

**ASSESSMENT OF THE EFFECT OF YEARS OF EXPERIENCE ON
THE LEVEL OF TASK PERFORMANCE BY PRIMARY HEALTH
CARE WORKERS IN ENUGU STATE**

ABSTRACT

The study aimed at assessment of level of task performance as affected by working experiences of the primary healthcare workers (PHCW) in Enugu. Nine Local Governments and 302 PHCW were randomly selected using a multistage method. Questionnaire was used as the instrumentation validated using test retest with correlation coefficient of 0.85. The result showed that those with 10 years and above perform better when compared with those with less than 10 years and those with more than 20 years, but generally the workers perform low in areas of provision of Health Education, performance of simple laboratory test, community mobilization and identifying environmental health hazards. It was then recommended that close supervision should be provided to the PHCW and in planning for task shifting in primary health, the years of experiences should be considered.

KEYWORD: Years of experience, level of task, task performance, primary healthcare workers

INTRODUCTION

Task is a unit of work that is convenient for working a plan or achieving a goal. It could be regarded as observable job element in a work setting. Task is acquired through training as well as organization and interpretation in practice. (Katz and Snow, 1980 and Porkin 1980). Performance on the other hand is the ability of the individual worker to perform a specific task. It is the execution

of functions by utilization of knowledge, skills and attitude acquired through training as well as their organization and interpretation in practice, Ezenduka (2007).

Primary Health Care tasks enumerated at the Alma-Ata declaration in (1978) included at least Education concerning prevailing health problems and methods of preventing and controlling them. Promotion of food supply and adequate nutrition; adequate supply of water and basic sanitation, material and Child Health Care including family planning; immunization against the major infectious diseases; prevention and control of locally endemic diseases, appropriate treatment of common diseases and injuries and provision of essential drugs.

Ransome – Kuti (1990) state that in Nigeria Primary Health Care Workers (PHCW) should perform the following tasks, diagnosing and treating common conditions with simple measures, identifying pregnant women and ensuring that they deliver safely, identifying malnourished children and providing health education in the community, mobilizing the community for preventive action such as the building of latrine, wells and road and spreading community

54 health care into and within the community in a most responsible
55 manner. In performing these tasks there are qualities needed to
56 have by the health workers to be in a position to actually achieve
57 these aims. Some of these attributes include training, years of
58 experiences, age, marital status, (Ezenduka 2007). Little has been
59 done to highlight the effect of each of these factors in the
60 effectiveness of performance of these tasks. What the policy makers
61 in Nigeria are concerned with is the task shifting without putting
62 into consideration these factors. WHO (2008) recommendation and
63 guideline on task shifting stressed that, task shifting should be
64 implemented alongside other strategies that are designed to
65 increase the total numbers of health workers in all cadres. WHO
66 also stressed that task shifting is proposed as an efficient approach
67 but one that will require significant investments and that should
68 not be seen as a substitute for other investments in human
69 resources in health. The guideline specified the quality assurance
70 mechanisms including standardized training, supportive
71 supervision and certification and assessment that will be important
72 to ensure quality of care.

73 This study is aimed at assessing the effect of years of experience of
74 primary health care workers on task performance in Enugu State of
75 Nigeria. The result may form a base on task shifting policy
76 implementation in Nigeria. Sullivan (2014) suggested that task
77 shifting should be called task delegation to allow CHEWS to be
78 supervised. This is because their activities has gone unchecked
79 because of ill-informed laws, unnecessary competitions,
80 encroachment into areas they had no training on, economically –
81 induced elongation of training programs to “meet up” and lack of
82 political will on the part of leaders. Task – shift concept is really a
83 programme in Nigeria introduce to health care system to erode the
84 functions of the nurses while physicians’ tasks are well guided. The
85 main categories of PHC workers are the Public Health
86 Nurses/Midwives, Community Health Officers and Community
87 Health Extension Workers (CHEWS). The CHEWS were trained on
88 how to perform specific tasks, study conducted in Calabar (Akpola
89 2011) and at Ibadan (Adeniyi et al 1986) revealed that majority of
90 the CHEWS work as messengers and aids in hospitals while others
91 who found themselves in villages provide predominantly curative

services as against the preventive care which is their main functions.

METHODOLOGY

Descriptive survey research design was adopted to analyze the task performed of primary health care workers in Enugu State of Nigeria. Enugu State is made of 17 Local Governments and 423 health centres. Multi stage random sampling method was used to select health centres. In the first stage three LGA were randomly selected from each of the three senatorial district of the state given a total of 9 L.G.A. In the second stage, three health centres were randomly selected from each of the 9 LGA, given a total of 27 health centres. The total number of community health workers in the health centres selected were 315 because their number were few all of them were used for the study but only 302 were finally used because only 13 public health nurses/midwives were found in the 9 LGA and 10 of them were not in the clinics and not quality to be evaluated.

