils; (ii) to develop a soil test method for estimating available Mn in soils; (iii) to determine the critical limits of Mn in soil for maize plant; and (iv) to estimate the response of maize to manganese application and recommended Mn rate for maize production in acid soils of southeastern, Nigeria." 136 delete this "Before the study, the soil samples were air-dried, crushed and passed through 2 mm sieve." It is already explained in line 103 138 delete "number" 139-140 delete "The plastic containers were randomly distributed on the bench in the Greenhouse growth chamber and" and start the sentence with "The containers were watered using distilled-deionized water ..." 141 replace "about field moisture capacity" with "field capacity" 143 change was to were 144 ... in the region by Aduayi et al. (2002) ... 146-147 replace "muriate of potash (MOP) respectively, as a basal N P and K fertilizer, were respectively applied uniformly to all the containers in solution form, at two weeks after planting (WAP)" with "muriate of potash (MOP) were applied as basal (NPK) fertilizer uniformly to all the containers in solution form at two weeks after planting (WAP)" 148 write var. in full 148 as a test 149 delete ", " 152 change to "manganese applied would be used to	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	establish a response curve" 154 delete "growth period," 178 delete "during the" 180-182 Rewrite the sentence 190 Replace "seedlings," with "plants" 191-193 At what point were the samples collected before the field experiment was set or after? If it was before then the sampling sentences should come before the field experiment. 194-195 replace "each of the net six out of eight rows," with "the net plot" 194-198 Rewrite the sentences 200 kg plot⁻¹ 205-206 what are the critical limited for Mn? 218 change coarsed to coarse 217-219 Rewrite "The results showed that most of the soil samples examined for the greenhouse and the field studies were coarsed in texture with textural classes which are sandy clay loam (SCL) and sandy loam (SL), respectively" to "The textural classes for the greenhouse and field experiments were sandy clay loam (SCL) and sandy loam (SL), respectively" 233-234 Table 3: write the units properly gkg-1 to g kg⁻¹; Cmolkg-1 to cmol kg⁻¹ The status of different forms of Mn in soils has not been addressed by the researcher What Mn rate does this study recommend for maize production in acid soils of southeastern, Nigeria?	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	30: Zea mays should be in italic 52 where? 60 change "manure, or" to "manure or" 90 change "was selected" to "were selected" 94 change °c to °C 104-105 delete "to pass through" 110 method as described 113 Bray-1 method 132-135 The sentence is too long, need to be rewritten 156 Plant materials were oven dried at ... 225 Remove the ", " 226 "ECEC of the soils tested" to "ECEC of the tested soils" 247 Delete "While the" 263 mg kg⁻¹ 265 Delete Also, 269-271 Delete three lines 442 Delete "in maize plants" and put a period at the end of the sentence	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	There are a lot of grammatical errors Units should be written properly kg ha⁻¹ to kg ha⁻¹	