



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Annual Research & Review in Biology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_ARRB_45342
Title of the Manuscript:	Vegetation Composition Related to Environmental Factors along the International Highway-West Alexandria, Egypt
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>Abstract</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Reduce to 200 words maximum – see journal guidelines (originally 256) 2. Methodology explanation needed before results are presented (i.e. 60 stands cluster analysis and Canonical Correspondence analysis etc.) 3. “The Mediterranean chorotype (58.32%) was the most represented.” Most represented of what (life forms?) 4. Remove “was dominated” after 1st mention. <p>Introduction</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Paragraph 1: “Coastal areas in Egypt suffer ...cosystems (El-Sadek and Ayyad 2000). The reference date (2000) is too old to indicate current (2018) situation. Update reference or remove sentence. 6. Paragraph 2: “Its proper utilization ... is known to have enjoyed prosperity during the Graeco-Roman times (Kassas, 1972 and Shaltout, 1983). – what is the value of this sentence? Suggest removal. 7. Paragraph 2 would be better served with: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Indicating the value of this vegetation type currently (2018) • Indicate current (2018) anthropogenic impact • Indicate why its needs conservation (reason for this investigation) 8. Paragraph 3: “Moreover, roadside vegetation is exposed ... composition of plant <u>vegetation</u>(?).” Replace plant with vegetation. 9. Paragraph 3: “Therophytes (67%) cover forms the permanent framework of the desert vegetation during rainy seasons, followed by geophytes (11%), halophytes and helophytes, and are the best indicator of the habitat conditions (Stottele, 1995; Zahran and Willis, 2009).” This sentence is out-of-place in the paragraph – as the paragraph focusses on IMPACT! – remove and relocate to a more appropriate place. 10. Paragraph 4: “The flora and vegetation ... Abd El-Gawad (2017)” - what is the value of this sentence, as none of their results are presented? Suggest removal. Saying who did (without saying WHAT they did) is non-scientific. <p>Materials and Methods</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 11. Section 2.1 - Paragraph 1: “The Mediterranean coastal desert...970 km (Zahran and Willis, 2009)”. Is this value still true for 2018? – can easily be check via Google Earth. 12. Figure 1: reformulate legend as: The study area showing sampled stands. 13. Section 2.2: Indicate how far from roadside margin did the 10x10 m stands begin 14. Section 2.2: Insert Figure 1 after “...coastal highway for sampling vegetation (<u>Figure 1</u>)” 15. Section 2.2 and 2.3: Generally VERY OLD sources used! Update? 16. Section 2.4: see spelling of ter Braak (1988) vs in reference list <p>Results</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 17. Figure 2 is a direct duplication of the text results – remove figure 2: superfluous. 18. Section 3.2 – paragraph 1: “The application of TWINSpan classification ... of four vegetation <u>groups</u> (Table 1...) – Table 1 indicate <u>types</u> NOT groups. 19. Section 3.2: to be written in past tense 20. Section 3.2 Table 3: Duncan's test – not indicated in methodology 21. Section 3.3: “Stands of group A is separated at the upper part of the middle of the DCA diagram. Group B is clear segregated (the right side) along the two axes of DCA. While, Group C is separated the middle part of the DCA diagram. On the other hand, group D is segregated at the lower part of the middle of the DCA diagram.”- this information can easily be observed in Fig. 4. Direct duplication between text and figure 	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>presentation – remove direct duplication.</p> <p>22. Section 3.4: Paragraph 1: “Some other soil variables ...”indicate variables. Also refer to fig 4 here.</p> <p>23. Section 3.4: Paragraph 3: “The correlation between ...ordination diagram ...”Refer to fig 5 here.</p> <p>Discussion</p> <p>24. Remove 1st paragraph – Introduction unnecessary.</p> <p>25. Paragraph 2: “...coastal belt is by far the richest part of Egypt in its floristic composition owing to its relatively high rainfall in the winter season (Zahran and Willis, 2009). Annual plants ...”These two consecutive sentences do not follow naturally upon one another. – revise.</p> <p>26. Paragraph 3: “In association with other relevant studies,Brassicaceae were the major families and also is the most common families in Mediterranean North African Flora...”Indicate possible reasons for the abundance of these families.</p> <p>27. Paragraph 4: “about 56.95% - 56.95% is a very specific number – not about! – remove about.</p> <p>28. Paragraph 5:” The whole country lies within the Saharo-Arabian belt of the Holarctic floristic realm.” – so what are the implications of this classification?</p> <p>29. Paragraph 5: replace “signal” with “indicators”.</p>	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Martin Potgieter</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>University of Limpopo, South Africa</i>