Self-developed structured task performance questionnaire was used in data collection. The instrument was used for data on the effect of

years of experience on task performance. A pilot study was done in one of the Local Government that was not selected for the study. A test retest method was used to test the reliability and the correlation coefficient was 0.85. Permissions were obtained from coordinators of primary health care centres in the selected LGA and all the respondents gave their consents and were assured that the information they provided is for statistical analysis only. The questionnaire were distributed to the respondents in their places of work and collected by the end of that day's work by the researchers. The work was done from June –December 2014. The data were analyzed using SPSS (version 20).

Table 1:

Task performance by PHCWs in Enugu State According to Years of Working Experience (N=302)

	Task Performed	Less than 10 years		11-20 years		>20 years	Row		Total
		n	%	n	%		n	%	
1	Material health services (ante-natal, intra-natal, post-natal)	142	58.33	96	87.36	94	63.64		302
2	Child health services								

	(growth monitoring, immunization)	142	90.28	96	71.26	94	72.73	302
3	Physical assessment of people to identify those with serious health problems							
-	Provide health education concerning	142	83.33	96	90.85	94	83.92	302
-	Prevailing health problems and methods of control	142	95.83	96	91.95	94	75.35	302
-	Dangers of self medication and fake drugs	142	19.44	96	28.74	94	53.15	302
-	Resources available in health centres and community	142	27.78	96	34.48	94	18.31	302
-	Method of isolation of infectious cases	142	31.94	96	34.48	94	41.26	302
4	Poor housing and its health implication	142	16.67	96	52.87	94	32.39	302
5	Prevention and control of locally endemic diseases	142	69.44	96	82.76	94	72.54	302
6	Treatment of common diseases and minor injuries	142	95.83	96	91.95	94	87.41	302
7	Referral patients with							

8	serious health problems	142	90.25	96	96.55	94	77.46	302
9	Provide essential drugs such as panadol	142	33.33	96	74.71	94	46.65	302
10	Disinfect and dress minor wounds	142	72.22	96	82.76	94	74.65	302
11	Keep basic records of vital events (births, death) diagnosis and treatment	142	87.50	96	70.11	94	73.24	302
12	Perform simple laboratory tests (urine and blood tests)	142	23.61	96	41.38	94	37.32	302
13	Mobilize and encourage community participation in health programmes	142	23.61	96	39.08	94	29.58	302
14	Identify environmental health hazards in the community and provide solutions	142	18.06	96	41.38	94	40.76	302
15	Home visits and contact tracing of treatment defaulters	142	63.89	96	48.28	94	61.97	302

127

128 Task performed

Data in Table 1 show variations in types of task performance according to years of working experiences. The results show that higher performance was recorded for respondents with 11-20 years working experience than respondents with less than 10 years and those above >20 years working experience in performance of the following tasks: referral of patients with serious health problems, physical assessment of people to identify those with serious health problems, maternal health services (ante-natal, post-natal) preventions and control of locally endemic diseases, disinfect and dress minor wounds, provide essential drugs such as panadol.

The Table further shows that respondents with 10 years and below working experience performed higher than respondents with 11-20 years and above working experiences in performance of the following tasks: provision of health education concerning prevailing health problems and methods of control; treatment of common diseases and minor injuries; child health service (immunization, growth monitoring) and keep basic records of vital events.

Table 2

149 Summary of Chi-square values verifying the differences in types of
 150 task performed by PHCWs in Enugu State according to Years of
 151 Working Experience (n= 302)

	Types of Task Performed	Cal.X ² Values	Table X ² Values
1	Material health services (ante-natal, intra-natal, post-natal)	13.72234*	.00105
2	Child health services (growth monitoring, immunization)	6.43240*	.04011
3	Provide health education concerning		
-	Prevailing health problems and methods of control	1.72803*	.42147
-	Dangers of self medication and fake drugs	10.4178*	.59399
-	Resources available in health centres and community	2.37972*	.30426*
-	Method of isolation of infectious cases	3.12057*	.21008
-	Poor housing and its health implication	4.71671*	.09458
4	Prevention and control of locally endemic diseases	2.29097*	.31807
5	Treatment of common diseases and minor injuries	7.62825*	0.02206
6	Referral patients with serious health problems	10.97495*	.00414
7	Provide essential drugs such as panadol	13.37146*	.00125
8	Disinfect and dress minor wounds	2.09756*	.35037
9	Keep basic records of vital events (births, death) diagnosis and treatment	5.86961*	.05314
10	Perform simple laboratory tests (urine and blood tests)	4.48946*	.10596
11	Home visits and contact tracing of treatment defaulters	3.91826*	.14098
12	Mobilize and encourage community participation in		

	health programmes	8.65434*	.01320
152	Satisfying Significant		

153

154 The influence of years of working experience on the response task

155 performance was the main thrust of data in Table 1 and 2 the

156 results from Tables showed that years of working experience had

157 influence on the types of task performed by the respondents in

158 Enugu State. Data in Table 2 revealed that the differences were

159 significant at .05 level and 2 degrees of freedom. The findings

160 revealed that performance was higher among respondents with 11-

161 20 years of working experience than respondents with 10 years and

162 below experience in the performance of the following task: keeping

163 basic records of vital events (birth, deaths), diagnosis and treatment

164 ($X^2=5.869>.053$) and in home visits and contact tracing of treatment

165 defaulters ($X^2=9.18>.141$). respondents with 11-20 years working

166 experience performed higher than those with 21 years and above

167 working experience in majority of the tasks such as: maternal

168 health services ($X^2=13.722>.421$); referral of patients with serious

169 health problems ($X^2=10.975>.004$); prevention and control of locally

170 endemic diseases ($X^2=2.291>.318$) and provision of essential drugs

($X^2=13.371>.001$). Respondents who had worked below 10 years could only perform higher than respondents with 11-20 years and above in child health services ($X^2=6.432>.040$); provision of health education concerning prevailing health problems and methods of controlling them ($X^2=7.628>.022$). The findings are interesting.

DISCUSSION

It can be stated that from these results that community health care workers performance is poor since their mean score in 7 out of 13 task evaluated is between 25.17-38.8%. The areas they had these very low score include provision of health education, performance of simple laboratory tests, community mobilization and identify environmental health hazards in community. These results are in line with Adeniyi et al (1986) and Akpola (2000) who stated that most of the community health care workers in the villages provide predominantly curative services as against the preventive care which is their main function. This may also account for the high material and infant mortality recorded in Nigeria as report by WHO (2004) and Adoni et al (2005) who reported that Nigeria accounted for about 10% of all maternal death rate in the world after India.

This is also in line with Ndie (2014) who opined that replacement of Public Health Nurses with extension workers as is obtainable in Nigeria today is not for the interest of the public.

The result is also in line with Cruckshank et al (1994) that stated that clinical experience independently has a significant effect on competence. So it was expected that respondent with more than 10 years working experience should perform higher than respondents with less than 10 years. This result could also be of greater use in planning for task shift in Nigeria to ensure quality care. Certain years of experience should be considered with supporting supervision as stipulated in WHO (2008) guideline. It could be concluded from this study that community health care workers in Nigeria have low task performance and years of experience help to improve their performance and supportive supervision is needed to ensure quality care. It is recommended that public health and nurses/midwives should be employed to work in (as obtainable in other countries) health centres in Nigeria to provide the much needed supportive supervision to ensure quality care in health centres to reduce maternal and infant mortality in Nigeria.

REFERENCES

- 211 Adeniyi, J.D, Oyegbite, S.A, Egurijobi, Edungbo, I,D and Kila, A.A
 212 (1986) Primary Health Care in Nigeria: A Study of the Training,
 213 Utilization and competence of Community Health Workers Ibadan,
 214 Unpublished Research Work Submitted to Federal Government of
 215 Nigeria.
- 216 Adoni, T., Lim, S., Melite, S., Blutha, Z.A, Fostad, D. (2005) Cost
 217 Effectiveness Analysis of Strategies for Maternal and Neonatal health in
 218 Developing Countries, British Medical Journal 331:1107.
- 219 Akpola, C.O (2001) Are Primary Health Care Centres Fulfilling their
 220 Role in Primary Health Care?The Road, 4(4) 23.
- 221 Cruickshonk, J.F., Mackery, R.C., Matsieno, K, and Williams, A.M
 222 (1994) Appraisal of Clinical Competence of Registered Nurses in Relation
 223 to their Designated Level in the Western Australian Nursing Career
 224 Structure. International Journal of Nursing Students 31(3) 217-230.
- 225 Ezeuduka, P.O. (1989) Child Health Services at University of Nigeria
 226 Teaching Hospital Enugu: A Case Study Unpublished M.Ed Thesis UNN.
- 227 Ezenduka, P.O (2007) Analysis of Task Performance of Primary
 228 Health Care Workers in Enugu State, Nigeria. Unpublished Ph.D Thesis,
 229 UNN.
- 230 Katz, F.M and Snow, R. (1980) Accessing Health Workers'
 231 Performance.A Manual for Training and Supervision.GeneuQ: WHO
- 232 Ndie, E.C. (2014) The Place of Public Health Nurse in National
 233 Health Policy in Nigeria: A Review. International Research Journal and
 234 Medical Sciences Vol 2(1).
- 235 Parkin, A. (1980) Systems Management London, Edward Arnold
 236 Publishing Ltd.
- 237 Ransome-Kuti, O. (2001) Welcome Address as the Chairman of
 238 NPHCD Governing Board, at the Opening Ceremony of National
 239 Conference of Stake Holders on Primary Health Care at Abuja. The Road
 240 magazine, (4) 6-7.
- 241 Sullivan, M. (2014) Non-Physician Medical Providers, Task-Shifting

242 and Africa. Global Health Nursing and Midwifery GHD online.org access
243 26/3/15.

244 WHO (2004) Making pregnancy Safer: The Critical Role of the
245 skilled Attendance. <http://wholibdoc.who.int/publication/2004/9241591892>.

246 WHO (2008) Task Shifting Global Recommendations and Guideline.
247 GlobalHealthWorkforceAlliance.WHO.int/workforcealliance/knowledge/r
248 esources/taskshifting-guidelineaccessed 2/3/15.